



CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA

Planning Commission Report

November 8, 2017

To: Chair Goodhue and Planning Commissioners

From: Marc Wiener, AICP, Community Planning and Building Director

Submitted by: Marnie R. Waffle, Senior Planner

Subject: Consideration of Design Review (DR 16-477), Coastal Development Permit, Condominium Subdivision and Parking In-lieu Fee Use Permit applications for the construction of a second-story condominium above an existing one-story building located in the Central Commercial (CC) and Downtown Conservation (DC) Overlay Zoning Districts.

Application: DR 16-477/EN 17-067 **APN:** 010-147-003
Location: Dolores Street, 4 NW of 7th Ave
Block: 75 **Lot:** 13
Applicant: David Fink **Property Owner:** Neil Goodhue

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The applicant is proposing to construct a 1,570 square foot residential condominium above an existing 3,824 square foot commercial building on Dolores Street.

RECOMMENDATION

Approve Design Review (DR 16-477), Coastal Development Permit, Condominium Subdivision and Parking In-lieu Fee Use Permit applications subject to the attached findings and conditions.

BACKGROUND AND PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The project site is a 4,000-square foot lot located on Dolores Street, 4 northwest of 7th Avenue, adjacent to the City-owned Piccadilly Park. The lot is developed with a 3,824-square foot one-story stucco building that contains Cantinetta Luca restaurant and Salumeria Luca deli. The applicant is proposing to add a 1,570-square foot second-story residential condominium addition that would increase the building height to approximately 28-feet. The proposed second-story addition would be clad with concrete panel siding and would include a rooftop deck and wood trellis on the front elevation and rooftop deck on the rear elevation. Access to the second story would be provided via an interior staircase located near the front of the building within a portion of the Salumeria Luca deli.

At the October 11, 2017 Planning Commission meeting, the Commission reviewed a 3-D color rendering for the project and continued the project with direction for further design modifications. Specifically, the Commission recommended the following:

- 1) Revise the fenestration on the north elevation to appear less contemporary;
- 2) Lower the trellis on the east elevation;
- 3) Reevaluate the appropriateness of the gray slate tiles on the existing mansard roof and consider retaining the existing barrel tiles;
- 4) Prepare a streetscape scene that includes adjacent buildings and accurately depicts Picadilly Park;
- 5) Reevaluate the color palette and prepare a rendering that accurately depicts the proposed color scheme; and,
- 6) Consider placing the restaurants trash receptacles in the basement of the building.

The applicant submitted revised plans and Staff has scheduled the project for final review.

PROJECT DATA FOR A 4,000-SQUARE FOOT SITE (Central Commercial District):			
Site Considerations	Allowed	Existing	Proposed
Floor Area	5,400 sf (135%)	3,824 sf (133%)	5,394 sf (135%)
Building Coverage	3,200 sf (80%)	3,824 sf (95%)	No Change
Building Height	30'	18'6"	28'
Parking Requirement	1 space	0 spaces	0 spaces*
Setbacks	Minimum Required	Existing	Proposed
Front	0'	0'(ground level)	0' (ground level)/ 8'7" (2 nd story addition)
Rear	0'	0' (ground level)	4' (ground level)/ 51' (2 nd story addition)
Side Yard	0'	0'	0'
*Parking requirement may be satisfied by payment of in-lieu fee (CMC 17.38.030.C)			

STAFF ANALYSIS

The Planning Commission is being asked to consider Design Review (DR 16-477), Coastal Development Permit, Condominium Subdivision and Parking In-lieu Fee Use Permit applications for the construction of a second-story residential condominium above an existing one-story commercial building located in the Central Commercial (CC) and Downtown Conservation (DC) Overlay Zoning Districts. Each aspect of the project was fully analyzed in the September 13th Planning Commission Staff Report (Attachment C). The focus of this report is to consider the design modifications requested by the Planning Commission at the October 11th Planning Commission meeting.

Design Modifications: The applicant has revised the 3-D rendering to include a streetscape scene that includes the adjacent building and accurately depicts Picadilly Park. Two color schemes for the concrete panel siding have been prepared in 3-D for the Commission's consideration (Attachment C). The color options are light beige ('Sahara') and light tan ('Sandstone'). The existing building is proposed to be repainted an off-white color ('Navajo White') with a medium tan color ('Oakwood') for the trim. A concrete sample board will be provided at the meeting as well as paint samples. The proposed paint color scheme would complement either concrete panel option. The existing Carmel stone wainscot and corner column will be retained as well as the existing clay tile mansard roof.

One issue with the previous proposal is that the gray concrete panels were in stark contrast to the color of the lower level and the surrounding buildings. In staff's opinion, either of the proposed new color schemes are a substantial improvement over the original proposal. Both color schemes would be more compatible with the surrounding buildings and provide continuity within the building.

The wood trellis on the front elevation has been lowered and is proposed to be painted a medium tan color ('Oakwood'). The staircase tower on the front elevation has also been lowered and is proposed to be finished with Carmel stone to create architectural continuity between the upper and lower floors. The use of Carmel stone on the front elevation and wood-colored trellis create a rustic appearance that is less contemporary than the previous proposal for concrete panel siding around the staircase and a gray trellis.

North Elevation Fenestration: The fenestration on the north elevation is largely the same as previously proposed. The applicant has widened the vertical northeast window and added two horizontal mullions. Two vertical mullions have also been added to the horizontal window at the northwest corner of the addition. The applicant has indicated that the floor plan layout does not easily lend itself to providing larger windows. Two of the three small, square windows are located in a wine room and the third window is in a laundry room. The vertical window at the northeast corner of the building is located at the dining room and the horizontal window at the northwest corner is located in the living room where wall space is limited. If the Planning Commission does not support the revised window design then staff recommends that it still approve the project, but with a special condition that the applicant return with revised fenestration on the north elevation.

Trash Receptacles: The applicant has submitted an application for an Encroachment Permit to allow the trash receptacles to remain in their current location. A condition of approval has been placed on the project requiring that the Encroachment Permit be obtained prior to final inspection of the project. The Planning Commission is advisory to the City Administrator and/or City Council on Encroachment Permits.

ATTACHMENTS

- Attachment A – Findings for Approval
- Attachment B – Conditions of Approval
- Attachment C – 3-D Project Renderings
- Attachment D – Project Plans