



CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA

FOREST AND BEACH COMMISSION

Chair David Refuerzo, Commissioners Karen Ferlito,
Mo Massoudi, Stephanie Locke,
and Al Saroyan

All meetings are held in the City Council Chambers
East Side of Monte Verde Street
Between Ocean and 7th Avenues

REGULAR MEETING

4/13/2017

TOUR 2:30 p.m.

MEETING 3:30 p.m.

CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

TOUR OF INSPECTION Shortly after 2:30 p.m. the Commission will leave the Council chamber for an on-site Tour of Inspection of all properties listed on the agenda (including those on the Consent Agenda). The tour may include projects previously approved by the City and not on this agenda. Prior to the beginning of the tour, the Commission may eliminate one or more on-site visits. The public is welcome to join the Commission on its tour. The Commission will return to the Council chamber at 3:30 p.m. or as soon thereafter as possible.

1. Tour of a completed invasive tree removal site and proposed invasive tree removal site adjacent to the Flanders House at 25800 Hatton Road.

ROLL CALL

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

INTRODUCTION OF PUBLIC WORKS STAFF

Rob Culver – Public Works Superintendent / Acting Public Works Director

Agnes Topp – Environmental Compliance Manager

PUBLIC APPEARANCES Members of the public are entitled to speak on matters of municipal concern not on the agenda during Public Appearances. Each person's comments shall be limited to 3 minutes, or as otherwise established by the Commission. Matters not appearing on Commission's agenda will not receive action at this meeting but may be referred to staff for a future meeting. Persons are not required to give their names, but it is helpful for speakers to state their names so that they may be identified in the minutes of the meeting.

ANNOUNCEMENTS

- A. Announcements from Chair and Commissioners

ORDERS OF BUSINESS Orders of Business are agenda items that require Commission discussion, debate, direction to staff, and/or action.

1. Discuss and ask questions on the Commission responsibilities under the Brown Act with City Attorney Don Freeman.

CONSENT AGENDA Items on the consent agenda are routine in nature and do not require discussion or independent action. Members of the Commission or the public may ask that any items be considered individually for purposes of Commission discussion and/ or for public comment. Unless that is done, one motion may be used to adopt all recommended actions.

2. Approval of the minutes for the 03/9/17 regular meeting.

ORDERS OF BUSINESS Orders of Business are agenda items that require Commission discussion, debate, direction to staff, and/or action.

3. Report from the 2017 Arbor Day event committee.
4. Report on the City of Carmel Tree Inventory data.
5. Semi-annual report on the North Dunes Habitat restoration Project.
6. Receive the City Forester's Report
 - a. February tree data
 - b. Parks activities
 - c. Beach activities
 - d. Tree tagging and replacement report
 - e. Other items of interest to the Commission

FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

ADJOURNMENT

This agenda was posted at City Hall located on Monte Verde Street between Ocean and 7th Avenues, Harrison Memorial Library located on the NE corner of Ocean Avenue and Lincoln Street, and the Carmel-by-the-Sea Post Office located on 5th Avenue between Dolores Street and San Carlos Street, and the City's webpage <http://www.ci.carmel.ca.us/carmel/> on 4/6/2017 in accordance with the applicable legal requirements.



Michael Branson, City Forester

SUPPLEMENTAL MATERIAL RECEIVED AFTER THE POSTING OF THE AGENDA

Any supplemental writings or documents distributed to a majority of the Community Activities and Cultural Commission members regarding any item on this agenda, received after the posting of the agenda will be available for public review in the Public Works Department Office located on the east side of Junipero Avenue between Fourth and Fifth Avenues during normal business hours.

SPECIAL NOTICES TO PUBLIC

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact the City Clerk's Office at 831-620-2007 at least 48 hours prior to the meeting to ensure that reasonable arrangements can be made to provide accessibility to the meeting (28CFR 35.102-35.104 ADA Title II).

CHALLENGING DECISIONS OF CITY ENTITIES The time limit within which to commence any lawsuit or legal challenge to any quasi-adjudicative decision made by the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea is governed by Section 1094.6 of the Code of Civil Procedure, unless a shorter limitation period is specified by any other provision, including without limitation Government Code section 65009 applicable to many land use and zoning decisions, Government Code section 66499.37 applicable to the Subdivision Map Act, and Public Resources Code section 21167 applicable to the California Environmental Quality Act

(CEQA). Under Section 1094.6, any lawsuit or legal challenge to any quasi-adjudicative decision made by the City must be filed no later than the 90th day following the date on which such decision becomes final. Any lawsuit or legal challenge, which is not filed within that 90-day period, will be barred. Government Code section 65009 and 66499.37, and Public Resources Code section 21167, impose shorter limitations periods and requirements, including timely service in addition to filing. If a person wishes to challenge the above actions in court, they may be limited to raising only those issues they or someone else raised at the meeting described in this notice, or in written correspondence delivered to the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea, at or prior to the meeting. In addition, judicial challenge may be limited or barred where the interested party has not sought and exhausted all available administrative remedies.

The next regular meeting is May 11, 2017
Tour of Inspection – as required
3:30 p.m. – Regular Agenda

**CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA
FOREST AND BEACH COMMISSION – MINUTES
REGULAR MEETING
THURSDAY, MARCH 9, 2017**

TOUR OF INSPECTION

Call to order for Tour of inspection:

1. Tour of tree pruning on Forest Road, three southwest of Ocean Avenue.
2. Tour of tree and acacia removals in the North Dunes

CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT: David Refuerzo – Chair
Stephanie Locke – Vice Chair
Karen Ferlito
Mo Massoudi
Al Saroyan

STAFF PRESENT: Mike Branson, City Forester
Matt Feisthamel, Assistant City Forester
Yvette Oblander, Commission Secretary/Admin Coordinator

ROLL CALL

Chair Refuerzo call the meeting to order at 3:35 PM

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Members of the audience participated in the Pledge of Allegiance

INTRODUCTION OF PUBLIC WORKS STAFF

Mike Tope – Coastal Gardener/Maintenance Worker
Kimberly Moscato – Forest Care Worker

Both staff members were unavailable and will be rescheduled for another meeting.

PUBLIC APPEARANCES

Jeff Baron requested to have the latest stormwater pollution data report that the City may have.

ANNOUNCEMENTS

Commissioner Ferlito announced that the Friends of Mission Trail Nature Preserve will be hosting a general clean up day on March 11, 2017, at 9:30 a.m.

ORDERS OF BUSINESS

1. Discuss and ask questions on the Commission responsibilities under the Brown Act with City Attorney Don Freeman.

Mr. Freeman was not available for this meeting, will reschedule at a later time.

CONSENT AGENDA

2. Consideration of the minutes for February 16, 2017, Regular Meeting.

Commissioner Saroyan moved to approve the minutes, seconded by Commissioner Massoudi. The motion passed by the following vote:

AYES: Locke, Massoudi, Refuerzo, Saroyan

NOES:

ABSTAIN: Ferlito

ABSENT:

PUBLIC HEARING

3. Consideration of an application to prune 5 coast live oak trees (15", 16", 10", 9", 6" diameter) on public property located on the west side of Forest Road, three south of Ocean Avenue.

Mr. Branson presented a review of the unauthorized pruning of several oak trees on public property. The pruning resulted in the trees being over thinned causing extra stress to the trees which could lead to the trees dying. He thought the trees would probably survive but recommended implementing C.M.C section 12.28.210 (c) to require a deposit of the value of the trees in a City deposit account for one year. If any tree dies within one year, the value of that tree would be retained from the deposit for reforestation in the city. Staff performed appraisals of the five trees and determined a total value of \$19,320.

The applicant, Mr. Seely, apologized to the City and the Commission and took full responsibility for not following the guidelines and regulations that the City has set forth and addressed questions from the Commission.

Jeff Baron asked if the applicant could just pay a fine as punishment.

Commissioner Ferlito moved that the applicant deposit \$20,000 in a bond or cash into a City deposit account for 5 years and the tree service, Arellano Tree Service, be called, counseled and fined. Seconded by Commissioner Locke.

Following discussion on the motion, Commissioner Massoudi offered a substitute motion to require the deposit of the trees value for one year, suspend the tree service license for 30 days, issue a citation for up to \$250, and to revisit the site in 11 months. Seconded by Commissioner Locke.

After further discussion the substitute motion passed by the following vote:

AYES: Refuerzo, Locke, Massoudi, Ferlito, Saroyan
 NOES:
 ABSTAIN:
 ABSENT:

ORDERS OF BUSINESS

4. Discussion of Arbor Day Event for 2017

Commissioner Ferlito mentioned that Friends of Carmel Forest and Friends of MTNP have had talks about having MeEarth with children involved in this event. Commissioner Massoudi, recommended having a ½ day event with food, picnic and educational events for the kids.

5. Receive the City Foresters Report

a. February tree data

Mr. Branson gave his update on the tree data for the month of February 2017 pointing out several tree removals that were related to the February storm events.

b. Beach activities

The North Dunes restoration is proceeding with acacia clearing.

c. Future agenda items

Assistant City Forester, Matt Feisthamel attended the Municipal Forest Institute training at Lake Arrowood CA. Commissioner Ferlito asked if there is any information on the next years budget.

6. Receive the Public Works Directors Report

No report – Mr. Mullane was not available at this meeting.

FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

Nothing to report at this time

ADJOURNMENT

Chair Refuerzo adjourned the meeting at 5:35 pm



CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA

Forest and Beach Commission Staff Report

April 13, 2017
Orders

TO: Forest and Beach Commissioners
FROM: Mike Branson, City Forester
SUBJECT: Carmel Tree Inventory Report

RECOMMENDATION

Receive the report.

BACKGROUND / SUMMARY

The City of Carmel has performed an annual tree survey since the mid 1970's to collect data on the number and size of the trees that comprise the urban forest. Over the years the data collection has been done by college students working for the City, regular city staff, and most recently by volunteers from the Friends of Carmel Forest. The annual survey is divided into four segments which covers the majority of the city limits over a four year period with the most recent four year period concluding in 2016.

While the data parameters are the same each year, the individuals performing the measurements are constantly changing which results in data anomalies that cannot be clarified. Therefore the data is best used to identify trends in the makeup of the forest rather than focusing on exact numbers. Attachment 1 is a data table of the trends from 1981 to 2016.

The largest overall trend is the decrease in the number and percent of pines within the urban forest as well as the increase in the oak population. Pine numbers have steadily decreased over the past 35 years for a variety of causes: old trees dying of natural causes, drought and insect stress, pitch canker infections, loss of good growing areas, and storm damage. Unfortunately recruitment of new pines is made much more difficult due to young tree mortality due to pitch canker.

FISCAL IMPACT

N/A

PRIOR CITY COUNCIL ACTION

N/A

ATTACHMENTS

1. Carmel Tree Inventory Data Trends 1981 - 2016

CARMEL TREE INVENTORY TRENDS 1981 - 2016

	81 - 84	85 - 88	89 - 92	93 - 96	97 - 00	2001-04	2005-08	2009-12	2013-16	
PUBLIC										
PINE	3958 43%	4026 39%	4043 39%	4230 34%	3872 35%	3096 34%	2692 30%	2513 28%	2311 27%	PINE
OAK	2944 32%	3456 34%	3866 37%	4727 38%	4136 37%	3342 37%	3531 40%	3746 42%	3608 43%	OAK
ACACIA	758 8%	885 9%	725 7%	971 8%	877 8%	579 6%	403 5%	505 6%	513 6%	ACACIA
CYPRESS	463 5%	441 4%	508 5%	526 4%	606 5%	621 7%	625 7%	673 8%	620 7%	CYPRESS
REDWOOD	84 1%	94 1%	86 1%	128 1%	173 2%	171 2%	200 2%	233 3%	233 3%	REDWOOD
OTHER	983 11%	1412 14%	1135 11%	1709 14%	1433 13%	1344 15%	1430 16%	1292 14%	1193 14%	OTHER
TOTAL	9190	10314	10363	12291	11097	9153	8881	8962	8478	TOTAL

	%Δ 84-00	Δ# 84-00	%Δ 84-04	Δ# 84-04	%Δ 84-08	Δ# 04-08	%Δ 81-08	#Δ 81-08	%Δ 08-12	Δ# 08-12	%Δ 81-12	#Δ 81-12	%Δ 12-16	Δ# 12-16	%Δ 81-16	#Δ 81-16	%Δ 81-16
PINE	-2%	-86	-22%	-862	-13%	-404	-32%	-1266	-7%	-179	-37%	-1445	-8%	-202	-42%	-1647	-42%
OAK	40%	1192	14%	398	6%	189	20%	587	6%	215	27%	802	-4%	-138	23%	664	23%
ACACIA	16%	119	-24%	-179	-30%	-176	-47%	-355	25%	102	-33%	-253	2%	8	-32%	-245	-32%
CYPRESS	31%	143	34%	158	1%	4	35%	162	8%	48	45%	210	-8%	-53	34%	157	34%
REDWOOD	106%	89	104%	87	17%	29	138%	116	17%	33	177%	149	0%	0	177%	149	177%
OTHER	46%	450	37%	361	6%	86	45%	447	-10%	-138	31%	309	-8%	-99	21%	210	21%
TOTAL	21%	1907	0%	-37	-3%	-272	-3%	-309	1%	81	-2%	-228	-5%	-484	-8%	-712	-8%



CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA

Forest and Beach Commission Staff Report

April 13, 2017
Orders

TO: Forest and Beach Commissioners
FROM: Mike Branson, City Forester
SUBJECT: Semi-annual North Dunes Habitat Restoration Progress Report

RECOMMENDATION

Receive the report.

BACKGROUND / SUMMARY

A requirement of the recently approved coastal development permit for the habitat restoration in the North Dunes is to provide the Forest and Beach Commission a periodic progress report on the activities and achievements in fulfilling the restoration plan. Joey Canepa, the City's contract biologist for the restoration project has provided her semi-annual report (Attachment 1) to the Commission along with a work calendar and a copy of the permit conditions of approval (Attachments 2 and 3).

FISCAL IMPACT

N/A

PRIOR CITY COUNCIL ACTION

N/A

ATTACHMENTS

1. Canepa Semi-annual Progress Report – March 2017
2. Work Calendar for the North Dunes Project
3. Conditions of Approval



Native Solutions

Joey and Steve Canepa

P.O. Box 215· San Juan Bautista, CA. 95045

Phone (831) 915-7873

joeydorrellcanepa@gmail.com

Landscape contractor's license # 836197

To: Mike Branson, City Forester
City of Carmel-by-the-Sea

From: Joey Dorrell-Canepa, Dune Biologist

Re: **Semi-Annual Progress Report**
Carmel North Dunes Habitat Restoration Project

Date: March 30, 2017

Habitat restoration is now underway at the North Dunes Project in Carmel-by-the-Sea! On September 14, 2016, the Planning Commission of Carmel approved the North Dunes Coastal Development Permit with 11 conditions, following review by the Forest and Beach Commission. Once the appeal period elapsed in October 2016, the California Coastal Commission confirmed that dune restoration work could begin. This semi-annual progress report describes management and restoration activities undertaken for the North Dunes Restoration Project from September 2016 through March 2017. New management recommendations for 2017 are also included.

An annual report will be submitted by September 30, 2017, describing all work completed in YEAR 1 of the project (July 1, 2016-June 30, 2017). Monitoring results and adaptive management recommendations will be included in the annual report for the City of Carmel, the California Coastal Commission, and the California Department of Fish and Wildlife. Onsite restoration work is supervised by Joey Canepa, a local dune biologist (Native Solutions), contracted in February 2015 to provide biological management, implementation, maintenance, and monitoring for the project. Restoration activities follow recommendations in the approved North Dunes Restoration Summary (J. Canepa, July 2016) and the source document, North Dunes and Del Mar Dunes Habitat Restoration Plan (J. Ferreira, April 2009).

In December 2016, habitat restoration activities began in earnest with a mission to recreate a self-sustaining native dune habitat with thriving populations of the special status species, and to provide safe visitor access and enjoyment of the dunes without compromising the health of the dune habitat. The first restoration tasks included the installation of guideline fencing to protect the endangered Tidestrom's lupine, the removal of non-native iceplant, planting of native dune seedlings and invasive weed eradication. The cutting of hazardous dead trees and large stands of non-native acacia was followed by crews and equipment tasked with hauling out the tree debris without disturbing the Environmentally Sensitive Habitat Areas (ESHA). Amazingly, no California legless lizards, a special status species onsite, were observed during tree work or debris removal, probably due to the piling of debris before removal, allowing time for lizards to relocate. However, students with the MEarth Volunteer Program observed legless lizards on several occasions while removing weeds and iceplant during the winter. The legless lizards were a unique and exciting find, and were relocated gently beneath native vegetation by trained staff.

This year's prolific and consistent rainfall was an auspicious beginning for the North Dunes Project. Over 23 inches of rainfall resulted in robust growth and decent survival for the ~925 native plants installed January to March 2017. Perhaps just as important, there were many new seedlings beneath already established native plants, indicating regeneration from seed dispersal—the hallmark of successful restoration, sustainable and resilient habitat. Several species known from only one occurrence onsite increased their numbers including: California beach poppy (*Eschscholzia californica* ssp. *maritima*), common deerweed (*Acmispon glaber*), and Heermann's lotus (*Acmispon heermannii* var. *orbicularis*). The special status species, Tidestrom's lupine (*Lupinus tidestromii*), is thriving and has expanded slightly into adjacent pristine sands. Currently, this federally listed endangered species is in full bloom, exhibiting robust growth and record numbers. The plants are easy to observe near the boardwalk within the Pine Grove, and within the newly cabled area adjacent to the Sand and Sea homes.

Planting

Seedlings were propagated in “cone-tainers”, also known as stubby cells, which maximize vertical root growth and “train” the dune seedlings to seek deeper moisture. Seedlings were tucked into pockets of existing native vegetation clusters to diversify and expand the desired central dune scrub vegetation. The yellow cones were buried next to the seedlings for tallies of

survival (or cause of mortality) between February-April. When seedlings have attained a four inch crown diameter in May/June, percent survival will be assessed and cones removed.

Seedlings propagated in Year One were planted throughout the project area to learn about wind/sun exposure and differing soil conditions, with the long term goal of optimal growth and survival for all the different native species that will be planted. These growth and survival observations take no extra time and inform the overall planting strategy, promoting the success of more extensive plantings in potentially drier years. Specifically, it is important to know if tree shade is reducing native plant survival and seed dispersal. The area restored by the Carmel Garden Club (corner of San Antonio and Ocean Avenue) is ideal for tracking possible vegetation decline due to shade. It can also save much time and effort to know if iceplant debris is a help or hindrance to native seedling survival, since it is laborious and costly to haul out the iceplant. Removal of iceplant debris may be counterproductive to seedling survival in some areas.

The iceplant research in progress in several planting areas includes:

- Does iceplant debris reduce the ground moisture available for seedlings?
- Does iceplant debris provide shade or moisture retention that benefits native seedlings?
- Are insects/invertebrates/ rodents/ dogs attracted to dead iceplant-causing plant damage?
- Does iceplant debris suppress germination of native seedlings compared to adjacent cleared areas (ie.endangered species locations)

Future plantings will include the coastal strand species that colonize pristine, open sands such as yellow and pink sand verbena (*Abronia latifolia*, *Abronia umbellata*), including the wonderful color variations of verbena subspecies that occur onsite. A scientific collection permit was issued by the CA. Department of Fish and Wildlife (CADFW) for propagation of the endangered Tidestrom's lupine (*Lupinus tidestromii*) to promote increase of the species. The goal is to reach 1000 Tidestrom's lupine individuals, in 10 separate locations within the project area, to help provide the resilience needed for this southernmost occurrence of Tidestrom's lupine to survive into the future. The Tidestrom's lupine is an indicator species of pristine, high quality sands and diverse coastal strand habitat and not all of the North Dunes Project area can support the species. Suitable areas will be managed to provide open sands for recruitment of the Tidestrom's lupine, using associated coastal strand and shrub species such as: *Ericameria ericoides* (mock heather) *Leymus mollis* (American dune grass), and *Abronia* species (sand verbena).

The list below and the attached North Dunes Project Work Plan provide further details regarding completed restoration tasks, and future activities that are ongoing or pending.

Completed Carmel North Dunes Restoration Tasks:

Guideline fencing (1000 ft)–two ESHA areas containing Tidestrom’s lupine (one area pending)
 Removal of hazardous/ dead trees (2 days) – Bathroom area, Volleyball court, Pine Grove
 Removal of Acacia and stump treatment (3 days) – Central dune area, Pine Grove
 Removal of one live Cypress, Stumps lowered – Central dune area, Bathroom area
 Haul out – Tree debris, Acacia, Stumps (5 days)
 Dead iceplant removal (30 cu. yards) – MEarth volunteers
 Live iceplant pulled and stacked (berms created to delineate plantings will be removed later)
 Annual Weed eradication (~2200 pounds= ~50 contractor bags) – MEarth volunteers
 Annual Weed eradication (~1000 pounds=~20 bags) – Crews, final count pending (June)
 Weed control (2% Roundup) – dense iceplant in degraded areas, Oxalis and Ehrharta under trees
 Planting native plants (~925) – crews (765 seedlings), MEarth volunteers/students (160 plants)
 CA. legless lizard training- staff/ crews/volunteers – 5 trainings, 5 lizards found/relocated

Pending/ Ongoing Restoration Tasks:

Guideline fencing (500 ft) – Tidestrom’s area at boardwalk (delayed by tree removal)
 Guideline fencing – Delineate pathways, Protect plantings (location to be determined)
 Further removal of Acacia along the boardwalk, Pine Grove fence
 Hedging back the bluff Acacia to the edge of the beach slope and lowering to 2-3 ft in height
 Weed control– ongoing through June 2017 and annually
 Volunteer Participation–Training, Supervision, Stewardship
 Planting – 3000-5000 native seedlings and gallons (Pine Grove, Sand/Sea property line screen)
 Monitoring–Seedling survival (%), Tidestrom’s lupine census (Feb-May), Transects, Years 1-5
 Reporting–Years 1-5, Sept 30 (annual), Jan 31 (CADFW), March 30 (semi-ann. progress report)
 Maintenance–Boardwalk (undercutting of boardwalk near 4th Street entrance)
 Signage–“Restoration in progress”, Special Status Species ID Signs, Design Interpretive Signs
 Subsequent Coastal Development Permit–2017 (tree removal/ replacement, fencing, signage)

Management Recommendations 3/30/2017

Smooth and level sand ruts, remove trash, small debris after tree removal (Pine Grove, entrances)

Fencing to prevent additional pathways in Pine Grove (eastern side) after acacia removal

Immediate cable fencing of Tidestrom's lupine area near boardwalk

Immediate signage stating restoration in progress, no entry

Weed/iceplant removal crews –April (weed populations higher than normal levels due to rainfall)

The subsequent coastal development permit should clearly define and permit:

Public access pathways

Restoration areas to be fenced and/or cabled

Placement and general content of interpretive signage

Live tree removal to enable restoration efforts

Specified areas for tree replacement within tree corridors

Use of Volleyball Courts for public recreation and reconfiguration of courts

Volunteer Groups

Continued assistance from volunteer groups such as the Carmel-by-the-Sea Garden Club, MEarth Education and Stewardship Program, and the Beach Garden Project is critically important to the success of restoration efforts in the North Dunes. These hard-working groups provide much needed invasive weed removal and planting help on par with contracted labor. Even more importantly, the impact of their educational outreach and volunteer stewardship of local parkland reaches far beyond city boundaries.

North Dunes Habitat Restoration Project, Carmel-by-the-Sea, California

Work Plan 2016-2021

Tasks	Deliverables	Schedule	Completion	Pending/ Ongoing
RESTORATION ACTIVITIES COMMENCED 12/2016	Success Criteria			
Restoration Plan/Coastal Development Permit	Restoration Plan/Development Permit			
Prepare/Submit Coastal Development Permit to C.Commission	Coastal Development Permit	Year 1	Jun - Sep 2016	
Update Implementation Schedule & Phasing Maps	Schedule/Maps (Aug 2016 & annually in June)	annually in June		annually in June
Create Tree Removal Schedule/Map (*separate CDPermit*)	Schedule/Map	Year 1		In process/May-June
Approval/ Coordination - City/Fed/State Agencies	Approved CDPermit (CCComm, USFW , CADFW)	Year 1	CCComm (10/2016) CADFW (11/2016, 1/2017)	
Project management	Project management			
Planning/ Adaptive Management	Staff meetings	quarterly	Weekly (Dec 2016-Feb)	Bi-weekly (Mar-Sep 2017)
Annual Report	Annual Report (monitoring, recommendations)	Sept 30 (5 years)		Sept 30 (5 years)
Update Biological Assessments	Progress Report (Annual surveys/ activities)	Sept 30 (5 years)		Sept 30 (5 years)
Coordination with contractors	Contractor/ Labor Crew/Volunteer	as needed	Dec-cabing, Jan-Feb 2017-trees	
Supervision of Labor Crews/ Volunteer projects	Training & Guidelines for working in ESHA	as needed	113 Volunteers, four events 225 Students, five events 24 Member vols, 6 days	<<MEarth Volunteers <<Carmel Garden Club
Boardwalk/ Fencing/ Stabilize Sand	Boardwalk/ Fencing/ Stabilize Sand			
Re-Cable Special Status Species Area (Tidestrom's lupine)	Fencing completed/accurate plant ID signage	Oct-Nov	Dec 2016	ASAP Apr 2017
Cable Phased Treatment Areas	Fencing completed w/do not disturb signage	Years 1-3		Years 1-2
Annual Maintenance: boardwalk, cabling	No hazards or transgression areas	Oct-Nov		Oct-Nov
Stabilize sand with straw plugs/ jute netting as needed.	Moving sand controlled in bare sand areas.	Oct-Nov		Oct-Nov
Weed Control Plan	Weed control Plan			
Stage control efforts by prioritizing weed areas	Phased Weed Control Maps	Sept (5 years+)		Sept 2017 (5 years+)
Weed prescribed areas to increase native spp. diversity/cover	Non-native cover reduced to <10% (5 years)	annually Feb-May	Dec 2016-Mar 2017	Crews thru May/June 2017
Remove annual weeds from site immediately	Increase in native cover & diversity		Nov 2016-Mar 2017 (50 bags/~2200#)	Crews/Vols thru Nov 2017
Remove iceplant piles within 6 mos	Measurable difference in native recruitment	Oct-Nov	Nov 2016-Mar 2017 (30 cu. yd)	Crews/Vols thru Nov 2017
Run Native Seedling Recruitment Trials in cleared areas	Non-native cover reduced to <10% (5 years)	annually Feb-May	^^ MFEarth Volunteers	Monitoring June 2017
Annual Weed Maintenance Program	Plant Establishment			
Plant Establishment	Plant Establishment			
Seed Collection	4000-5000 seedlings/ transplants installed	Jun-Sept	Jun-Sept 2016	Jun-Sept 2017
Propagation	Years 1-3 (1000 per year)	Aug-Sept	Aug-Sept 2016	Aug-Sept 2017
Seed Broadcast	Years 4-5 (500 per year)	Nov-Dec	NOT DONE 2016	Nov-Dec 2017?
Transplant, Plant Propagated Seedlings		Jan-Feb	~925 plants, Jan-Mar 2017	Jan-Feb 2018-2019

Prepared by J. Canepa
Native Solutions, 3/30/2017

North Dunes Habitat Restoration Project, Carmel-by-the-Sea, California
Work Plan 2016-2021

Tasks	Deliverables	Schedule	Completion	Pending/ Ongoing
RESTORATION ACTIVITIES COMMENCED 12/2016	Success Criteria			
Endangered Species Mngmnt				
Permit for Tidestroms Lupine (LUTI) seed collection/ planting	Permit Application & Approval-LUTI (CADFW)	Year One	CAFW (11/2016)	
Fencing	Tidestrom's Fencing Installed	Oct/Nov	Dec 2016	Apr 2017
Identify/Remove Lupine hybrids & Lupinus chamissonis	Reduced # of hybrids within 3 yrs (2020)	Oct/Nov		Apr 2017
Plant Tidestrom's Lupine	300-500 LUTI Seedlings Planted	Jan-Feb		Jan-Feb 2018
Annual Tidestroms Lupine surveys & Monitoring	10 populations of >100 LUTI each by 2021	annually Mar-May	Feb, Mar 2017	Feb, Mar, April 2017
Black legless lizard sitings & informal assessment	Increase in recorded occurrences of BLL	ongoing	Dec-Jan 2016-17	ongoing
Monitoring				
Baseline assessments- Phased treatment areas		Year 1	Dec 2016	Year 1
Assess Establishment of new seedlings, seed dispersal	Annual Report (Sep 30 for 5 years) to:	Years 1-5	Feb - Mar 2017	Years 1-5
Other Impacts (Erosion, critters, trampling)	City of Carmel (Forest & Beach, Planning Comm)	Years 1-5		Ongoing
Survey Tidestrom's lupine	Coastal Commission	Years 1-5	Feb - Mar 2017	Feb, Mar, April 2017-2021
Black legless lizard sitings & informal assessment	USFW, CADFW	Years 1-5	Dec-Mar 2016-17	ongoing
Volunteer Participation				
Carmel by the Sea Garden Club	Labor Crew/Volunteer Guidelines for ESHA			Aug 2017
MeEarth			Nov-Mar 2016-17	
Carmel High School	# of weed bags/ iceplant piles removed			Annual reports 2017-2021
Beach Garden Project	# of volunteers/ hours- annual report			
Interpretive Signage				
Public Education	No Entry & Species ID signs along walkways	Year 1		ASAP- April-May 2017
	Interpretive Panels/ Signs Designed, installed	Year 2		Year 2
	Well-sited, accurate signage			
Other Public Relations media	Newspaper articles	Years 1-5		Years 1-5
Tree Removal				
Assess ESHA encroachment by trees		Year 1	Feb, Mar 2017	Feb, Mar, April 2017
Create phased removal plan / SEPARATE CD PERMIT		Year 1	Year 1	In process/May-June
Hazardous Tree Removal		Years 2-5	Jan-Feb 2017	ongoing
Maintenance		ongoing		ongoing

Prepared by J. Canepa
 Native Solutions, 3/30/2017

Attachment F – Conditions of Approval

Amended and Approved 9/14/16**CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA****DEPARTMENT OF COMMUNITY PLANNING AND BUILDING****CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL**

Application: CDP 16-315 **APN:** 010-321-007, City property
Location: North Dunes of Carmel Beach
Applicant: City of Carmel-by-the-Sea

AUTHORIZATION:

1. This permit authorizes the implementation of the North Dunes and Del mar Dunes Habitat Restoration Plan, dated April 1, 2009, an appendix of the Del Mar / North Dunes Master Plan which is an appendix to the City's certified Local Coastal Plan, and the North Dunes Restoration Summary, dated July 28, 2016.
2. The initial term of this permit is for 5 years (through September 2021). Following the fifth year ~~and before a sixth year event is approved~~ the item shall return to the Planning Commission for discussion on any issue or suggested improvements. The Planning Commission may amend the conditions of approval, or may decide to extend the permit. Should there not be any issues, the permit may be extended for another 5-year period or for some other term acceptable to the Planning Commission.
3. Activities authorized by this CDP include directed access and fencing, non-native plant removal and control, sand stabilization, plant propagation and installation, species management of protected species (Tidestrom's lupine and black legless lizard), tree and stump removal as further specified in Condition #4, signage, monitoring and reporting, and follow-up maintenance.
4. Tree removal components are limited to the following: removal of dead and hazardous trees, and removal or transplanting a limited number (up to 5 over the initial 5-year term of the CDP) live trees that substantially interfere with restoration activities, with a goal being to conform to City Coastal Resources Element Policy P5-25 in terms of maintaining the prescribed tree density. The heritage eucalyptus tree at the southeast corner of the site shall not be removed, nor shall the healthy trees along the Ocean Avenue frontage of the project site. Stump removal for the initial 5-year term of the CDP includes the removal of a limited number of stumps where necessary for restoration goals.
5. Acacia removal includes removal and treatment of acacia shrubs except where such vegetation removal would destabilize the foredunes. In the foredune area, the height of

CDP 16-315 (City of Carmel – North Dunes)
Conditions of Approval
September 14, 2016
Page 2

the acacia shrubs will be reduced substantially (to approximately 2 to 3 feet in height).

SPECIAL CONDITIONS:

6. For each year of the permit, the City shall maintain a list of specific activities carried out under the permit and by June 30th of each year provide a year-end summary of such activities to the Public Works Director and Community Planning and Building Director for distribution to, presentation before, and comment by the Forest and Beach Commission and the Planning Commission.
7. In August or September 2021, prior to the expiration of the initial term of the CDP, the activities authorized under this CDP will be reviewed by the Planning Commission at a duly-noticed public hearing where the CDP will be considered for extension and renewal for an additional 5-year period or some other term acceptable to the Planning Commission. As part of the extension request, an updated biological assessment may be prepared and provided for the Planning Commission to review.
8. Prior to individual tree removal or stump removal activities, the project biologist shall evaluate the potential impact to dunes to ensure that potential impacts to the dunes are either minimal or can be mitigated.
9. In the event of unanticipated issues associated with the project, this permit may be scheduled for reconsideration by the Planning Commission to amend the permit or conditions as necessary.
10. The City shall work with the volleyball community to relocate the volleyball courts in a westerly direction in order to protect the adjacent Tidestrom's lupine.
11. During the course of the 5-year period CDP, the City's biologist shall study and make a recommendation as to whether the Cypress trees along the eastern edge of the current volleyball courts should be removed in order to protect the Tidestrom's lupine. The proposed tree removal would require a subsequent CDP.

City Trees Removed (upper/lower)	MARCH		YTD		2016		MARCH	YTD	2016
	22(20/2)	49(44/5)	143	143	5(2/3)	16(7/9)			
c/ Del Mar bet. Ocean & end									
e & w/ Forest bet. 8th & Mt. View									
n/ Fraser Way bet. Casanova & Camino Real									
s/ 13th bet. Carmelo & San Antonio									
n/ 8th bet. Monte Verde & Casanova									
s/ 1st bet. Dolores & Lincoln									
w/ Casanova bet. Fraser Way & Santa Lucia									
e/ Camino Real bet. 4th & Ocean									
w/ Mission bet. 8th & 9th									
s/ 12th bet. Junipero & Mission									
s/ 5th bet. Santa Rita & Santa Fe									
e/ Camino Del Monte bet. Junipero & 1st									
w/ Monte Verde bet. 2nd & 3rd									
n & c/ Ocean bet. Scenic & Del Mar									
Private Removal Permits (upper/lower)	14(9/11)	32(24/18)	117	117	5(2/4)	12(3/10)	68		
ne Palou & Casanova									
nw Mission & 12									
w/ Junipero bet. 2nd & 3rd									
e/ Dolores bet. 11th & 12th									
s/ 6th bet. Carpenter & Guadalupe									
w/ Junipero bet. 10th & 11th									
w/ Torres bet. 8th & 9th									
w/ Santa Rita bet. 4th & 5th									
e/ Santa Fe bet. 3rd & 4th									
w/ Torres bet. 10th & 11th									
s/ 5th bet. Perry Newberry & city limit									
e/ Junipero bet. 2nd & 3rd									
e/ Mission bet. 5th & 6th									
se San Carlos & 7th									
Construction Permits (remove/prune)	1(1/0)	2(2/0)	24	24	1	1	13		
e/ Torres bet. 3rd & 4th									
Private Pruning Permits		7	24	24					
e/ Santa Rita bet. Ocean & Mt. View									
w/ Lincoln bet. Ocean & 7th									
w/ Santa Fe bet. 1st & 2nd									
City Pruning by contractors									
level I - total tree	0	0	22	22					
level II - hazard/emergency	2	27	5	5					
level III - specific purpose	0	0	0	0					
Trees planted / removed 2013 to date							294 / 567 (51%)		

City Trees Planted (upper/lower)	MARCH		YTD		2016		MARCH	YTD	2016
	5(2/3)	16(7/9)	5(2/3)	16(7/9)	5(2/3)	16(7/9)			
2 - 1 gal. Monterey pines, 3 - 1 gal. oaks									
28" Monterey pine									
6", 10" oaks									
28", 29" Monterey pines									
17" oak; 14" Douglas-fir									
10" acacia									
16" oak									
10", 17", 12" oaks									
14" Monterey pine									
12" Monterey pine									
16" oak									
16" Monterey cypress; 11" Monterey pine									
22" Monterey pine									
8" Holly oak									
9" oak									
30" Monterey pine									
Trees Under Care									
FOCF trees planted									78
City watered									260
City irrigated									22
Construction Permits									
Planted									