



Centennial Holiday Tree

Analysis of options for the Holiday Tree as we move into
Carmel's 2nd Century

Holiday Tree

- Why is the Forest and Beach looking at options for a Holiday Tree?
 - The F&B thought that it would be an opportune time to look at new/different options for a Holiday tree
 - Given the recent decline of the current redwood holiday tree
 - As part of the Centennial celebration come up with a plan to move forward as Carmel moves into its 2nd Century
 - Ad Hoc Committee was formed to explore the various options and make a recommendation
 - Maggie Eaton, David Refuerzo, Mike Branson and Matt Feisthamel
 - Met 4 times as an Ad Hoc and had discussions with various people within the city
 - Originally came up with six options, but eliminated two of them
 - Big Oak at Devendorf
 - Redwood tree at north end of Devendorf near 6th



Holiday Tree

- **Four Options**

1. Purchase harvested tree or new mature tree(A) and place at the SE corner of Devendorf park in an existing planter
2. Pine Tree SE corner of Devendorf
3. Replace existing tree and use Pine tree in the Ocean median until the new tree grows sufficiently
4. Redwood tree south end of Devendorf on Ocean

Holiday Tree

- **Criteria**
 - **Visibility**
 - From Ocean as coming into village from the east
 - From Carmel Plaza and Devendorf
 - **Size**
 - Tall and visible enough?
 - **Accessibility**
 - For decorating and for tree lighting ceremony
 - **Viability**
 - How long will it last?
 - **Cost**
 - Hard dollar estimates
 - **Timing**
 - Are there any special considerations that need to be taken into account?



Holiday Tree

- **Option Analysis**

1. Harvested tree at the corner at the SE corner of Devendorf Park
 - **Visibility-** almost as good visibility as current tree
 - **Size-** 17-20 foot tree
 - **Accessibility-** Good access for decoration from Ocean and within park
 - **Viability-** new tree every year
 - **Cost-** ~\$2000 for tree and another ~\$2000 for decorating
 - **Timing-** need to order cut tree from local supplier in July
 - Would make best efforts to use sustainable tree farmer and would compost or reuse wood after season
 - **Summary**
 - **PROS:** Eliminates difficulties of trying to preserve a living tree as a holiday tree. Lowest cost due to lower decorating expense. Tree would look very traditional. Ceremony wouldn't change much.
 - **CONS:** Guide wires will need to be used to stabilize the tree from winter winds. **The cost of tree will rise with inflation**

Holiday Tree

● Option Analysis

1. A. New mature tree planted at the corner at the SE corner of Devendorf Park

- **Visibility-** almost as good visibility as current tree
- **Size-** ~10-12 foot tree
- **Accessibility-** Good access for decoration from Ocean and within park
- **Viability-** newly planted mature tree
- **Cost-** ~\$2500-3000 for 48 inch Deodora cedar box tree and another ~\$1000-2000 for decorating for the first few years, then would increase to \$5200
- **Timing-** NA
- **Summary**
 - **PROS:** Tree survival better than in current location due to less concrete, etc; Lower decorating cost early on until tree matures and requires more equipment for decorating; Ceremony wouldn't change much.
 - **CONS:** City's experience is that smaller and younger trees tend to do better than mature trees when planted. Highest upfront cost for mature tree

Harvested or Mature Tree location in planter



Sunset Center
Harvested Tree



Holiday Tree

2. Pine Tree SE corner of Devendorf

- **Visibility** - ok visibility with some pruning from Ocean and good visibility from Devendorf
- **Size** - 45 feet
- **Accessibility** - access for decoration is more difficult due to location
- **Viability**- tree is ~50 years old and appears healthy, but does have pitch canker
- **Cost**- decorating cost probably higher than current(\$5200) due to more difficult access. Some initial cost for pruning(~\$1000)
- **Timing**-NA
- **Summary**
 - **PROS:** Ok visibility from Ocean and good visibility from Devendorf. Ceremony wouldn't change much.
 - **CONS:** Higher possible decorating due to location. While tree is currently healthy, it could change.

Pine SE
corner of
Devendorf



Holiday Tree

3. Replace existing tree and use Pine tree in the Ocean median until the new tree grows sufficiently

- **Visibility-** ok visibility from Ocean for temporary Pine tree. Good visibility from Devendorf; best visibility once tree has grown to 15-20 feet
- **Size-** ~30 feet
- **Accessibility-** good accessibility for decoration from both sides of Ocean
- **Viability-** tree is ~30 years old and could be used for 5-10 years. Tree isn't in great health-pitch canker; Newly planted tree
- **Cost-** Normal decorating cost for Pine tree(\$5200). One time removal of existing tree (~\$2500) and planting of new 48 inch Deodora cedar box tree(~\$2500-3000). Normal decorating cost once it is sufficient enough to decorate.
- **Timing-**NA

Holiday Tree

3. Replace existing tree and use Pine tree in the Ocean median until the new tree grows sufficiently (cont.)

- Summary

- **PROS:** Doesn't change current location of the tree which is in the most visible spot from all entry points. No change needed in the lighting ceremony.
- **CONS:** Most expensive option due to removal, planting and eventual decorating cost. There is some concern that the surrounding concrete and pavement may cramp the tree's ability to thrive. Experience with the current tree has shown that it is susceptible to being damaged by passing trucks and large vehicles. Therefore, the tree will either need to be tall and old enough so that the foliage is above truck height. City's experience is that smaller and younger trees tend to do better than mature trees when planted.



Holiday Tree

3. **A-** Replace existing tree and decorate new tree using center pole until the new tree grows sufficiently
- **Visibility-** reasonably good visibility from Ocean while using pole. Good visibility from Devendorf; best visibility once tree has grown to ~15-20 feet
 - **Size-** ~10-12 foot tree
 - **Accessibility-** good accessibility for decoration from both sides of Ocean
 - **Viability-** newly planted tree
 - **Cost-** String lights from center pole(\$1000). One time removal of existing tree(~\$2500) and planting of new 36-48 inch Deodora cedar box tree(~\$2500-\$3000). Normal decorating cost once it is sufficient enough to decorate.
 - **Timing-**NA

Holiday Tree

3. **A** - Replace existing tree and decorate new tree using center pole until the new tree grows sufficiently(cont)
 - Summary
 - **PROS:** Doesn't change current location of the tree which is in the most visible spot from all entry points. No change needed in the lighting ceremony.
 - **CONS:** Less expensive than option 3, but still have removal, planting and eventual decorating cost. Highest upfront cost for mature tree .There is concern that the surrounding concrete and pavement may cramp the tree's ability to thrive. Pine tree in Ocean median has health concerns. Experience with the current tree has shown that it is susceptible to being damaged by passing trucks and large vehicles. So, the tree will either need to be tall and old enough so that the foliage is above truck height. City's experience is that smaller and younger trees tend to do better than mature trees when planted.

Existing Redwood Holiday Tree



Pine in Median



Holiday Tree Recommended Replacement- Deodora Cedar



Holiday Tree

4. Redwood tree south end of Devendorf on Ocean

- Visibility- reasonable visibility from Ocean and good visibility from Devendorf with some adjacent tree trimming
- Size- ~25 feet
- Accessibility- good accessibility to decorate from Ocean
- Viability- tree is 20-25 years old and appears to be in good health
- Cost - normal decorating cost(\$5200)
- Timing-NA
- Summary
 - PROS: Best viability for living tree options. Ok visibility from Ocean and good visibility from within Devendorf. Ceremony wouldn't change much.
 - CONS: While tree is currently healthy, it could change.



Redwood at
South end on
6th



Holiday Tree

- Updated Next Steps
 - Bring final decision to council in June
 - If approved:
 - Plant official holiday tree 1-2 weeks before normal tree lighting ceremony
 - Plan on having an official holiday tree unveiling ceremony on the day of the normal tree lighting ceremony in December 2016
 - Explain that this is a new holiday tree for the next century
 - Existing redwood would still be used for the first few years while the new tree matures