

CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA

PRELIMINARY DETERMINATION OF INELIGIBILITY

For the Carmel Historic Resources Inventory

On September 6, 2023, the Department of Community Planning and Building made a preliminary determination that the property identified below does not constitute an historic resource and is therefore ineligible for the Carmel Inventory of Historic Resources.

Assessor's Parcel Number: 010-262-006

Current Owner: Meg Clovis

Block: H, Lot: L

Street Location: NWC Casanova & 8th Ave

Lot size: 8,000 sf

Original Date of Construction: 1937

The basis for this determination is:

| | The property lacks sufficient age to be considered historic. |
|---|---|
| | The property has substantially lost its historic integrity through alterations, additions, deterioration, changes in the surrounding environment or other causes. |
| ✓ | The property does not relate to historic themes or property types established in the Historic Context Statement for Carmel-by-the-Sea. |
| | The property has no association with important events, people or architecture that are identified in the Historic Context Statement or that represent the historical/cultural evolution of Carmel-by-the-Sea. |
| ✓ | There are other better examples of the builder's work in the city. |

This preliminary determination will be circulated for a 10 calendar day public review period beginning on September 7, 2023, and ending at 5:00 P.M. on September 16, 2023. If no requests for further review are received during this period, the determination shall become final and shall remain valid for a period of 5 years.

KatherineWallace

| DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION | Primary # HRI # |
|--|--|
| PRIMARY RECORD | TrinomialNRHP Status Code |
| Other Listings Reviewer | Date |
| - | ned by recorder) Conrad Imelman House |
| P1. Other Identifier: Conrad Imelman House *P2. Location: ☐ Not for Publication ☒ Unrestricted and (P2b and P2c or P2d. Attach a Location Map as necessary) *b. USGS 7.5' Quad Monterey Date 2012 T ; R c. Address NWC Casanova & 8th Ave. City Carmel by d. UTM: (Give more than one for large and/or linear resources) Z e. Other Locational Data: (e.g., parcel #, directions to resource, APN 010-262-006, Block H, Lots 17 & 19 *P3a. Description: (Describe resource and its major elements. Includ | ; ¼ of ¼ of Sec ; Mount Diablo B.M. the Sea Zip 93921 Zone ; mE/ mN , elevation, etc., as appropriate) |
| Built in 1937, the Conrad Imelman House is located of Casanova Street and 8th Avenue. The house has and complex hipped roof system covered with comoverhang with exposed rafters. A brick chimney is located with stucco. Most of the fenestration is stee windows have louvred shutters. The main level of the street | a "rear-down" configuration with a compound plar position shingles. The eaves have a moderate ocated on the crest of the roof. Exterior walls are el framed, multi-paned windows. Some of the |
| façade. The main entrance with its original arched of and opens into the living room. Three brick steps w Another entrance is located towards the center of the lower level. A third entrance is located near the nor | ith a wrought iron railing lead to this entrance. ne façade and leads to a hallway and staircase to the |
| and opens into the living room. Three brick steps w Another entrance is located towards the center of th | ith a wrought iron railing lead to this entrance. ne façade and leads to a hallway and staircase to the theast corner of the house and has (continued p. 3) le family residence |

*P11. Report Citation: (cite survey report and other sources, or enter "none.") None

| *Attachments: NONE Location Map Sketch Map Continuation Sheet Building, Structure and Object Record | Ł |
|---|---|
| □Archaeological Record □District Record □Linear Feature Record □Milling Station Record □Rock Art Record | |
| □Artifact Record □Photograph Record □Other (List) | |

*P10. Survey Type: (Describe)

Intensive

DPR 523A (1/95) *Required Information

| State of Califor | nia The I | Resources A | Agency |
|-------------------|-----------|-------------|--------|
| DEPARTMENT | OF PARKS | AND RECF | EATION |

Primary # HRI #

BUILDING, STRUCTURE, AND OBJECT RECORD

Page 2 of 6

*NRHP Status Code 6Z

*Resource Name or # (Assigned by recorder) Conrad Imelman House

B1. Historic Name: Conrad Imelman House B2. Common Name: Conrad Imelman House

B3. Original Use: Residence B4. Present Use: Residence

*B5. Architectural Style: Ranch

*B6. Construction History: (Construction date, alteration, and date of alterations) Constructed in 1937 (BP# 216); Add a deck in 1958 (BP# 3294); Extend deck in 1978 (BP# 78-29); Extend deck in 1980 (BP# 80-104); Alter bathroom in 1980 (BP# 80-123); Convert area under deck into storage in 1980 (BP# 80-154); Reroof in 2008 (BP# 08-214R)

*B7. Moved? x□No □Yes □Unknown Date: Original Location:

*B8. Related Features: N/A

B9a. Architect: M.J. Murphy (designer)

*B10. Significance: Theme N/A

Period of Significance 1937

Property Type Building Applicable Criteria N/A

(Discuss importance in terms of historical or architectural context as defined by theme, period, and geographic scope. Address integrity.)

In 1937 German-native Conrad Christie Imelman (1892-1976) and his wife Dorothy (1905-1993) built the house located on the northwest corner of Casanova and 8th Avenue. Imelman was a graduate of the Koester and Window Decorating School in Chicago. He arrived in Carmel in the early 1920s and opened a men's furnishings and sportwear shop on Ocean Avenue. He owned and operated the shop until 1942. Neither Conrad nor Dorothy Imelman is listed as significant people in Carmel's Historic Context Statement.

The Imelmans hired Michael J. Murphy to design and build their house. Murphy was born in 1885 in Minden, Utah. He came to Carmel in 1902 and worked as a painter. Two years later Frank Devendorf hired him to do the building for the Carmel Development Company. Murphy went on to become the most prolific designer-builder in Carmel's history, with as many as 350 structures to his credit. In 1914 Murphy established his own contracting firm, and in 1924 opened M.J. Murphy Inc., which sold building supplies, did rock crushing and concrete work, and operated a lumber mill and cabinet shop located between San Carlos and Mission Streets. Murphy is included as a (continued on pg. 3)

B11. Additional Resource Attributes (List attributes and codes):

*B12. References:

Carmel Context Statement & Historic Preservation Ordinance

Carmel Pine Cone: multiple articles

Building File, Carmel Planning Dept.

National Register Bulletin 15

Polk's City Directories, Harrison Memorial Library

U.S. Census & Voter Registration Records

Conrad Imelman Obit., *Carmel Pine Cone*, 1/6/1977, p. 25

B13. Remarks

*B14. Evaluator: Meg Clovis
*Date of Evaluation: 09/2023

(This space reserved for official comments.)

| | (Sketch Map with | north arrow required.) TAX CODE AR |
|-------|--|---|
| | 4 | SCALE: 1 in.=100 ft. |
| | | 19-6 |
| | CASANOVA | |
| AVE | \$\begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc | 2 4 6 8 10 12 18 16 18 20 |
| | CAMINO | |
| | u 1) 0 | 2 4 6 8 10 12 14 16 8 20 9 |
| | 27585 CARMELO | _ 2409 _ |
| OCEAN | $ \begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$ | $\begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$ |
| | 40 40 40 80 40 80 40 40 | 80 40 40 100 |

DPR 523B (1/95) *Required Information

| State of California The Resources Agency |
|---|
| DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION |

CONTINUATION SHEET

| Primary # | |
|-----------|--|
| HRI# | |
| Trinomial | |
| • | |

Page 3 of 6
*Recorded by Meg Clovis

*Resource Name or # Conrad Imelman House *Date 09/2023

 $oxed{oxed}$ Continuation $oxed{\Box}$ Update

P3a. Description (continued):

brick steps and a wrought iron railing. This entrance opens into a guest room. The rear elevation has a large, slanted bay window that overlooks the back yard. A deck was added to this elevation in 1958, extended in 1978, and extended again in 1980. An area underneath the deck was converted to a storage area in 1980. The lower level of the house originally had a large garage, a storage area, a laundry room, and a maid's room and bathroom. A letter in the building file reveals that by 1947 the basement area had been converted into three bedrooms, two of which were rented. A white lattice fence set on a Carmel stone retaining wall surrounds the perimeter of the property. Other hardscape features include a brick patio and wood entry gate on the front elevation and Carmel stone paths on the rear elevation. The house is located on a double lot and enjoys a large back yard. There are some mature trees and bushes on the formerly landscaped lot.

The house has a handful of characteristics associated with the Ranch style of architecture such as the multi-paned steel windows with shutters, wrought iron railings, stucco exterior walls, and the open eaves with exposed rafters. Other elements such as the large bay window and the small chimney on the roof crest are not associated with the Ranch style. The façade's design, with its three entrances, is an awkward composition and the "rear down" configuration detracts from the horizontal massing that the Ranch style is known for. There are better representatives of the Ranch style in Carmel such as 2960 Santa Lucia Avenue and 25985 Ridgewood Road.

B10. Significance (continued):

significant designer/builder in Carmel's Historic Context Statement. The Conrad Imelman House is not a good representative of Michael J. Murphy's design and construction abilities. At least twenty Murphy buildings are listed on Carmel's Inventory of Historic Resources, all of which illustrate his full range of design expertise, from Craftsman homes to Revival styles.



Figure 1: Front elevation.

DPR 523L (1/95)

| State of California The Resources Agency |
|--|
| DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION |

CONTINUATION SHEET

Trinomial _____

Primary # HRI#

*Resource Name or # Conrad Imelman House *Date 09/2023

Evaluation for Significance

*Recorded by Meg Clovis

Page 4 of 6

Historians use National Register Bulletin 15¹ as a guide when evaluating a property's significance whether on a local, state, or national level. As a first step, to determine whether or not a property is significant, it must be evaluated within its historic context and the City of Carmel's Historic Context Statement² provides this context. The City of Carmel's Historic Preservation Ordinance (Section 17.32.040) reiterates the role of *National Register Bulletin 15* in the evaluation of historic resources. Adopted eligibility criteria is modeled on the California Register's four criteria with the addition of specific qualifications for criterion 3 (Section 17.32.040.D).

The Conrad Imelman House is not eligible for listing in the Carmel Inventory of Historic Resources under **Criterion One (Event)** as no specific event led to the construction of this residence and no important event took place in the residence.

For a property to be listed under **Criterion Two (Important Person**) it must be associated with a person who is considered significant within Carmel's historic context. An individual must have made contributions or played a role that can be justified as significant and the contributions of the individual must be compared to others who were active, prosperous, or influential in the same sphere of interest. Conrad Imelman operated his clothing store on Ocean Avenue for twenty years, however there is no evidence in the historical record that he gained importance within his profession. In addition, he only lived in the house for a short time before he retired, therefore the subject property does not represent his productive life. The Conrad Imelman House is not eligible for listing in the Carmel Inventory of Historic Resources under Criterion Two.



Figure 2: Rear elevation showing deck addition.

¹ National Register Bulletin 15. *How to Apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation.* National Park Service. 1998.

² Historic Context Statement: Carmel-by-the-Sea (Draft). Approved by the City Council December 6, 2022.

*Required Information

State of California -- The Resources Agency DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION

CONTINUATION SHEET

| Primary # | |
|-----------|--|
| HRI# | |
| Trinomial | |

Page 5 of 6
*Recorded by Meg Clovis

*Resource Name or # Conrad Imelman House *Date 09/2023



Figure 3: View of garage, lattice fence and Carmel stone retaining wall.

A property is eligible under **Criterion Three (Design/Construction)** if it, "embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, region or method of construction or represents the work of a master or possesses high artistic values." The Conrad Imelman House does not clearly illustrate enough distinctive characteristics to be considered a good example of the Ranch style and therefore it is not eligible for listing under the first part of Criterion Three. Michael J. Murphy is considered an important designer/builder in Carmel. Bulletin 15 explains that to be considered the work of a master, a "property must express a particular phase in the development of the master's career, an aspect of his or her work, or a particular theme in his or her craft." The Conrad Imelman House does not reflect a phase in Murphy's career, an aspect of his work or a particular theme. The Conrad Imelman House is not eligible for listing under the second part of Criterion Three. Finally, the Conrad Imelman House does not meet the third part of Criterion Three because it does not possess high artistic values and it does not express aesthetic ideals or design concepts.

The California Register's **Fourth Criterion (Information Potential)** is generally reserved for archeological sites. There is no evidence in the historical record that the Conrad Imelman House meets the eligibility requirements for Criterion Four.

Integrity

Integrity is defined as the ability of a property to convey its significance. There are seven aspects of integrity including location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association and to retain integrity, a property must retain several, if not most aspects. If a property does not meet any of the eligibility criteria, then integrity is not a consideration as part of the evaluation for historical significance.

DPR 523L (1/95) *Required Information

| State of California The Resources Agency |
|--|
| DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION |
| CONTINUATION SHEET |

| Primary # | |
|-----------|--|
| HRI# | |
| Trinomial | |
| | |

Page 6 of 6

*Recorded by Meg Clovis

*Resource Name or # Conrad Imelman House

*Date 09/2023

□ Update

Summary

To be eligible for the Carmel Inventory a resource must represent a theme in the Context Statement, retain substantial integrity, be at least 50 years old, and meet at least one of the four criteria for listing in the California Register. The Conrad Imelman House does not represent a theme in the Context Statement, it is over 50 years old, but it does not meet any of the California Register eligibility criteria. Integrity was not assessed as the property does not meet any of the aforementioned criteria. In summary, Bulletin 15, the Carmel Historic Context Statement, the Carmel Historic Preservation Ordinance, and the historical record support the conclusion that the Conrad Imelman House is not eligible for listing in the Carmel Inventory of Historic Resources.



Figure 4: Front gate.

DPR 523L (1/95) *Required Information