



# City of Carmel-by-the-Sea

## COMMUNITY PLANNING AND BUILDING DEPARTMENT

**June 11, 2019**

**TO:** Chair LePage and Planning Commissioners

**FROM:** Marnie R. Waffle, AICP, Senior Planner

**SUBJECT:** Supplemental Materials for DR 19-129 & UP 19-130 (Verizon Wireless)

---

Commissioners,

Please find attached the second round of additional public comment on the Verizon project.

Just for your information, due to the large volume of public comment on this project, the comments have been posted to our website at: <https://ci.carmel.ca.us/post/planning-commission-meetings>. We do not intend to provide hard copies at the meeting.



---

## Proposed Verizon Cell Towers

1 message

---

**Brian Dexheimer** <bsdex@comcast.net>

Tue, Jun 11, 2019 at 2:52 PM

To: mwaffle@ci.carmel.ca.us

Cc: Lorilee <ldexheimer@gmail.com>

Hello Marnie

We are writing in regard to the proposed cell towers that we were made aware of recently and understand are to be discussed as part of the Planning Commission deliberations tomorrow, June 12th. While it is not possible for us be present at the meeting, we did want to express our extreme concern over the placement of these towers in the area.

We understand that Verizon has proposed these towers in order to improve service in the area. As customers of Verizon for several years, we can honestly say that our experience with service at the location we live very near the beach has never been an issue. We have had excellent service and never experienced any gaps in coverage. Therefore adding additional towers seems unnecessary. Not only does it seem unnecessary, but allowing Verizon to install this equipment on existing poles also opens the gateway for any other telecom company to do the same. 5G technology implementation would likely bring even more future requests..... where does this slippery slope end?

Our primary concern is one of health and safety of residents. Research has suggested that microwave emitting equipment like that which is being suggested in the proposal to be placed in our city, has been found to cause several types of health issues when placed in close proximity to people - even when operated below FCC thermal limits. While we don't believe that any of our residents would wish to have this equipment placed near their homes, we are certain that we do not.

In addition, we are concerned over the change in neighborhood aesthetic and character that installing these types of towers may cause. Carmel is a wonderful community as you know, full of natural light, landscape and wildlife. It would seem to be very against the character of the community to have several of these rather unnatural looking figures hulking over the landscape. It would also seem to be a great danger to the natural wildlife in the area. We also understand that previous Carmel ordinances were put in place to dissuade placement of exactly these types of structures in residential areas. We hope and expect that the Planning Commission continues to support this position.

Thanks for your consideration. We ask that our comments be forwarded to the Planning Commissioners in advance of the meeting and that this document also be included in the meeting record.

Sincerely,

Brian and Lorilee Dexheimer  
Scenic 2 SE 12th

June 11, 2019

Carmel-by-the-Sea Planning Commission  
P.O. Box CC  
Carmel-by-the-Sea, CA 93921

Attn: Marnie Waffle, Planner  
mwaffle@ci.carmel.ca.us

Dear Ms. Waffle;

It's my understanding that the Carmel Planning Commission is considering the pro and cons of adding 4G cell towers for use only by Verizon to five utility poles in Carmel-by-the-Sea. I have been a full time resident for over 20 years, and one of the proposed cells will be less than one block away from my home at the SW Corner of San Antonio Ave at 9<sup>th</sup>. Let me express my serious concern about this precedent.

Without full and open sharing of information, I have a concern that Carmel is somehow favoring Verizon 4G service with its approval while some of its competitor's already provide quite satisfactory telephone and Wi-Fi services to my neighborhood, apparently without adding the unsightly cell towers. It's also clear that if these 4G stations are approved, it could make it impossible to remove the utility pole in the future.

Before granting any such approvals, will the planning Commission be opening a public comment period and conducting public hearings? I'm sure many of us who live here in this special community would like to understand any changes that commercial interests are making to our environment. It should be clear there are many sides to this question: Fairness between contending providers, fairness to homeowners, visual considerations, tree trimming changes and possible impairment of property values, health and safety, to name a few.

In a related topic, many of us residents want to eliminate all utility poles in the residential areas of Carmel-by-the-Sea, just as the City has in its downtown commercial area. Quite apart from the issue of visual detriment caused by the overhead services and poles, we need to reduce the increasingly serious and frequent power outages. Many of us suffered days this last winter without power. It isn't good enough to say this is the provider's problem, we are looking to the planners and local government to be pro-active. Tree limbs falling on power lines, or utility poles falling down are key issues; so far, I don't believe there have been any deaths or serious injuries from downed lines, but the possibility is there, and the liabilities are large.

What Carmel urgently needs is a master plan with applicable codes to make the best decisions for all cabled, fiber and wireless infrastructure, including the coming 5G systems, which will require even more cell base stations. Only with such a plan can the city navigate the coming technology changes wisely and take advantage of commercial investment to help enhance and beautify the area. It's possible that other municipalities have already produced such plans.

In an ideal world, the city's roadmap would progress through information gathering to an action plan and a series of guidelines, whereby Carmel reaps the benefits environmentally and financially, of allowing good telecommunications access into our market. If this is done in a coordinated fashion, we should be able to provide better access for all providers and higher service levels. This could be done in parallel with installing fiber optic cable resources and infrastructure underground. Both steps, once implemented, will significantly add to the safety as well as the aesthetic character that we seek for our town.

Although I don't fully understand the technology, the future is moving toward 5G as an inevitable long-term trend to replace 4G. Yet, 4G service and service via fiber optic lines will still be a highly acceptable alternative, particularly for residential use. Open discussion would allow us all to better understand the benefits as well as the limits of 5G; as an example I believe the high frequencies needed can only transmit the final signals around 500 feet or so, thereby requiring far more base stations.

If this access is so critical to Verizon and its competitors, my initial thought was that maybe they need to be put in a position to pay their fair share of the capital costs required to implement desirable aspects of a long term strategic plan, while providing suitable locations for their cells on our utility poles, or street lamps, or other solutions that balance the needs of aesthetics and the new technology.

But as I dug into this issue, I learned that Federal legislation is already on the books that severely limit the ability of municipalities to restrict or impose charges related to 5G cells. I hope that our Planning Commission can reach out to other communities that have similar concerns about the aesthetic impact. By working together, maybe we can convince the carriers as well as our political leadership to adopt some needed technology and code changes to provide 5G service into residential area.

I happened to have a discussion on this topic with my neighbor, Paula Robichaud, whose San Antonio Avenue home is even closer to the Utility Pole near 10<sup>th</sup> Street. She told me "she is of the same mind" and completely endorses my comments on this issue.

Very truly yours,



Frederick M. O'Such  
P.O. Box 1826  
Southwest Corner San Antonio at 9<sup>th</sup>  
Carmel-by-the-Sea, CA 93921



---

## No to Verizon Cell Towers

1 message

---

**Heather Ryan** <hryan@concordegrou.com>  
To: "mwaffle@ci.carmel.ca.us" <mwaffle@ci.carmel.ca.us>

Tue, Jun 11, 2019 at 11:43 AM

Dear Ms. Waffle

Could you please forward this email below to the Planning Commissioners? And please also add this email address to your distribution list for updates?

Thank you very much!  
Heather

Dear Planning Commissioners,

We do not support the City of Carmel allowing Verizon to convert 5 Utility Poles into 4G cell towers in our residential neighborhoods. There is no demonstrated need for these towers, and so no need to grant Verizon this permission.

Also, we understand that if permission is granted to Verizon, then other telecoms will also have to be given permission to do the same. That makes it even more important to deny this permission.

If in the future it is demonstrated that a great need exists for cell towers in residential neighborhoods, and after more research is done regarding the safety of these towers, then it could be considered at that point. There is no need right now to allow this, and so we ask that you do not approve these towers.

Thank you very much,  
Heather Ryan  
David Dube



---

## Stop cell towers

1 message

---

**Nancy Mobley** <nmobleynancy@gmail.com>  
To: "mwaffle@ci.carmel.ca.us" <mwaffle@ci.carmel.ca.us>

Tue, Jun 11, 2019 at 10:03 AM

Dear Marnie Waffle,

I am begging you to Stop Verizon from installing the 5 planned cell towers in Carmel. If you do allow Verizon that privilege, it will open the flood gates for other companies to do the same.

Besides just being ugly and a major detraction form the beauty of Carmel, the reasons for stopping this are sound and proven.

- The towers, located within a few feet of residents' properties, will emit high levels of microwave radiation. (My first husband was a microwave engineer. Died at a very early age of a brain tumor.)
- Research has proven that property values decline up to 20 percent when cell towers are nearby and residents won't be compensated for that devaluation and it must be disclosed when they cell.
- Verizon customers have demonstrated excellent existing 4G calling and data coverage at the 5 proposed sites. Verizon has failed to demonstrate a "Significant" coverage gap – the legal standard.
- Wildlife, cannot read the danger signs on each pole, warning about very high radiation levels. ( It seems very logical to me that because these towers MUST Display High Radiation signs, the idea of placing them in a residential community is NOT a good idea!)
- High-speed municipally-owned fiber optic cable is proven, safer, and more secure for internet service compared to this dangerous technology.

Please forward this email to the Planning Commissioners and enter it into the record for the June 12<sup>th</sup> meeting. Also please place this email on your distributing list which will enable me to receive the updates on meeting date changes.

Very concerned,

Nancy Mobley

11<sup>th</sup> Street 2<sup>nd</sup> House North/East of Mission

Carmel, California 93922

(831) 888-7980

Sent from [Mail](#) for Windows 10



---

## No Cell Phone Towers Please!

1 message

---

**Sonia Brown** <soniamercedesbrown@gmail.com>  
To: mwaffle@ci.carmel.ca.us

Tue, Jun 11, 2019 at 1:17 PM

Dear Mrs. Waffle,

I am very concerned about the possibility of any cell phone towers being erected in my neighborhood as they are dangerous and unnecessary. Please forward my email of opposition to the Planning Commissioners for their June 12th meeting, and please place my email on your distribution list to receive updates on meeting date changes.

Thank you,

Sonia M. Brown

Mission Street & 11th

Carmel-by-the-Sea



---

**Fwd: NO CELL TOWERS!**

1 message

---

**Susan Willey** <[sujwill@aol.com](mailto:sujwill@aol.com)>  
To: [mwaffle@ci.carmel.ca.us](mailto:mwaffle@ci.carmel.ca.us)

Tue, Jun 11, 2019 at 10:03 AM

Forwarding due to incorrect email address; please see below:

-----Original Message-----

From: Susan Willey <[sujwill@aol.com](mailto:sujwill@aol.com)>  
To: [mwaffle@ci.caarmel.ca.us](mailto:mwaffle@ci.caarmel.ca.us)  
Sent: Tue, Jun 11, 2019 9:58 am  
Subject: NO CELL TOWERS!

Greetings!

I am a Carmel Resident, owning two lots at the SE corner of Mission and 11th.

I am 100% opposed to the placement of ANY Cell Towers in Carmel -- let alone the one at Mission and 12th.

Those things are dangerous and would affect the quality of life of humans, pets, and wildlife in our idyllic village.

Please forward this email to the Planning Commission and enter it into the record for the June 12 meeting.

I would also like to be placed on the email list to get updates on this situation.

We need to nip-in-the-bud placement of these and future offending equipment in our neighborhoods.

Thank you!

Susan Johnson Willey  
P.O. Box 3773 Carmel CA 93921  
(831) 624-9334



June 10, 2019

To Whom it May Concern:

Mayor, Planning Commission, Residents

We reside on 13th & NW of San Antonio.  
We are extremely concerned with the placement  
of a cell box nearby on the telephone pole  
directly slightly west of our home. My  
parents are elderly and I am concerned  
about the level of radiation from such a  
device. I am against the location.

William A Daniel

Mildred D Daniel

Cynthia A Daniel