

**CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA
PLANNING COMMISSION – MINUTES
JUNE 13, 2012**

I. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Commission Members: Dallas, Goodhue, LePage, Reimers
A BSENT: Commission Members: Paterson

STAFF PRESENT: Sean Conroy, Planning & Building Services Manager
Marc Wiener, Associate Planner
Leslie Fenton, Administrative Coordinator

II. TOUR OF INSPECTION

The Planning Commission toured the following sites: SW Scenic & Santa Lucia, Cronin, Casanova 5SW LLC, Elliston, Devendorf Park, Carmel Plaza and the Tuck Box.

III. ROLL CALL

IV. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Members of the audience joined Commission members in the pledge of allegiance.

V. ANNOUNCEMENTS/EXTRAORDINARY BUSINESS

Sean Conroy, Planning & Building Services Manager announced that the City Council had upheld the Planning Commission's decision on the Torres & 5th project and the Del Mar project was moving forward.

Chair Reimers announced that a workshop could be held at the end of June if agreement could be made on a date. She would also like a workshop on the demolition process.

VI. APPEARANCES

None

VII. CONSENT AGENDA

1. Consideration of minutes from May 9, 2012, Regular Meeting. (Continued to July Regular Meeting).
2. Receive a report on Track 1 Design Review approvals for Jan-May 2012.

3. DS 11-89
Michael & Anna Szabados
W/s Monte Verde 4 N 13th
Block 134, Lot(s) 15 & 17
- Consideration of a Plan Revision to an approved Design Study for a residence located in the Single Family Residential (R-1) District.

Item moved to later in the meeting.

4. DS 12-42
Buildwell Construction
26026 Ridgewood Road
Block 2W, Lot(s) 16
- Consideration of the re-issuance of Design Study, Demolition and Coastal Development Permit applications for the demolition of an existing residence and the construction of a new residence located in the Single Family Residential (R-1) District.

Commissioner DALLAS moved **to approve items #2 and #4 of the Consent Agenda**, seconded by LEPAGE and **carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: Goodhue, LePage, Dallas, Reimers
NOES: None
ABSENT: Paterson
ABSTAIN: None

VIII. CONSENT AGENDA (PULLED ITEMS)

None

IX. PUBLIC HEARINGS

1. MP 12-1
City of Carmel-by-the-Sea
SW Scenic & Santa Lucia
- Consideration of a request to reconsider the planning Commission's decision to approve Design Review and Coastal Development Permit applications for the construction of a public restroom located in the Park (P-2), Archaeological Significance Overlay (AS) and Beach and Riparian Overlay (BR) Districts.

Sean Conroy, Planning & Building Services Manager, presented the staff report. Chair Reimers opened the public hearing at 4:14 p.m. Rob Carver and J.D. Johnson appeared before the Commission. There being no other appearances, the public hearing was closed at 4:20 p.m.

Commissioner LEPAGE moved **to accept the concept as presented with staff's Findings and Special Conditions and to have staff work with architect to eliminate fence, plant landscaping to prohibit access to the roof, move structure back as far as possible while maintaining design.**

Motion failed due to lack of a second.

Commissioner DALLAS moved **to accept the concept as presented with staff's Findings and Special Conditions and to have staff work with architect to eliminate fence, plant landscaping to prohibit access to the roof, move structure back a minimum of 4 feet and present a landscape design to the Planning Commission**, seconded by LEPAGE and **carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: LePage, Dallas, Reimers
NOES: Goodhue
ABSENT: Paterson
ABSTAIN: None

- | | |
|------------------------------|---|
| 2. DR 12-9 | Consideration of a Design Review application for |
| Macerich – Carmel Plaza | exterior alterations to the Carmel Plaza located in |
| Ocean bt. Junipero & Mission | the Central Commercial (CC) District. (Kate Spade) |
| Block 78, Lot(s) All | |

Marc Wiener, Associate Planner, presented the staff report. Chair Reimers opened the public hearing at 4:45 p.m. A representative from Kate Spade and Barbara Livingston appeared before the Commission. There being no other appearances, the public hearing was closed at 4:52 p.m.

Commissioner LEPAGE moved **to approve the application with staff's Special Conditions and to work with staff on muting the color of the entrance door and to bring the color back to the Commission for approval**, seconded by DALLAS and **carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: Goodhue, LePage, Dallas, Reimers
NOES: None
ABSENT: Paterson
ABSTAIN: None

- | | |
|----------------------------|--|
| 3. DR 12-14 | Consideration of recommendations to the City |
| John Mandurrago | Council regarding the placement of a 9/11 |
| NW corner Junipero & Ocean | memorial at Devendorf Park. |

Marc Wiener, Associate Planner, presented the staff report. Chair Reimers opened the public hearing at 5:06 p.m. John Mandurrago, CarriAnn, Barbara Livingston and Monte Miller appeared before the Commission. There being no other appearances, the public hearing was closed at 5:17 p.m.

Commissioner LEPAGE moved **to continue the application with recommendations and guidance given by Commission, possibly a granite stone as background and a discreet plaque with discreet lettering**, seconded by GOODHUE and **carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: Goodhue, LePage, Dallas, Reimers
NOES: None
ABSENT: Paterson
ABSTAIN: None

4. DS 12-26 Consideration of a Design Study application for the alteration of an existing residence located in the Single Family Residential (R-1) District.
Bette Ellison
W/s Casanova 9 N Ocean
Block FF, Lot(s) 25

Marc Wiener, Associate Planner, presented the staff report. Chair Reimers opened the public hearing at 5:43 p.m. Paul Walchli, Barbara Livingston and Bette Ellison appeared before the Commission. There being no other appearances, the public hearing was closed at 5:53 p.m.

Commissioner LEPAGE moved **to approve the application with staff's Special Conditions #2, #3 and #4; change to Special Condition #1 – The applicant is permitted to construct a new deck to match the size and location of the previous deck at the rear of the residence (274 sq. ft.). No other decking is approved at the rear of the residence. Applicant shall work with staff to re-configure deck and relocate stairs to south side and extend no more than 6' from west portion, return to south-west corner of family room; and addition of Special Condition #5 – provide at minimum a survey of property line on east side**, seconded by GOODHUE and **carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: Goodhue, LePage, Dallas, Reimers
NOES: None
ABSENT: Paterson
ABSTAIN: None

At this point the Commission returned to item #3 under the Consent Agenda.

3. DS 11-89 Consideration of a Plan Revision to an approved Design Study for a residence located in the Single Family Residential (R-1) District.
Michael & Anna Szabados
W/s Monte Verde 4 N 13th
Block 134, Lot(s) 15 & 17

Commissioner Goodhue re-cused himself from the discussion.

Marc Wiener, Associate Planner, presented the staff report. Chair Reimers opened the public hearing at 6:16 p.m. Claudio Ortiz appeared before the Commission. There being no other appearances, the public hearing was closed at 6:30 p.m.

Commissioner LEPAGE moved **to approve application as submitted.**

Motion failed due to lack of a second.

Commissioner DALLAS moved **to deny the application**, seconded by REIMERS and **carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: Dallas, Reimers
NOES: LePage
ABSENT: Paterson, Goodhue
ABSTAIN: None

- | | |
|--|---|
| 5. UP 12-3 Jody LeTowt Dolores 3 NE 7 th Block 76, Lot(s) 18 | Consideration of a Use Permit application authorizing a wine shop with an ancillary use of an art gallery at a site located in the Central Commercial (CC) District. (Franscioni wines) |
|--|---|

Commissioner Reimers re-cused herself from the discussion but would be voting on the item due to the need for 4 votes, per government code.

Marc Wiener, Associate Planner, presented the staff report. Chair Reimers opened the public hearing at 6:36 p.m. Ray Franscioni appeared before the Commission. There being no other appearances, the public hearing was closed at 6:40 p.m.

Commissioner DALLAS moved **to approve the application with staff's Special Conditions and Findings, wine in kiosk must be Franscioni brands**, seconded by LEPAGE and **carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: Goodhue, LePage, Dallas, Reimers
NOES: None
ABSENT: Paterson
ABSTAIN: None

- | | |
|---|---|
| 6. DS 12-43 Kevin Cronin SW Mission & 11 th Block 130, Lot(s) 1 | Consideration of Design Study, Demolition Permit and Coastal Development Permit applications for the construction of a new residence located in the Single Family Residential (R-1) District. |
|---|---|

Commissioner Dallas re-cused himself from the discussion.

Marc Wiener, Associate Planner, presented the staff report. Chair Reimers opened the public hearing at 6:45 p.m. Alan Kanter appeared before the Commission. There being no other appearances, the public hearing was closed at 6:48 p.m.

Commissioner LEPAGE moved **to approve the application with staff's Special Conditions and addition of Special Condition #3 – exploratory root digging shall be done prior to submittal of building permit application**, seconded by GOODHUE and **carried** by the following roll call vote:

