



**California Public Employees' Retirement System**  
**Actuarial Office**  
 P.O. Box 942709  
 Sacramento, CA 94229-2709  
 TTY: (916) 795-3240  
 (888) 225-7377 phone – (916) 795-2744 fax  
[www.calpers.ca.gov](http://www.calpers.ca.gov)

**August 2017**

**SAFETY PLAN OF THE CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA  
 (CalPERS ID: 7011478504)  
 Annual Valuation Report as of June 30, 2016**

Dear Employer,

As an attachment to this letter, you will find a copy of the June 30, 2016 actuarial valuation report of the pension plan.

Because this plan is in a risk pool, the following valuation report has been separated into two sections:

- Section 1 contains specific information for the plan including the development of the current and projected employer contributions, and
- Section 2 contains the Risk Pool Actuarial Valuation appropriate to the plan as of June 30, 2016.

Section 2 can be found on the CalPERS website at ([www.calpers.ca.gov](http://www.calpers.ca.gov)). From the home page, go to "Forms & Publications" and select "View All". In the search box, enter "Risk Pool Report" and from the results list download the Miscellaneous or Safety Risk Pool Actuarial Valuation Report as appropriate.

Your June 30, 2016 actuarial valuation report contains important actuarial information about your pension plan at CalPERS. Your assigned CalPERS staff actuary, whose signature appears in the Actuarial Certification section on page 1, is available to discuss the report with you after August 31, 2017.

The exhibit below displays the minimum employer contributions, before any cost sharing, for Fiscal Year 2018-19 along with estimates of the required contributions for Fiscal Years 2019-20 and 2020-21. Member contributions other than cost sharing (whether paid by the employer or the employee) are in addition to the results shown below. **The employer contributions in this report do not reflect any cost sharing arrangements you may have with your employees.**

**Required Contribution**

Fiscal Year	Employer Normal Cost Rate	Employer Payment of Unfunded Liability
2018-19	20.556%	\$529,464
<i>Projected Results</i>		
2019-20	21.4%	\$653,000
2020-21	23.2%	\$743,000

The actual investment return for Fiscal Year 2016-17 was not known at the time this report was prepared. The projections above assume the investment return for that year would be 7.375 percent. ***If the actual investment return for Fiscal Year 2016-17 differs from 7.375 percent, the actual contribution requirements for the projected years will differ from those shown above.***

Moreover, the projected results for Fiscal Years 2019-20 and 2020-21 also assume that there are no future plan changes, no further changes in assumptions other than those recently approved, and no liability gains or losses. Such changes can have a significant impact on required contributions. Since they cannot be predicted in advance, the projected employer results shown above are estimates. The actual required employer contributions for Fiscal Year 2019-20 will be provided in next year's report.

For additional details regarding the assumptions and methods used for these projections please refer to the "Projected Employer Contributions" in the "Highlights and Executive Summary" section.

The "Risk Analysis" section of the valuation report also contains estimated employer contributions in future years under a variety of investment return scenarios.

### **Changes since the Prior Year's Valuation**

On December 21, 2016, the CalPERS Board of Administration lowered the discount rate from 7.50 percent to 7.00 percent using a three year phase-in beginning with the June 30, 2016 actuarial valuations. The minimum employer contributions for Fiscal Year 2018-19 determined in this valuation were calculated using a discount rate of 7.375 percent. The projected employer contributions on Page 5 are calculated assuming that the discount rate will be lowered to 7.25 percent next year and to 7.00 percent the following year as adopted by the Board.

The CalPERS Board of Administration adopted a Risk Mitigation Policy which is designed to reduce funding risk over time. This Policy has been temporarily suspended during the period over which the discount rate is being lowered. More details on the Risk Mitigation Policy can be found on our website.

Besides the above noted changes, there may also be changes specific to the plan such as contract amendments and funding changes.

Further descriptions of general changes are included in the "Highlights and Executive Summary" section and in Appendix A, "Statement of Actuarial Data, Methods and Assumptions" of the Section 2 report.

We understand that you might have a number of questions about these results. While we are very interested in discussing these results with your agency, in the interest of allowing us to give every public agency their results, we ask that you wait until after August 31 to contact us with actuarial related questions.

If you have other questions, please call our customer contact center at (888) CalPERS or **(888-225-7377)**.

Sincerely,

SCOTT TERANDO  
Chief Actuary



**ACTUARIAL VALUATION  
as of June 30, 2016**

**for the  
SAFETY PLAN  
of the  
CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA  
(CalPERS ID: 7011478504)**

**REQUIRED CONTRIBUTIONS  
FOR FISCAL YEAR  
July 1, 2018 - June 30, 2019**

# **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

**SECTION 1 – PLAN SPECIFIC INFORMATION**

**SECTION 2 – RISK POOL ACTUARIAL VALUATION INFORMATION**

# Section 1

CALIFORNIA PUBLIC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM

---

**Plan Specific Information  
for the  
SAFETY PLAN  
of the  
CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA**

**(CalPERS ID: 7011478504)  
(Rate Plan: 312)**

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>ACTUARIAL CERTIFICATION</b>	1
<b>HIGHLIGHTS AND EXECUTIVE SUMMARY</b>	
Introduction	3
Purpose of Section 1	3
Required Employer Contribution	4
Plan's Funded Status	5
Projected Employer Contributions	5
Changes Since the Prior Year's Valuation	6
Subsequent Events	6
<b>ASSETS AND LIABILITIES</b>	
Breakdown of Entry Age Normal Accrued Liability	8
Allocation of Plan's Share of Pool's Experience/Assumption Change	8
Development of Plan's Share of Pool's MVA	8
Schedule of Plan's Amortization Bases	9
30-Year Amortization Schedule and Alternatives	10
Employer Contribution History	12
Funding History	12
<b>RISK ANALYSIS</b>	
Analysis of Future Investment Return Scenarios	14
Analysis of Discount Rate Sensitivity	15
Volatility Ratios	16
Hypothetical Termination Liability	17
<b>PARTICIPANT DATA</b>	18
<b>LIST OF CLASS 1 BENEFIT PROVISIONS</b>	18
<b>PLAN'S MAJOR BENEFIT OPTIONS</b>	20

## ACTUARIAL CERTIFICATION

Section 1 of this report is based on the member and financial data contained in our records as of June 30, 2016 which was provided by your agency and the benefit provisions under your contract with CalPERS. Section 2 of this report is based on the member and financial data as of June 30, 2016 provided by employers participating in the Safety Risk Pool to which the plan belongs and benefit provisions under the CalPERS contracts for those agencies.

As set forth in Section 2 of this report, the pool actuary has certified that, in their opinion, the valuation of the risk pool containing your SAFETY PLAN has been performed in accordance with generally accepted actuarial principles consistent with standards of practice prescribed by the Actuarial Standards Board, and that the assumptions and methods are internally consistent and reasonable for the risk pool as of the date of this valuation and as prescribed by the CalPERS Board of Administration according to provisions set forth in the California Public Employees' Retirement Law.

Having relied upon the information set forth in Section 2 of this report and based on the census and benefit provision information for the plan, it is my opinion as the plan actuary that Unfunded Accrued Liability amortization bases as of June 30, 2016 and employer contribution as of July 1, 2018, have been properly and accurately determined in accordance with the principles and standards stated above.

The undersigned is an actuary for CalPERS, a member of both the American Academy of Actuaries and Society of Actuaries and meets the Qualification Standards of the American Academy of Actuaries to render the actuarial opinion contained herein.

BARBARA J. WARE, FSA, MAAA  
Enrolled Actuary  
Senior Pension Actuary, CalPERS  
Plan Actuary

# HIGHLIGHTS AND EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

- **INTRODUCTION**
- **PURPOSE OF SECTION 1**
- **REQUIRED EMPLOYER CONTRIBUTION**
- **PLAN'S FUNDED STATUS**
- **PROJECTED EMPLOYER CONTRIBUTIONS**
- **CHANGES SINCE THE PRIOR YEAR'S VALUATION**
- **SUBSEQUENT EVENTS**



## Introduction

This report presents the results of the June 30, 2016 actuarial valuation of the SAFETY PLAN of the CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA of the California Public Employees' Retirement System (CalPERS). This actuarial valuation sets the required employer contributions for Fiscal Year 2018-19.

## Purpose of Section 1

This Section 1 report for the SAFETY PLAN of the CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA of the California Public Employees' Retirement System (CalPERS) was prepared by the plan actuary in order to:

- Set forth the assets and accrued liabilities of this plan as of June 30, 2016;
- Determine the required employer contribution for this plan for the fiscal year July 1, 2018 through June 30, 2019; and
- Provide actuarial information as of June 30, 2016 to the CalPERS Board of Administration and other interested parties.

The pension funding information presented in this report should not be used in financial reports subject to GASB Statement No. 68 for a Cost Sharing Employer Defined Benefit Pension Plan. A separate accounting valuation report for such purposes is available from CalPERS and details for ordering are available on our website.

The measurements shown in this actuarial valuation may not be applicable for other purposes. The employer should contact their actuary before disseminating any portion of this report for any reason that is not explicitly described above.

Future actuarial measurements may differ significantly from the current measurements presented in this report due to such factors as the following: plan experience differing from that anticipated by the economic or demographic assumptions; changes in economic or demographic assumptions; changes in actuarial policies; and changes in plan provisions or applicable law.

### California Actuarial Advisory Panel Recommendations

This report includes all the basic disclosure elements as described in the *Model Disclosure Elements for Actuarial Valuation Reports* recommended in 2011 by the California Actuarial Advisory Panel (CAAP), with the exception of including the original base amounts of the various components of the unfunded liability in the Schedule of Amortization Bases shown on page 9.

Additionally, this report includes the following "Enhanced Risk Disclosures" also recommended by the CAAP in the Model Disclosure Elements document:

- A "Deterministic Stress Test," projecting future results under different investment income scenarios
- A "Sensitivity Analysis," showing the impact on current valuation results using alternative discount rates of 6.0 percent, 7.0 percent and 8.0 percent.

## Required Employer Contribution

	<b>Fiscal Year</b>	
<b>Required Employer Contribution</b>	<b>2018-19</b>	
<b>Employer Normal Cost Rate</b>	<b>20.556%</b>	
<i>Plus Either</i>		
<b>1) Monthly Employer Dollar UAL Payment</b>	<b>\$</b>	<b>44,122.00</b>
<i>Or</i>		
<b>2) Annual Lump Sum Prepayment Option</b>	<b>\$</b>	<b>510,958</b>
<p><i>The total minimum required employer contribution is the <b>sum</b> of the Plan's Employer Normal Cost Rate (expressed as a percentage of payroll) <b>plus</b> the Employer Unfunded Accrued Liability (UAL) Contribution Amount (billed monthly in dollars).</i></p> <p><i>Only the UAL portion of the employer contribution can be prepaid (<b>which must be received in full no later than July 31</b>). Plan Normal Cost contributions will be made as part of the payroll reporting process. If there is contractual cost sharing or other change, this amount will change.</i></p> <p><i>§ 20572 of the Public Employees' Retirement Law assesses interest at an annual rate of 10 percent if a contracting agency fails to remit the required contributions when due.</i></p>		

	<b>Fiscal Year</b>	<b>Fiscal Year</b>
	<b>2017-18</b>	<b>2018-19</b>
<b>Development of Normal Cost as a Percentage of Payroll<sup>1</sup></b>		
Base Total Normal Cost for Formula	27.603%	28.405%
Surcharge for Class 1 Benefits <sup>2</sup>		
a) FAC 1	1.108%	1.140%
Phase out of Normal Cost Difference <sup>3</sup>	0.000%	0.000%
Plan's Total Normal Cost	28.711%	29.545%
Formula's Expected Employee Contribution Rate	8.988%	8.989%
Employer Normal Cost Rate	19.723%	20.556%
Projected Payroll for the Contribution Fiscal Year	\$ 1,374,348	\$ 1,340,154
<b>Estimated Employer Contributions Based on Projected Payroll</b>		
Plan's Estimated Employer Normal Cost	\$ 271,063	\$ 275,482
Plan's Payment on Amortization Bases <sup>4</sup>	421,292	529,464
% of Projected Payroll (illustrative only)	30.654%	39.508%
Estimated Total Employer Contribution	\$ 692,355	\$ 804,946
% of Projected Payroll (illustrative only)	50.377%	60.064%

<sup>1</sup> The results shown for Fiscal Year 2017-18 reflect the prior year valuation and may not take into account any lump sum payment, side fund payoff, or rate adjustment made after June 30, 2016.

<sup>2</sup> Section 2 of this report contains a list of Class 1 benefits and corresponding surcharges for each benefit.

<sup>3</sup> The normal cost difference is phased out over a five year period. The phase out of normal cost difference is 100 percent for the first year of pooling, and is incrementally reduced by 20 percent of the original normal cost difference for each subsequent year. This is non-zero only for plans that joined a pool within the past 5 years. Most plans joined a pool June 30, 2003, when risk pooling was implemented.

<sup>4</sup> See page 9 for a breakdown of the Amortization Bases.

## Plan's Funded Status

		<b>June 30, 2015</b>		<b>June 30, 2016</b>
1. Present Value of Projected Benefits (PVB)	\$	32,895,810	\$	33,960,454
2. Entry Age Normal Accrued Liability (AL)		30,257,183		31,416,148
3. Plan's Market Value of Assets (MVA)		22,981,298		22,081,844
4. Unfunded Accrued Liability (UAL) [(2) - (3)]		7,275,885		9,334,304
5. Funded Ratio [(3) / (2)]		76.0%		70.3%

This measure of funded status is an assessment of the need for future employer contributions based on the selected actuarial cost method used to fund the plan. The UAL is the present value of future employer contributions for service that has already been earned and is in addition to future normal cost contributions for active members. For a measure of funded status that is appropriate for assessing the sufficiency of plan assets to cover estimated termination liabilities, please see "Hypothetical Termination Liability" in the "Risk Analysis" section.

## Projected Employer Contributions

The table below shows projected employer contributions (before cost sharing) for the next six fiscal years. Projected results reflect the adopted changes to the discount rate described in Appendix A, "Statement of Actuarial Data, Methods and Assumptions" of the Section 2 report. The projections also assume that all actuarial assumptions will be realized and that no further changes to assumptions, contributions, benefits, or funding will occur during the projection period.

Fiscal Year	Required Contribution	Projected Future Employer Contributions (Assumes 7.375% Return for Fiscal Year 2016-17)					
		2018-19	2019-20	2020-21	2021-22	2022-23	2023-24
Normal Cost %	20.556%	21.4%	23.2%	23.2%	23.2%	23.2%	23.2%
UAL Payment	\$529,464	\$653,000	\$743,000	\$856,000	\$954,000	\$1,021,000	\$1,077,000

Changes in the UAL due to actuarial gains or losses as well as changes in actuarial assumptions or methods are amortized using a 5-year ramp up. For more information, please see "Amortization of the Unfunded Actuarial Accrued Liability" under "Actuarial Methods" in Appendix A of Section 2. This method phases in the impact of unanticipated changes in UAL over a 5-year period and attempts to minimize employer cost volatility from year to year. As a result of this methodology, dramatic changes in the required employer contributions in any one year are less likely. However, required contributions can change gradually and significantly over the next five years. In years where there is a large increase in UAL the relatively small amortization payments during the ramp up period could result in a funded ratio that is projected to decrease initially while the contribution impact of the increase in the UAL is phased in.

Due to the adopted changes in the discount rate for the next two valuations in combination with the 5-year phase-in ramp, the increases in the required contributions are expected to continue for seven years from Fiscal Year 2018-19 through Fiscal Year 2024-25.

For projected contributions under alternate investment return scenarios, please see the "Analysis of Future Investment Return Scenarios" in the "Risk Analysis" section.

## Changes since the Prior Year's Valuation

### Benefits

None. This valuation generally reflects plan changes by amendments effective before the date of the report. Please refer to the "Plan's Major Benefit Options" and Appendix B of Section 2 for a summary of the plan provisions used in this valuation.

### Actuarial Methods and Assumptions

On December 21, 2016, the CalPERS Board of Administration lowered the discount rate from 7.50 percent to 7.00 percent using a three year phase-in beginning with the June 30, 2016 actuarial valuations. The minimum employer contributions for Fiscal Year 2018-19 determined in this valuation were calculated using a discount rate of 7.375 percent. The projected employer contributions on Page 5 are calculated assuming that the discount rate will be lowered to 7.25 percent next year and 7.00 percent the following year as adopted by the Board. The decision to reduce the discount rate was primarily based on reduced capital market assumptions provided by external investment consultants and CalPERS investment staff. The specific decision adopted by the Board reflected recommendations from CalPERS staff and additional input from employer and employee stakeholder groups. Based on the investment allocation adopted by the Board and capital market assumptions, the reduced discount rate assumption provides a more realistic assumption for the long term investment return of the fund.

Notwithstanding the Board's decision to phase into a 7.0 percent discount rate, subsequent analysis of the expected investment return of CalPERS assets or changes to the investment allocation may result in a change to this three year discount rate schedule. A comprehensive analysis of all actuarial assumptions and methods including the discount rate will be conducted in 2017.

## Subsequent Events

The contribution requirements determined in this actuarial valuation report are based on demographic and financial information as of June 30, 2016. Changes in the value of assets subsequent to that date are not reflected. Declines in asset values will increase the required contribution, while investment returns above the assumed rate of return will decrease the actuarial cost of the plan.

This actuarial valuation report reflects statutory changes, regulatory changes and CalPERS Board actions through January 2017. Any subsequent changes or actions are not reflected.

## **ASSETS AND LIABILITIES**

- **BREAKDOWN OF ENTRY AGE NORMAL ACCRUED LIABILITY**
- **ALLOCATION OF PLAN'S SHARE OF POOL'S EXPERIENCE/ASSUMPTION CHANGE**
- **DEVELOPMENT OF PLAN'S SHARE OF POOL'S MVA**
- **SCHEDULE OF PLAN'S AMORTIZATION BASES**
- **30-YEAR AMORTIZATION SCHEDULE AND ALTERNATIVES**
- **EMPLOYER CONTRIBUTION HISTORY**
- **FUNDING HISTORY**

## Breakdown of Entry Age Normal Accrued Liability

1. Active Members	\$	5,868,219
2. Transferred Members		2,964,719
3. Terminated Members		126,570
4. Members and Beneficiaries Receiving Payments		<u>22,456,640</u>
5. Total	\$	31,416,148

## Allocation of Plan's Share of Pool's Experience/Assumption Change

It is the policy of CalPERS to ensure equity within the risk pools by allocating the pool's experience gains/losses and assumption changes in a manner that treats each employer equitably and maintains benefit security for the members of the System while minimizing substantial variations in employer contributions. The Pool's experience gains/losses and impact of assumption/method changes is allocated to the plan as follows:

1. Plan's Accrued Liability	\$	31,416,148
2. Projected UAL balance at 6/30/16		7,537,493
3. Pool's Accrued Liability	\$	19,698,755,513
4. Sum of Pool's Individual Plan UAL Balances at 6/30/16		4,661,724,814
5. Pool's 2015/16 Investment & Asset (Gain)/Loss		996,431,536
6. Pool's 2015/16 Other (Gain)/Loss		(166,972,696)
7. Plan's Share of Pool's Asset (Gain)/Loss $[(1)-(2)]/[(3)-(4)] * (5)$		1,582,323
8. Plan's Share of Pool's Other (Gain)/Loss $[(1)]/[(3)] * (6)$		(266,293)
9. Plan's New (Gain)/Loss as of 6/30/2016 $[(7)+(8)]$	\$	1,316,030
10. Increase in Pool's Accrued Liability due to Change in Assumptions		301,461,845
11. Plan's Share of Pool's Change in Assumptions $[(1)]/[(3)] * (10)$	\$	480,780

## Development of the Plan's Share of Pool's Market Value of Assets

1. Plan's Accrued Liability	\$	31,416,148
2. Plan's UAL	\$	9,334,304
3. Plan's Share of Pool's MVA $[(1)-(2)]$	\$	<b>22,081,844</b>

## Schedule of Plan's Side Fund and Other Amortization Bases

There is a two-year lag between the valuation date and the start of the contribution fiscal year.

- The assets, liabilities, and funded status of the plan are measured as of the valuation date: June 30, 2016.
- The employer contribution determined by the valuation is for the fiscal year beginning two years after the valuation date: Fiscal Year 2018-19.

This two-year lag is necessary due to the amount of time needed to extract and test the membership and financial data, and the need to provide public agencies with their employer contribution well in advance of the start of the fiscal year.

The Unfunded Accrued Liability (UAL) is used to determine the employer contribution and therefore must be rolled forward two years from the valuation date to the first day of the fiscal year for which the contribution is being determined. The UAL is rolled forward each year by subtracting the payment on the UAL for the fiscal year and adjusting for interest.

Reason for Base	Date Established	Amortization Period	Balance 6/30/16	Payment 2016-17	Balance 6/30/17	Payment 2017-18	Amounts for Fiscal 2018-19	
							Balance 6/30/18	Scheduled Payment for 2018-19
ASSET (GAIN)/LOSS	06/30/13	27	\$3,590,779	\$98,112	\$3,753,933	\$151,582	\$3,873,713	\$205,154
SHARE OF PRE-2013 POOL UAL	06/30/13	19	\$3,392,119	\$248,431	\$3,384,859	\$255,884	\$3,369,340	\$260,389
NON-ASSET (GAIN)/LOSS	06/30/13	27	\$(40,763)	\$(1,114)	\$(42,615)	\$(1,721)	\$(43,975)	\$(2,329)
NON-ASSET (GAIN)/LOSS	06/30/14	28	\$30,418	\$428	\$32,218	\$881	\$33,681	\$1,341
ASSET (GAIN)/LOSS	06/30/14	28	\$(2,434,031)	\$(34,235)	\$(2,578,066)	\$(70,524)	\$(2,695,120)	\$(107,310)
ASSUMPTION CHANGE	06/30/14	18	\$1,652,033	\$31,467	\$1,741,264	\$64,823	\$1,802,511	\$99,046
ASSET (GAIN)/LOSS	06/30/15	29	\$1,351,988	\$0	\$1,451,697	\$20,442	\$1,537,577	\$41,441
NON-ASSET (GAIN)/LOSS	06/30/15	29	\$(5,050)	\$0	\$(5,422)	\$(76)	\$(5,743)	\$(155)
ASSET (GAIN)/LOSS	06/30/16	30	\$1,582,323	\$0	\$1,699,020	\$0	\$1,824,322	\$25,286
NON-ASSET (GAIN)/LOSS	06/30/16	30	\$(266,293)	\$0	\$(285,932)	\$0	\$(307,019)	\$(4,255)
ASSUMPTION CHANGE	06/30/16	20	\$480,780	\$(9,938)	\$526,535	\$(10,236)	\$575,974	\$10,856
<b>TOTAL</b>			<b>\$9,334,303</b>	<b>\$333,151</b>	<b>\$9,677,491</b>	<b>\$411,055</b>	<b>\$9,965,261</b>	<b>\$529,464</b>

The (gain)/loss bases are the plan's allocated share of the risk pool's (gain)/loss for the fiscal year as disclosed on the previous page. These (gain)/loss bases will be amortized according to Board policy over 30 years with a 5-year ramp-up.

If the total Unfunded Liability is negative (i.e., plan has a surplus), the scheduled payment is \$0, because the minimum required contribution under PEPR must be at least equal to the normal cost.

## 30-Year Amortization Schedule and Alternatives

The amortization schedule on the previous page shows the minimum contributions required according to CalPERS amortization policy. There has been considerable interest from many agencies in paying off these unfunded accrued liabilities sooner and the possible savings in doing so. As a result, we have provided alternate amortization schedules to help analyze the current amortization schedule and illustrate the advantages of accelerating unfunded liability payments.

Shown on the following page are future year amortization payments based on: 1) the current amortization schedule reflecting the individual bases and remaining periods shown on the previous page, and 2) alternate "fresh start" amortization schedules using two sample periods that would both result in interest savings relative to the current amortization schedule. Note that the payments under each alternate scenario increase by 3 percent for each year into the future. **The schedules do not attempt to reflect any experience after June 30, 2016 that may deviate from the actuarial assumptions. Therefore, future amortization payments displayed in the Current Amortization Schedule may not match projected amortization payments shown in connection with Projected Employer Contributions provided elsewhere in this report.**

The Current Amortization Schedule typically contains individual bases that are both positive and negative. Positive bases result from plan changes, assumption changes or plan experience that result in increases to unfunded liability. Negative bases result from plan changes, assumption changes or plan experience that result in decreases to unfunded liability. The combination of positive and negative bases within an amortization schedule can result in unusual or problematic circumstances in future years such as:

- A positive total unfunded liability with a negative total payment,
- A negative total unfunded liability with a positive total payment, or
- Total payments that completely amortize the unfunded liability over a very short period of time

In any year where one of the above scenarios occurs, the actuary will consider corrective action such as replacing the existing unfunded liability bases with a single "fresh start" base and amortizing it over a reasonable period.

The Current Amortization Schedule on the following page may appear to show that, based on the current amortization bases, one of the above scenarios will occur at some point in the future. It is impossible to know today whether such a scenario will in fact arise since there will be additional bases added to the amortization schedule in each future year. Should such a scenario arise in any future year, the actuary will take appropriate action based on guidelines in the CalPERS amortization policy. For purposes of this display, total payments include any negative payments. Therefore, the amount of estimated savings may be understated to the extent that negative payments appear in the current schedule.



## 30-Year Amortization Schedule and Alternatives

Date	<u>Current Amortization Schedule</u>		<u>Alternate Schedules</u>			
	Balance	Payment	20 Year Amortization		15 Year Amortization	
			Balance	Payment	Balance	Payment
6/30/2018	9,965,263	529,464	9,965,263	744,928	9,965,263	906,399
6/30/2019	10,151,560	649,304	9,928,292	767,276	9,760,973	933,591
6/30/2020	10,227,416	722,065	9,865,438	790,294	9,513,440	961,599
6/30/2021	10,233,471	801,128	9,774,096	814,003	9,218,630	990,446
6/30/2022	10,158,046	861,050	9,651,449	838,423	8,872,184	1,020,160
6/30/2023	10,014,965	886,882	9,494,454	863,576	8,469,399	1,050,765
6/30/2024	9,834,565	913,488	9,299,816	889,483	8,005,195	1,082,288
6/30/2025	9,613,290	940,893	9,063,978	916,168	7,474,091	1,114,756
6/30/2026	9,347,298	969,120	8,783,095	943,653	6,870,173	1,148,199
6/30/2027	9,032,441	998,193	8,453,018	971,962	6,187,063	1,182,645
6/30/2028	8,664,237	1,028,139	8,069,262	1,001,121	5,417,879	1,218,124
6/30/2029	8,237,847	1,058,983	7,626,989	1,031,155	4,555,204	1,254,668
6/30/2030	7,748,049	1,090,753	7,120,977	1,062,090	3,591,040	1,292,308
6/30/2031	7,189,209	1,123,476	6,545,591	1,093,952	2,516,765	1,331,077
6/30/2032	6,555,246	1,107,241	5,894,755	1,126,771	1,323,089	1,371,010
6/30/2033	5,891,351	1,089,021	5,161,911	1,160,574		
6/30/2034	5,197,374	1,051,290	4,339,994	1,195,391		
6/30/2035	4,491,313	1,010,316	3,421,381	1,231,253		
6/30/2036	3,775,639	965,936	2,397,860	1,268,190		
6/30/2037	3,053,171	519,284	1,260,579	1,306,236		
6/30/2038	2,740,250	515,255				
6/30/2039	2,408,426	530,713				
6/30/2040	2,036,113	546,634				
6/30/2041	1,619,843	462,960				
6/30/2042	1,259,579	445,578				
6/30/2043	890,756	383,514				
6/30/2044	559,044	271,972				
6/30/2045	318,452	153,391				
6/30/2046	182,991	143,463				
6/30/2047	47,828	49,560				
<b>Totals</b>		<b>21,819,067</b>		<b>20,016,501</b>		<b>16,858,034</b>
<b>Interest Paid</b>		<b>11,853,804</b>		<b>10,051,238</b>		<b>6,892,771</b>
<b>Estimated Savings</b>				<b>1,802,567</b>		<b>4,961,033</b>

\* This schedule does not reflect the impact of adopted discount rate changes that will become effective beyond June 30, 2016. For Projected Employer Contributions, please see Page 5.

## Employer Contribution History

The table below provides a recent history of the required employer contributions for the plan, as determined by the annual actuarial valuation. It does not account for prepayments or benefit changes made during a fiscal year.

<b>Fiscal Year</b>	<b>Employer Normal Cost</b>	<b>Unfunded Liability Payment (\$)</b>
2016 - 17	19.536%	\$343,089
2017 - 18	19.723%	\$421,292
2018 - 19	20.556%	\$529,464

## Funding History

The funding history below shows the plan's actuarial accrued liability, share of the pool's market value of assets, share of the pool's unfunded liability, funded ratio, and annual covered payroll.

<b>Valuation Date</b>	<b>Accrued Liability (AL)</b>	<b>Share of Pool's Market Value of Assets (MVA)</b>	<b>Plan's Share of Pool's Unfunded Liability</b>	<b>Funded Ratio</b>	<b>Annual Covered Payroll</b>
06/30/2011	\$ 25,228,152	\$ 17,259,620	\$ 7,968,532	68.4%	\$ 1,948,133
06/30/2012	25,745,651	16,495,902	9,249,749	64.1%	1,418,304
06/30/2013	27,005,504	20,935,671	6,069,833	77.5%	1,408,474
06/30/2014	29,636,127	23,901,796	5,734,331	80.7%	1,370,025
06/30/2015	30,257,183	22,981,298	7,275,885	76.0%	1,257,723
06/30/2016	31,416,148	22,081,844	9,334,304	70.3%	1,226,431

## **RISK ANALYSIS**

- **ANALYSIS OF FUTURE INVESTMENT RETURN SCENARIOS**
- **ANALYSIS OF DISCOUNT RATE SENSITIVITY**
- **VOLATILITY RATIOS**
- **HYPOTHETICAL TERMINATION LIABILITY**

## Analysis of Future Investment Return Scenarios

Analysis was performed to determine the effects of various future investment returns on required employer contributions. The projections below provide a range of results based on five investment return scenarios assumed to occur during the next four fiscal years (2016-17, 2017-18, 2018-19 and 2019-20). The projections also assume that all other actuarial assumptions will be realized and that no further changes to assumptions, contributions, benefits, or funding will occur.

Each of the five investment return scenarios assumes a return of 7.375 percent for fiscal year 2016-17. For fiscal years 2017-18, 2018-19, and 2019-20 each scenario assumes an alternate fixed annual return. The fixed return assumptions for the five scenarios are -3.0 percent, 3.0 percent, 7.0 percent (7.25 percent for 2017-18), 11.0 percent and 17.0 percent.

Alternate investment returns were chosen based on stochastic analysis of possible future investment returns over the four year period ending June 30, 2020. Using the expected returns and volatility of the asset classes in which the funds are invested, we produced ten thousand stochastic outcomes for this period. We then selected annual returns that approximate the 5<sup>th</sup>, 25<sup>th</sup>, 50<sup>th</sup>, 75<sup>th</sup>, and 95<sup>th</sup> percentiles for these outcomes. For example, of all of the 4-year outcomes generated in the stochastic analysis, approximately 25 percent of them had an average annual return of 3.0 percent or less.

Required contributions outside of this range are also possible. In particular, while it is unlikely that investment returns will average less than -3.0 percent or greater than 17.0 percent over this four year period, the possibility of a single investment return less than -3.0 percent or greater than 17.0 percent in any given year is much greater.

Assumed Annual Return From 2017-18 through 2019-20	Projected Employer Contributions			
	2019-20	2020-21	2021-22	2022-23
<b>(3.0%)</b>				
Normal Cost	21.4%	23.2%	23.2%	23.2%
UAL Contribution	\$653,000	\$779,000	\$963,000	\$1,168,000
<b>3.0%</b>				
Normal Cost	21.4%	23.2%	23.2%	23.2%
UAL Contribution	\$653,000	\$758,000	\$901,000	\$1,044,000
<b>Assumed Discount Rate</b>				
Normal Cost	21.4%	23.2%	23.2%	23.2%
UAL Contribution	\$653,000	\$743,000	\$856,000	\$954,000
<b>11.0%</b>				
Normal Cost	21.4%	23.2%	23.6%	24.1%
UAL Contribution	\$653,000	\$730,000	\$814,000	\$868,000
<b>17.0%</b>				
Normal Cost	21.4%	23.2%	24.5%	25.8%
UAL Contribution	\$653,000	\$709,000	\$747,000	\$732,000

Given the temporary suspension of the Risk Mitigation Policy during the period over which the discount rate assumption is being phased down to 7.0 percent, the projections above were performed without reflection of any possible impact of this Policy for Fiscal Years 2019-20 and 2020-21.

## Analysis of Discount Rate Sensitivity

Shown below are various valuation results as of June 30, 2016 assuming alternate discount rates. Results are shown using the current discount rate of 7.375 percent as well as alternate discount rates of 6.0 percent, 7.0 percent, and 8.0 percent. The alternate rate of 7.0 percent was selected since the Board has adopted this rate as the final discount rate at the end of the three year phase-in of the reduction in this assumption. The rates of 6.0 percent and 8.0 percent were selected since they illustrate the impact of a 1 percent increase or decrease to the 7.0 percent assumption. This analysis shows the potential plan impacts if the PERF were to realize investment returns of 6.0 percent, 7.0 percent, or 8.0 percent over the long-term.

This type of analysis gives the reader a sense of the long-term risk to required contributions. For a measure of funded status that is appropriate for assessing the sufficiency of plan assets to cover estimated termination liabilities, please see "Hypothetical Termination Liability" in the "Risk Analysis" section.

<b>Sensitivity Analysis</b>				
<b>As of June 30, 2016</b>	<b>Plan's Total Normal Cost</b>	<b>Accrued Liability</b>	<b>Unfunded Accrued Liability</b>	<b>Funded Status</b>
7.375% (current discount rate)	29.545%	\$31,416,148	\$9,334,304	70.3%
6.0%	40.743%	\$37,064,569	\$14,982,725	59.6%
7.0%	32.185%	\$32,808,906	\$10,727,062	67.3%
8.0%	25.703%	\$29,303,146	\$7,221,302	75.4%

## Volatility Ratios

Actuarial calculations are based on a number of assumptions about long-term demographic and economic behavior. Unless these assumptions (terminations, deaths, disabilities, retirements, salary growth, and investment return) are exactly realized each year, there will be differences on a year-to-year basis. The year-to-year differences between actual experience and the assumptions are called actuarial gains and losses and serve to lower or raise required employer contributions from one year to the next. Therefore, employer contributions will inevitably fluctuate, especially due to the ups and downs of investment returns.

### Asset Volatility Ratio (AVR)

Plans that have higher asset-to-payroll ratios experience more volatile employer contributions (as a percentage of payroll) due to investment return. For example, a plan with an asset-to-payroll ratio of 8 may experience twice the contribution volatility due to investment return volatility, than a plan with an asset-to-payroll ratio of 4. Shown below is the asset volatility ratio, a measure of the plan's current contribution volatility. It should be noted that this ratio is a measure of the current situation. It increases over time but generally tends to stabilize as the plan matures.

### Liability Volatility Ratio (LVR)

Plans that have higher liability-to-payroll ratios experience more volatile employer contributions (as a percentage of payroll) due to investment return and changes in liability. For example, a plan with a liability-to-payroll ratio of 8 is expected to have twice the contribution volatility of a plan with a liability-to-payroll ratio of 4. The liability volatility ratio is also shown in the table below. It should be noted that this ratio indicates a longer-term potential for contribution volatility. The asset volatility ratio, described above, will tend to move closer to the liability volatility ratio as the plan matures. Since the liability volatility ratio is a long-term measure, it is shown below at the current discount rate (7.375 percent) as well as the discount rate the Board has adopted to determine the contribution requirement in the June 30, 2018 actuarial valuation (7.00 percent).

<b>Rate Volatility</b>	<b>As of June 30, 2016</b>	
1. Market Value of Assets	\$	22,081,844
2. Payroll		1,226,431
3. Asset Volatility Ratio (AVR) [(1) / (2)]		18.0
4. Accrued Liability	\$	31,416,148
5. Liability Volatility Ratio (LVR) [(4) / (2)]		25.6
6. Accrued Liability (7.00% discount rate)		32,808,906
7. Projected Liability Volatility Ratio [(6) / (2)]		26.8

## Hypothetical Termination Liability

The hypothetical termination liability is an estimate of the financial position of the plan had the contract with CalPERS been terminated as of June 30, 2016. The plan liability on a termination basis is calculated differently compared to the plan's ongoing funding liability. For the hypothetical termination liability calculation, both compensation and service are frozen as of the valuation date and no future pay increases or service accruals are assumed. This measure of funded status is not appropriate for assessing the need for future employer contributions in the case of an ongoing plan, that is, for an employer that continues to provide CalPERS retirement benefits to active employees.

A more conservative investment policy and asset allocation strategy was adopted by the CalPERS Board for the Terminated Agency Pool. The Terminated Agency Pool has limited funding sources since no future employer contributions will be made. Therefore, expected benefit payments are secured by risk-free assets and benefit security for members is increased while funding risk is limited. However, this asset allocation has a lower expected rate of return than the PERF and consequently, a lower discount rate is assumed. The lower discount rate for the Terminated Agency Pool results in higher liabilities for terminated plans.

The effective termination discount rate will depend on actual market rates of return for risk-free securities on the date of termination. As market discount rates are variable, the table below shows a range for the hypothetical termination liability based on the lowest and highest interest rates observed during an approximate 2-year period centered around the valuation date.

<b>Market Value of Assets (MVA)</b>	<b>Hypothetical Termination Liability<sup>1,2</sup> @ 1.75%</b>	<b>Funded Status</b>	<b>Unfunded Termination Liability @ 1.75%</b>	<b>Hypothetical Termination Liability<sup>1,2</sup> @ 3.00%</b>	<b>Funded Status</b>	<b>Unfunded Termination Liability @ 3.00%</b>
\$22,081,844	\$61,446,692	35.9%	\$39,364,848	\$53,562,854	41.2%	\$31,481,010

<sup>1</sup> The hypothetical liabilities calculated above include a 7 percent mortality contingency load in accordance with Board policy. Other actuarial assumptions can be found in Appendix A.

<sup>2</sup> The current discount rate assumption used for termination valuations is a weighted average of the 10-year and 30-year U.S. Treasury yields where the weights are based on matching asset and liability durations as of the termination date. The discount rates used in the table are based on 20-year Treasury bonds, rounded to the nearest quarter percentage point, which is a good proxy for most plans. The 20-year Treasury yield was 1.75 percent on June 30, 2016, and was 2.75 percent on January 31, 2017.

In order to terminate the plan, you must first contact our Retirement Services Contract Unit to initiate a Resolution of Intent to terminate. The completed Resolution will allow the plan actuary to give you a preliminary termination valuation with a more up-to-date estimate of the plan liabilities. CalPERS advises you to consult with the plan actuary before beginning this process.

## Participant Data

The table below shows a summary of your plan's member data upon which this valuation is based:

	<b>June 30, 2015</b>	<b>June 30, 2016</b>
Reported Payroll	\$ 1,257,723	\$ 1,226,431
Projected Payroll for Contribution Purposes	\$ 1,374,348	\$ 1,340,154
Number of Members		
Active	12	11
Transferred	20	20
Separated	9	9
Retired	49	49

## List of Class 1 Benefit Provisions

This plan has the additional Class 1 Benefit Provisions:

- One Year Final Compensation (FAC 1)



## **PLAN'S MAJOR BENEFIT OPTIONS**

**SECTION 1 – PLAN SPECIFIC INFORMATION FOR THE SAFETY PLAN OF THE CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA**

## Plan’s Major Benefit Options

Shown below is a summary of the major optional benefits for which your agency has contracted. A description of principal standard and optional plan provisions is in Appendix B within Section 2 of this report.

Benefit Provision	Contract package			
	Active Police	Active Fire	Receiving Fire	Receiving Police
Benefit Formula	3.0% @ 50	3.0% @ 50		
Social Security Coverage	No	No		
Full/Modified	Full	Full		
Employee Contribution Rate	9.00%	9.00%		
Final Average Compensation Period	One Year	One Year		
Sick Leave Credit	Yes	Yes		
Non-Industrial Disability	Standard	Standard		
Industrial Disability	Yes	Yes		
Pre-Retirement Death Benefits				
Optional Settlement 2W	Yes	Yes		
1959 Survivor Benefit Level	level 4	level 4		
Special	Yes	Yes		
Alternate (firefighters)	No	No	No	No
Post-Retirement Death Benefits				
Lump Sum	\$500	\$500	\$500	\$500
Survivor Allowance (PRSA)	No	No	No	No
COLA	2%	2%	2%	2%

# Section 2

CALIFORNIA PUBLIC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM

---

**Section 2 may be found on the CalPERS website  
([www.calpers.ca.gov](http://www.calpers.ca.gov)) in the Forms and  
Publications section**