

**CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA
FOREST AND BEACH COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING MINUTES**

4 February 2009
Thursday
1:30 p.m.

I. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL:

The regular meeting of the Forest and Beach Commission of the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea, California was held on the above date at the hour of 1:30 p.m. Chairperson Ford called the meeting to order and adjourned to the Tour of inspection at 1:35 p.m. The meeting reconvened at 2:05 p.m.

PRESENT: Joe Ford (Chairperson)
 Vicki Lynch
 Todd Hornick
 Tom Leverone

ABSENT: Les Kadis

STAFF PRESENT: Mike Branson, City Forester
 Margi Perotti, Administrative Coordinator

II. EXTRAORDINARY BUSINESS

Nomination and election of Chairperson and Vice Chairperson.

Commissioner FORD nominated LYNCH, Commissioner LYNCH nominated FORD. Following discussion, it was **moved** by LYNCH and **seconded** by HORNICK to **elect** Joe FORD as Chairperson for the 2010 year. The **motion carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: LYNCH, HORNICK, LEVERONE, FORD
NOES: NONE
ABSTAINED: NONE
ABSENT: KADIS

Chairperson FORD nominated Commissioner LYNCH for vice chairperson. No other nominations. It was **moved** by FORD and **seconded** by LEVERONE to **elect** Vicki LYNCH as vice chairperson. The **motion carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: LYNCH, HORNICK, LEVERONE, FORD
NOES: NONE
ABSTAINED: NONE
ABSENT: KADIS

III. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

The audience joined the Commission in the Pledge of Allegiance.

IV. APPEARANCES

Chairperson FORD opened the public hearing at 2:11 p.m. Barbara Livingston appeared before the Commission. The public hearing was closed at 2:13 p.m.

V. CONSENT AGENDA

1. Consideration of the minutes of the December 1, 2009 special meeting.

Chairman FORD **moved** and Commissioner LEVERONE seconded to **approve the minutes of the December 1, 2010 special meeting.** The **motion carried** by following roll call vote:

AYES: LYNCH, HORNIK, LEVERONE, FORD
NOES: NONE
ABSTAINED: NONE
ABSENT: KADIS

2. Adopt meeting calendar for 2010.

It was **moved** by FORD and seconded by LYNCH to **approve** the meeting calendar as corrected.

AYES: LYNCH, HORNIK, LEVERONE, FORD
NOES: NONE
ABSTAINED: NONE
ABSENT: KADIS

VI. APPLICATIONS/PUBLIC HEARINGS

1. Consideration of a request to review to remove one 16" dbh Monterey pine tree that the applicant considers a hazard. The site is located on the west side of Torres Street, 5 north of . The applicant is Bill Callahan for the property owners Don Woo and Maria Boisvert.

Mike Branson, City Forester presented his report.

Chairman FORD opened the public hearing at 2:18 p.m. Don Woo and Maria Boisvert appeared before the Commission. The public hearing was closed at 2:22 p.m.

It was **moved** by FORD and seconded by LYNCH to approve **the application** to remove the tree with the condition that a minimum of 1 or 2 upper canopy trees be planted as replacements. Size and location of the replacement trees are to be at the discretion of the City Forester. The motion **carried** by following

roll call vote:

AYES: LYNCH, HORNIK, LEVERONE, FORD
NOES: NONE
ABSTAINED: NONE
ABSENT: KADIS

VII. ORDERS OF BUSINESS

1. Consideration of a request to modify the western portion of Devendorf Park.

Mike Branson, City Forester gave his presentation.

Chairman FORD opened the public hearing at 2:51 p.m. Barbara Livingston and Greg D'Ambrosio appeared before the Commission. The public hearing was closed at 2:53 p.m. The public hearing was reopened at 2:59 p.m. Barbara Livingston appeared, and the public hearing was closed at 3:01 p.m.

It was **moved** by HORNIK and **seconded** by FORD **to send a recommendation to the City Administrator to substantially cut back the camellias to accent the heritage oak, look into the possibility of a new "Y" entrance from Mission St. and leave the hedge on Mission St. as a barrier between the park and the street. The motion carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: LYNCH, HORNIK, LEVERONE, FORD
NOES: NONE
ABSTAINED: NONE
ABSENT: KADIS

VIII. REPORTS FROM STAFF AND COMMISSIONERS

1. Receive verbal report from the Ad Hoc Beach Committee.

Commissioner LYNCH presented her report.

Chairperson FORD opened the public hearing at 3:11 p.m. Greg D'Ambrosio appeared before the Commission. Chairperson FORD closed the public hearing at 3:18 p.m.

Mike Branson, City Forester addressed questions of the Commission.

2. City Foresters report of a project to remove several eucalyptus trees from Mission Trail Nature Preserve near the Lester Rowntree Native Plant Garden for fire fuel reduction, public safety and implementation of the MTNP Master Plan.

Mike Branson, City Forester presented his report and addressed questions of the Commission.

Chairperson FORD opened and closed the public hearing at 3:22 p.m.

IX. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, Chairperson FORD adjourned the meeting at 3:23 p.m.

Approved,

Respectfully submitted,

Joe Ford
Chairperson

Margi Perotti
Administrative Coordinator

**CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA
FOREST AND BEACH COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING MINUTES**

4 March 2010
Thursday
1:30 p.m.

I. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL:

The regular meeting of the Forest and Beach Commission of the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea, California was held on the above date at the hour of 1:30 p.m. Chairperson Ford called the meeting to order and adjourned to the Tour of inspection at 2:00 p.m. The meeting reconvened at 2:02 p.m.

PRESENT: Joe Ford (Chairperson)
Vicki Lynch
Todd Hornik
Les Kadis

ABSENT: Tom Leverone

STAFF PRESENT: Mike Branson, City Forester
Margi Perotti, Administrative Coordinator

II. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

The audience joined the Commission in the Pledge of Allegiance.

IV. APPEARANCES

Chairperson FORD opened the public hearing at 2:11 p.m. There were no appearances and the public hearing was closed at 2:11 p.m.

V. CONSENT AGENDA

1. Consideration of the minutes of the 4 February 2010 regular meeting.

Commissioner LYNCH **moved** and Commissioner HORNIK seconded to **approve the minutes of the 4 February 2010 regular meeting.** The **motion carried** by following roll call vote:

AYES: LYNCH, HORNIK, KADIS, FORD
NOES: NONE
ABSTAINED: NONE
ABSENT: LEVERONE

VI. APPLICATIONS/PUBLIC HEARINGS

1. Consideration of a request to remove one 12” dbh Liquidambar tree that the applicant considers to be causing damage to a fence and crowding nearby coast live oak trees. The site is located on the east side of Carmelo 3 south of . The applicant /owner if Jean Pereira.

This item was continued to the next regular meeting.

VII. ORDERS OF BUSINESS

1. Review and make recommendations on a proposed design of new permanent public restrooms at Scenic Road and Santa Lucia Avenue.

Mike Branson, City Forester gave his presentation, and handed the presentation to Rob Carver from Carver and Schicketanz. Questions of the Commission were addressed.

Concerns noted by the Commission are as follows:

- Use of water vs non water usage toilets
- Use of grey water from the Citys holding tanks
- Retrofitting both toilets to use grey water
- Orienting the two benches to retain the history between them
- Engineering of the wall at the front to make sure that the sea walls are able to withstand storm wave action.
- Viewing platform ontop of the restrooms
- Add a ramp for coastal access at his end of the beach
- Open shower and public use of after should be eliminated due to water shortages.
- Seek any type of grants that may be used for the project.

Chairman FORD opened the public hearing at 2:10 p.m. Greg D’Ambrosio and Steve Dallas appeared before the Commission. The public hearing was closed at 2:18 p.m.

It was **moved** by KADIS and **seconded** by LYNCH **to approve conceptual project and forward the Commissions recommendations at to the Architect and to the City Council for consideration in the design process. The motion carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: LYNCH, HORNIK, KADIS, FORD
NOES: NONE
ABSTAINED: NONE
ABSENT: LEVERONE

2. Consideration of the Forest and Beach Commission budget goals for fiscal year 2010/2011.

Mike Branson, City Forester gave his presentation.

Chairman FORD opened the public hearing at 3:15 p.m. Greg D'Ambrosio and Steve Dallas appeared before the Commission. The public hearing was closed at 3:35.

VIII. REPORTS FROM STAFF AND COMMISSIONERS

1. Receive verbal report from the Ad Hoc Beach Committee.

Commissioner LYNCH presented her report.

Chairperson FORD opened the public hearing at 3:11 p.m. Greg D'Ambrosio appeared before the Commission. Chairperson FORD closed the public hearing at 3:18 p.m.

Mike Branson, City Forester addressed questions of the Commission.

Chairperson FORD opened and closed the public hearing at 3:22 p.m.

IX. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, Chairperson FORD adjourned the meeting at 3:23 p.m.

Approved,

Respectfully submitted,

Joe Ford
Chairperson

Margi Perotti
Administrative Coordinator

**CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA
FOREST AND BEACH COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING MINUTES**

4 March 2010
Thursday
1:30 p.m.

I. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL:

The regular meeting of the Forest and Beach Commission of the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea, California was held on the above date at the hour of 1:30 p.m. Chairperson Ford called the meeting to order and adjourned to the Tour of inspection at 2:00 p.m. The meeting reconvened at 2:02 p.m.

PRESENT: Joe Ford (Chairperson)
 Vicki Lynch
 Todd Hornik
 Les Kadis

ABSENT: Tom Leverone

STAFF PRESENT: Mike Branson, City Forester
 Margi Perotti, Administrative Coordinator

II. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

The audience joined the Commission in the Pledge of Allegiance.

IV. APPEARANCES

Chairperson FORD opened the public hearing at 2:11 p.m. There were no appearances and the public hearing was closed at 2:11 p.m.

V. CONSENT AGENDA

1. Consideration of the minutes of the 4 February 2010 regular meeting.

Commissioner LYNCH **moved** and Commissioner HORNIK seconded to **approve the minutes of the 4 February 2010 regular meeting.** The **motion carried** by following roll call vote:

AYES: LYNCH, HORNIK, KADIS, FORD
NOES: NONE
ABSTAINED: NONE
ABSENT: LEVERONE

VI. APPLICATIONS/PUBLIC HEARINGS

1. Consideration of a request to remove one 12” dbh Liquidambar tree that the applicant considers to be causing damage to a fence and crowding nearby coast live oak trees. The site is located on the east side of Carmelo 3 south of . The applicant /owner if Jean Pereira.

This item was continued to the next regular meeting.

VII. ORDERS OF BUSINESS

1. Review and make recommendations on a proposed design of new permanent public restrooms at Scenic Road and Santa Lucia Avenue.

Mike Branson, City Forester, gave his presentation. Rob Carver (Architect for the project) from Carver and Schicketanz addressed questions of the Commission. .

Chairman FORD opened the public hearing at 2:10 p.m. Greg D’Ambrosio and Steve Dallas appeared before the Commission. The public hearing was closed at 2:18 p.m.

Following discussion, it was **moved** by KADIS and **seconded** by LYNCH **to approve the conceptual project and forward the following recommendations to the Architect, Planning Commission and City Council for consideration.**

- **The City should be a leader in water conservation and should use compost toilets or non water toilets if possible.**
- **Use grey water from the City’s holding tanks, located at Del Mar. If possible also retrofit toilets at Del Mar to use grey water.**
- **Orient the two benches as they are currently to be able to retain the history and story of them.**
- **Engineering of the wall at the front to make sure that the sea walls are able to withstand storm wave action.**
- **Possible viewing on top of the restrooms.**
- **Add a stone ramp at this end of the beach for coastal access.**
- **The open shower should be eliminated or capped off due to the current water shortages.**
- **Seek grants for the project.**

The motion **carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: LYNCH, HORNIK, KADIS, FORD
NOES: NONE
ABSTAINED: NONE
ABSENT: LEVERONE

2. Consideration of the Forest and Beach Commission budget goals for fiscal year 2010/2011.

Mike Branson, City Forester gave his presentation.

Chairman FORD opened the public hearing at 3:15 p.m. Greg D'Ambrosio and Steve Dallas appeared before the Commission. The public hearing was closed at 3:35.

Chairman FORD appointed Todd Hornik and Vicki Lynch to an Ad Hoc Committee to review the possible budget goals and report back at a special meeting scheduled for March 11, 2010.

No other action taken.

VIII. REPORTS FROM STAFF AND COMMISSIONERS

1. Receive verbal report from the Ad Hoc Beach Committee.

No report.

IX. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, Chairperson FORD adjourned the meeting at 3:55 p.m.

Approved,

Respectfully submitted,

Joe Ford
Chairperson

Margi Perotti
Administrative Coordinator

**CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA
FOREST AND BEACH COMMISSION
SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES**

11 March 2010

Thursday

4:00 p.m.

I. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL:

The special meeting of the Forest and Beach Commission of the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea, California was held on the above date at the hour of 4:00 p.m. Chairperson Ford called the meeting to order.

PRESENT: Joe Ford (Chairperson)
 Vicki Lynch
 Todd Hornik
 Les Kadis

ABSENT: Tom Leverone

STAFF PRESENT: Mike Branson, City Forester
 Margi Perotti, Administrative Coordinator

II. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

The audience joined the Commission in the Pledge of Allegiance.

III. ORDERS OF BUSINESS

1. Consideration of the Forest and Beach Commission budget goals for fiscal year 2010/2011.

Commissioner LYNCH from the Ad Hoc Committee gave her presentation. Chairman FORD opened and closed the public hearing at 4:04 p.m.

**** Commissioner HORNİK joined the meeting at 4:10 p.m.****

It was moved by KADIS and seconded by FORD to forward the Forest and Beach Commission goals as amended to the City Council for submission in the budget process.

The motion carried by the following roll call vote:

AYES: LYNCH, HORNİK, KADIS, FORD
NOES: NONE
ABSTAINED: NONE
ABSENT: LEVERONE

IX. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, Chairperson FORD adjourned the meeting at 4:40 p.m.

Approved,

Respectfully submitted,

Joe Ford
Chairperson

Margi Perotti
Administrative Coordinator

**CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA
FOREST AND BEACH COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING MINUTES**

1 April 2010
Thursday
1:30 p.m.

I. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL:

The regular meeting of the Forest and Beach Commission of the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea, California was held on the above date at the hour of 1:30 p.m. Chairperson Ford called the meeting to order and adjourned to the Tour of inspection at 1:35 p.m. The meeting reconvened at 2:05 p.m.

PRESENT: Joe Ford (Chairperson)
Vicki Lynch
Todd Hornick
Tom Leverone

ABSENT: Les Kadis

STAFF PRESENT: Mike Branson, City Forester
Margi Perotti, Administrative Coordinator

III. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

The audience joined the Commission in the Pledge of Allegiance.

IV. APPEARANCES

Chairperson FORD opened and closed the public hearing at 2:08 p.m.

V. CONSENT AGENDA

1. Consideration of the minutes of the 4 March 2010 and 11 March 2010 meetings.

Commissioner LYNCH **moved** and Commissioner HORNICK seconded to **approve the minutes as submitted.** The **motion carried** by following roll call vote:

AYES: LYNCH, HORNICK, FORD
NOES: NONE
ABSTAINED: LEVERONE
ABSENT: KADIS

VI. APPLICATIONS/PUBLIC HEARINGS

1. Consideration of an application to remove a 42" diameter Monterey pine the applicant considers a hazard. The site is located on the north side of Avenue 2 west of Camino Real. The owner/applicant is Larry Southern.

Mike Branson, City Forester presented his report.

Chairman FORD opened the public hearing at 2:10 p.m. Larry Southern, Ritchie Dunn and Adam Moniz appeared before the Commission. The public hearing was closed at 2:22 p.m.

It was **moved** by LYNCH and **seconded** by HORNIK to **deny** the application and recommended the applicant continue to monitor the tree and report any changes to the City Forester. The motion **carried** by following roll call vote:

AYES: LYNCH, HORNIK, LEVERONE, FORD
NOES: NONE
ABSTAINED: NONE
ABSENT: KADIS

2. Consideration of a request to remove one 12” dbh Liquidambar tree the applicant considers to be causing damage to a fence and crowding nearby coast live oak trees. The site is located on the east side of Carmelo 3 south of . The applicant/owner is Jean Pereira.

Mike Branson, City Forester presented his report.

Chairman FORD opened and closed the public hearing at 2:33 p.m.

It was **moved** by LYNCH and seconded by LEVERONE to **deny** the application to remove the tree. The motion **carried** by following roll call vote:

AYES: LYNCH, HORNIK, LEVERONE, FORD
NOES: NONE
ABSTAINED: NONE
ABSENT: KADIS

VII. ORDERS OF BUSINESS

1. Consideration of an Arbor Day event for 2010.

Mike Branson, City Forester gave his presentation.

Chairman FORD opened and closed the public hearing at 2:40 p.m.

No other action taken.

VIII. REPORTS FROM STAFF AND COMMISSIONERS

1. Receive verbal report from the Ad Hoc Beach Committee.

Commissioner LYNCH presented her report.

Mike Branson, City Forester addressed questions of the Commissioners, informed the Commission of the upcoming repairs to the beach stairs and the demo of the beach cleaning equipment on April 21, 2010.

Chairman FORD opened the public hearing at 2:50 p.m. Adam Moniz appeared before the Commission. The public hearing was closed at 2:51 p.m.

2. Receive verbal report on the City Council special meeting of 23 March 2010.

Mike Branson, City Forester presented his report.

Chairman FORD opened and closed the public hearing at 2: 57 p.m.

IX. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, Chairperson FORD adjourned the meeting at 2:58 p.m.

Approved,

Respectfully submitted,

Joe Ford
Chairperson

Margi Perotti
Administrative Coordinator

**CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA
FOREST AND BEACH COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING MINUTES**

6 May 2010
Thursday
1:30 p.m.

I. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL:

The regular meeting of the Forest and Beach Commission of the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea, California was held on the above date at the hour of 1:30 p.m. Chairperson Lynch called the meeting to order and adjourned to the Tour of inspection at 1:35 p.m. The meeting reconvened at 2:00 p.m.

PRESENT: Vicki Lynch (Acting Chairperson)
Les Kadis
Todd Hornik
Tom Leverone

ABSENT: Joe Ford

STAFF PRESENT: Mike Branson, City Forester
Margi Perotti, Administrative Coordinator

III. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

The audience joined the Commission in the Pledge of Allegiance.

IV. APPEARANCES

Chairperson LYNCH opened the public hearing at 2:02 p.m. Steve Brooks appeared before the Commission. There being no further appearances the public hearing was closed.

V. CONSENT AGENDA

1. Consideration of the minutes of the 1 April, 2010 meeting.

Commissioner LEVERONE **moved** and Commissioner HORNIK seconded to **approve the minutes as submitted.** The **motion carried** by following roll call vote:

AYES: KADIS, LEVERONE, HORNIK, LYNCH
NOES: NONE
ABSTAINED: NONE
ABSENT: FORD

VI. APPLICATIONS/PUBLIC HEARINGS

1. Consideration of a proposal from the City of Carmel and the Friends of Carmel Forest to plant ten new Monterey cypress trees along the Scenic Road pathway between Avenue and Martin Way. The applicant/owner is the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea.

Mike Branson, City Forester presented his report.

Chairman LYNCH opened the public hearing at 2:12 p.m. Tim Allen, Clayton Anderson, Steve Brooks, Linda Anderson and Barbara Brooks appeared before the Commission. There being no further appearances the public hearing was closed at 2:35 p.m.

It was **moved** by LEVERONE to continue this item to the next regular meeting and repost the tree planting locations, the motion was **amended** by KADIS to also include a notice in the Carmel Pine Cone notifying residents about the tree plantings; the amended motion was **seconded** by HORNIK and **carried** by following roll call vote:

AYES: LYNCH, HORNIK, LEVERONE, KADIS
NOES: NONE
ABSTAINED: NONE
ABSENT: FORD

VII. ORDERS OF BUSINESS

1. Consideration of an Arbor Day event for 2010.

Mike Branson, City Forester gave his presentation.

Chairman LYNCH opened the public hearing at 2:50 p.m. Steve Brooks, Clayton Anderson and Linda Anderson appeared before the Commission, there being no further appearances the public hearing was closed.

Chairperson LYNCH appointed Commissioners HORNIK and LEVERONE as the ad Hoc Arbor Day Committee to work with Mike Branson the City Forester and the Friends of Carmel Forest to prepare a tentative agenda for Arbor Day. The Ad Hoc Committee is to report back at the next regular meeting.

No other action taken.

2. Discussion of recent illegal young tree removals and vandalism.

Mike Branson, City Forester gave his presentation.

Chairperson LYNCH opened the public hearing at 3:02 p.m. Steve Brooks and Linda Anderson appeared before the Commission. Chairperson LYNCH closed the public hearing at 3:13 p.m.

No other action.

VIII. REPORTS FROM STAFF AND COMMISSION

1. Receive verbal report from the Ad Hoc Beach Committee.

Mike Branson addressed questions of the Commission.

Chairperson LYNCH opened the public hearing Greg D'Ambrosio appeared before the Commission. Three being no further appearances, the public hearing was closed.

2. Receive verbal report on the City of Carmel draft budget for 2010-13.

Mike Branson, City Forester gave his presentation and addressed questions of the Commission.

*** Commissioner KADIS excused himself from the meeting at 3:40 p.m.***

Commissioner LEVERONE **moved** to appoint Chairperson FORD and/or Commissioner LYNCH as a spokes person to represent the Forest and Beach Commission and appear in front of the City Council during the budget deliberations, **seconded** by LYNCH:

The motion **carried** by a unanimous voice vote.

IX. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, Chairperson LYNCH adjourned the meeting at 3:50 .p.m.

Approved,

Respectfully submitted,

Vicki Lynch
Chairperson

Margi Perotti
Administrative Coordinator

**CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA
FOREST AND BEACH COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING MINUTES**

3 June 2010
Thursday
1:30 p.m.

I. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL:

The regular meeting of the Forest and Beach Commission of the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea, California was held on the above date at the hour of 1:30 p.m. Chairperson Ford adjourned the meeting and reconvened at 2:00 p.m.

PRESENT: Vicki Lynch
Les Kadis
Joe Ford (Chairperson)

ABSENT: Tom Leverone
Todd Hornik

STAFF PRESENT: Mike Branson, City Forester
Margi Perotti, Administrative Coordinator

III. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

The audience joined the Commission in the Pledge of Allegiance.

IV. APPEARANCES

Chairperson FORD opened the public hearing at 2:02 p.m. Adam Montiz appeared before the Commission. There being no further appearances the public hearing was closed at 2:03 p.m.

V. CONSENT AGENDA

1. Consideration of the minutes of the 6 May, 2010 meeting.

Chairperson FORD continued this item to the next regular meeting for a full quorum.

VI. APPLICATIONS/PUBLIC HEARINGS

1. Consideration of a proposal from the City of Carmel and the Friends of Carmel Forest to plant ten new Monterey cypress trees along the Scenic Road pathway between Avenue and Martin Way. The applicant/owner is the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea.

Mike Branson, City Forester presented his report.

Chairman FORD opened the public hearing at 2:17 p.m. Bill Schellooe, Michael LePage, Shirley Human, Leonard Riggs, Marshall Stimpson, Tim Allen, Mike Pietro, Gene McFarland, Clayton Anderson, Olaf Dahlstrand, Jean Grace, Joyce Stephens, Barbara Stiles, Linda Anderson, Karen Ferlito, Barbara Livingston,

Mike Brown, Barbara Brooks, Carl Iverson, Suzanne Poopabojan, Peter Candentia, Dennis Miller, Pat Schott, The public hearing was closed at 3:25 p.m. Chairperson FORD adjourned the meeting for 5 minutes and reconvened the meeting at 3:30 p.m.

Chairperson FORD opened Jean Grace and Barbara Livingston appeared before the Commission. The public hearing was closed at 3:44 p.m.

It was **moved** by Chairperson FORD, and **seconded** by Commissioner KADIS, to continue this item and ask the residents to form a committee to look at each location to come to some type of compromise. The motion **carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: LYNCH, KADIS, FORD
NOES: NONE
ABSTAINED: NONE
ABSENT: LEVERONE, HORNIK

VII. ORDERS OF BUSINESS

1. Consideration of a proposed Service Learning Project by Students from Carmel River School in coordination with the Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary to place Interpretive Signs and Artwork along the Scenic Road Pathway and Del Mar area of Carmel Beach.

Mike Branson, City Forester, gave his presentation. Seaberry Nachbar, Education Coordinator from the B-WET, NOAA's National Marine Sanctuary Program appeared before the Commission and gave her presentation.

Chairman FORD opened the public hearing at 4:05 p.m. Barbara Livingston appeared before the Commission, there being no further appearances the public hearing was closed at 4:06 p.m.

Commissioner LYNCH **moved** to approve the project and forward a recommendation to the Planning Commission for approval, **seconded** by Commissioners KADIS and **carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: LYNCH, KADIS, FORD
NOES: NONE
ABSTAINED: NONE
ABSENT: LEVERONE, HORNIK

2. Consideration of an Arbor Day event for 2010.

Mike Branson, City Forester, gave is presentation.

Chairman FORD opened the public hearing at 4:11 p.m. Barbara Livingston appeared before the Commission, there being no further appearances the public hearing was closed at 4:13.

No further action.

VIII. REPORTS FROM STAFF AND COMMISSION

1. Receive verbal report from the Ad Hoc Beach Committee.

No report.

2. Receive verbal report on the City of Carmel draft budget for 2010-13.

Mike Branson, City Forester, gave his presentation and addressed questions of the Commission.

No further action.

IX. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, Chairperson FORD adjourned the meeting at 4:18 p.m.

Approved,

Respectfully submitted,

Joe Ford
Chairperson

Margi Perotti
Administrative Coordinator

**CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA
FOREST AND BEACH COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING MINUTES**

5 August 2010
Thursday
1:30 p.m.

I. CALL TO ORDER

The regular meeting of the Forest and Beach Commission of the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea, California was held on the above date at the hour of 1:30 p.m. Chairman FORD adjourned to the Tour of Inspection and reconvened the meeting at 2:09 p.m.

II. ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Todd Hornik
Les Kadis
Tom Leverone
Vicki Lynch
Joe Ford (Chairperson)

ABSENT: None

STAFF PRESENT: Mike Branson, City Forester
Margi Perotti, Administrative Coordinator

III. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Members of the audience joined the Commission in the Pledge of Allegiance.

IV. APPEARANCES

Chairperson FORD opened the public hearing at 2:10 p.m. Barbara Livingston appeared before the Commission. There being no further appearances the public hearing was closed at 2:12 p.m.

V. CONSENT AGENDA

1. Consideration of the minutes of the 6 May, 2010 and June 3, 2010 meetings.

Commissioner HORNIK **moved** and Commissioner LYNCH **seconded** to approve the minutes of the 6 May 2010 meeting, the **motion carried** by a unanimous voice vote.

Commissioner LYNCH **moved** and Chairperson FORD **seconded** to approve the June 3, 2010 meeting, the **motion carried** by a unanimous voice vote.

VI. APPLICATIONS/PUBLIC HEARINGS

1. Consideration of an application to remove two Monterey pine trees (25” and 13” dbh) the applicants consider to be dead. The site is located on the west side of Santa Rita Street, 5 south of Avenue. The property owner/applicants are George Siu and Agnes Falusi.

Mike Branson, City Forester, presented his report.

Chairperson an FORD opened the public hearing at 2:20 p.m. Agnes Falusi appeared before the Commission. The public hearing was closed at 2:23 p.m.

It was **moved** by Chairperson FORD, and **seconded** by Commissioner KADIS, to approve a portion of the application. Approved for removal is the one 13” dbh Monterey pine tree. The 25” dbh Monterey pine tree must remain. The Commission recommends pruning the 25” dbh pine to remove dead limbs in the canopy. The motion **carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: HORNIK, KADIS, LEVERONE, LYNCH, FORD
NOES: NONE
ABSTAINED: NONE
ABSENT: NONE

2. Consideration of an application to remove one Monterey pine tree (23” dbh) due to safety concerns of the property owner. The site is located on the SE corner of Palou and Casanova Streets. The property owner/applicant is Chaparala Kishore.

Mike Branson, City Forester presented his report.

Chairperson FORD opened the public hearing at 2:28 p.m., there being no appearances, the public hearing was closed.

It was **moved** by Chairperson FORD and **seconded** by Commissioner LEVERONE to **deny** the application and recommend the tree be pruned to reduce the canopy weight and to reduce the wind sail effect during storm events and to continue to monitor the tree for any changes to its health or physical condition. The motion **carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: HORNIK, KADIS, LEVERONE, LYNCH, FORD
NOES: NONE
ABSTAINED: NONE
ABSENT: NONE

VII. ORDERS OF BUSINESS

1. Consideration of an Arbor Day event for 2010 and a request to the City Council for co-sponsorship with the Friends of Carmel Forest.

Mike Branson, City Forester, made his comments and handed the presentation over to Commissioner LEVERONE regarding the events of the day.

Chairman FORD opened the public hearing at 2:33 p.m. Barbara Livingston and handed out a booklet called "The Cypress of Monterey" to each Commissioner and Clayton Anderson appeared before the Commission, there being no further appearances the public hearing was closed at 2:38 p.m.

Chairperson FORD **moved** to forward a recommendation to the City Council to approve co-sponsorship of an amount not-to-exceed \$1,000 towards the Arbor Day Event, **seconded** by Commissioner LEVERONE and **carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: KADIS, HORNIK, LEVERONE, LYNCH, FORD
NOES: NONE
ABSTAINED: NONE
ABSENT: NONE

VIII. REPORTS FROM STAFF AND COMMISSION

1. Receive verbal report from the Ad Hoc Beach Committee.

Commissioner LYNCH presented her report. Mike Branson addressed questions of the Commission.

Chairperson FORD opened the public hearing at 2:50 p.m. Barbara Livingston and Steve Brooks appeared before the Commission.

2. Receive report on the status of the Scenic Road tree planting project.

Mike Branson presented his report.

Chairperson FORD opened the public hearing at 2:58 p.m. Clayton Anderson, Bill Shoeloe, Stan Mersman, Barbara Livingston, Steve Brooks, appeared before the Commission. The public hearing was closed at 3:08 p.m.

IX. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, Chairperson FORD adjourned the meeting at 3:10 p.m.

Approved,

Respectfully submitted,

Joe Ford
Chairperson

Margi Perotti
Administrative Coordinator

**CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA
FOREST AND BEACH COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING MINUTES**

7 October 2010
Thursday
1:30 p.m.

I. CALL TO ORDER

The regular meeting of the Forest and Beach Commission of the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea, California was held on the above date at the hour of 1:30 p.m.

II. ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Todd Hornik
Les Kadis
Tom Leverone
Joe Ford (Chairperson)

ABSENT: Vicki Lynch

STAFF PRESENT: Mike Branson, City Forester
Margi Perotti, Administrative Coordinator

III. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Members of the audience joined the Commission in the Pledge of Allegiance.

IV. APPEARANCES

Chairperson FORD opened the public hearing at 1:31 p.m. Jean Grace, Former Mayor, and Niels Riemers appeared before the Commission. There being no further appearances the public hearing was closed at 1:34 p.m.

V. CONSENT AGENDA

1. Consideration of the minutes of the August 5, 2010 meeting.

Commissioner FORD **moved** and Commissioner LEVERONE **seconded** to approve the minutes of the 5 August 2010 meeting, the **motion carried** by the following roll call:

AYES: HORNIK, KADIS, LEVERONE, FORD
NOES: NONE
ABSTAINED: NONE
ABSENT: LYNCH

VI. APPLICATIONS/PUBLIC HEARINGS

1. Consideration and provide direction of a proposal from the City of Carmel and the Friends of Carmel Forest to plant ten new Monterey cypress trees along the Scenic Road pathway between and Martin Way. The applicant/owner is the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea.

Mike Branson, City Forester, presented his report.

Chairperson an FORD opened the public hearing at 1:45 p.m. Kathy Bang, Elizabeth Gianola, Bob Fesner, Niels Reimer, and Tranquillino Manfrotto appeared before the Commission. The public hearing was closed at 2:53 p.m.

The Commission evaluated and made recommendations on each of the following trees.

Tree #1, Scenic Road 20 feet south of Avenue steps to the beach, 35 feet west of Scenic Road. It was moved by HORNIK and Seconded by FORD to recommended planting at his location. Chairperson Ford opened and closed the public hearing – no comment. The motion carried by the following roll call vote:

AYES: HORNIK, KADIS, LEVERONE, FORD
NOES: NONE
ABSTAINED: NONE
ABSENT: LYNCH

Tree # 2: Scenic Road 10 feet north of vehicle ramp t the beach, between and Avenues. It was moved by FORD and seconded by HORNIK to recommend planting at this location. Chairperson FORD opened and closed the public hearing – no comment. The motion carried by the following roll call vote:

AYES: HORNIK, KADIS, FORD
NOES: LEVERONE
ABSTAINED: NONE
ABSENT: LYNCH

Tree #3 Scenic Road 20 feet south of Avenue next to Scenic pathway. It was moved by LEVERONE and seconded by FORD to recommend planting at this location. Chairperson FORD opened and closed the public hearing – no comment. The carried by the following roll call vote:

AYES: KADIS, LEVERONE, FORD
NOES: HORNIK
ABSTAINED: NONE
ABSENT: LYNCH

Tree #4 Scenic Road between and Avenues 20 feet north of Avenue stairs to the beach. It was moved by KADIS and seconded by HORNK to deny this recommendation. Chairperson FORD opened the public hearing Gary Bang and Elizabeth Gianola appeared before the Commission The motion carried by the following roll call vote:

AYES: HORNIK, KADIS, LEVERONE
NOES: FORD
ABSTAINED: NONE
ABSENT: LYNCH

Tree #5 Scenic Road approximately 80 feet south of Avenue crossing, in planter area between Scenic Road and the path. It was moved by HORNK and seconded by FORD to recommend planting at this location. Chairperson FORD opened and closed the public hearing – no appearances. The motion carried by the following roll call vote:

AYES: HORNK, KADIS, FORD
NOES: LEVERONE
ABSTAINED: NONE
ABSENT: LYNCH

Tree #6 Scenic road approximately 160 feet south of Avenue in planter area between Scenic Road and Patio. It was moved by FORD and seconded by KADIS to adopt staffs recommendation and hold off planting in this site. Chairperson FORD opened and closed the public hearing – no comments. The motion carried by the following roll call vote:

AYES: HORNK, KADIS, LEVERONE, FORD
NOES: ~~HORNK~~
ABSTAINED: NONE
ABSENT: LYNCH

Tree #7 Scenic Road between and Avenues, approximately 200 feet north of Avenue, 15 feet west of the pathway. It was moved by HORNK and seconded by LEVERONE to deny planting at this location. Chairperson FORD opened and closed the public hearing – no comment. The motion carried by the following roll call vote:

AYES: HORNK, LEVERONE, FORD
NOES: KADIS
ABSTAINED: NONE
ABSENT: LYNCH

Tree #8 Scenic Road between and Avenues, approximately 60 feet north of Avenue 10 feet west of the pathway. It was moved by KADIS and seconded by FORD to recommend planting at this location. Chairperson FORD opened and closed the public hearing – no comment. The motion failed due to a tie vote. No other action taken.

AYES: KADIS, FORD
NOES: HORNIK, LEVERONE
ABSTAINED: NONE
ABSENT: LYNCH

Tree # 9 Scenic Road between and Santa Lucia Avenue on the south side of the point at Avenue. It was moved by HORNIK and seconded by KADIS to plant at this location. Chairperson FORD opened the public hearing – no comment. The motion carried by the following roll call vote:

AYES: HORNIK, KADIS, FORD
NOES: LEVERONE
ABSTAINED: NONE
ABSENT: LYNCH

Tree #10 Scenic Road between Santa Lucia and city limit, approximately 75 feet south of Santa Lucia. It was moved by FORD and seconded by HORNIK to adopt staffs recommendation and hold off planting at this location. Chairperson FORD opened and closed the public hearing – no comments. The motion carried by the following roll call vote:

AYES: HORNIK, KADIS, LEVERONE, FORD
NOES: NONE
ABSTAINED: NONE
ABSENT: LYNCH

VII. ORDERS OF BUSINESS

1. Consideration and review of the “Arbor Day” event for 2010.

Commissioner HORNIK gave an overview of the event. Chairperson FORD opened and closed the public hearing - no comments.
No other action.

VIII. REPORTS FROM STAFF AND COMMISSION

1. Receive verbal report from the Ad Hoc Beach Committee.

Commissioner KADIS presented his report. Chairperson FORD opened the public hearing at 2:43 p.m.
No other action taken.

2. Report on new stairs and boardwalk in the North Dunes area.

Mike Branson presented his report. Chairperson FORD opened the public hearing at 2:44 p.m. No other action taken.

3. Reminder of the City Birthday parade and party on October 30, 2010.

Chairperson FORD invited all members of the Commission and the public to attend the event. No other action taken.

IX. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, Chairperson FORD adjourned the meeting at 2:48 p.m.

Approved,

Respectfully submitted,

Joe Ford
Chairperson

Margi Perotti
Administrative Coordinator

**CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA
FOREST AND BEACH COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING MINUTES**

4 November 2010
Thursday
1:30 p.m.

I. CALL TO ORDER

The regular meeting of the Forest and Beach Commission of the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea, California was held on the above date at the hour of 1:30 p.m.

II. ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Todd Hornik
Tom Leverone
Vicki Lynch
Joe Ford (Chairperson)

ABSENT: Les Kadis

STAFF PRESENT: Mike Branson, City Forester
Margi Perotti, Administrative Coordinator

III. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Members of the audience joined the Commission in the Pledge of Allegiance.

IV. APPEARANCES

Chairperson FORD opened the public hearing at 1:53 p.m. Steve Brooks, Clayton Anderson and Barbara Livingston appeared before the Commission. There being no further appearances the public hearing was closed at 2:05 p.m.

V. CONSENT AGENDA

1. Consideration of the minutes of the August 5, 2010 meeting.

Commissioner HORNIK **moved** and Commissioner LEVERONE **seconded** to approve the minutes of the October 7, 2010 minutes as corrected. The **motion carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: HORNIK, LEVERONE, FORD
NOES: NONE
ABSTAINED: LYNCH
ABSENT: KADIS

VI. APPLICATIONS/PUBLIC HEARINGS

1. Consideration of an application to remove three coast redwoods (3", 2-4" diameter) from city property. The applicant considers the trees to be too close together and interfering with utilities, mature oaks, and a retaining wall. The site is located at the northwest corner of Santa Fe Street and Avenue (on Santa Fe Street). The applicants are Richard and Michele Ruble and the property owner is the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea.

Mike Branson, City Forester, presented his report.

Chairperson FORD opened the public hearing at 1:45 p.m. Mrs. Ruble and Barbara Livingston appeared before the Commission. The public hearing was closed at 2:30 p.m.

Chairperson FORD reopened the public hearing at 2:31 p.m. Linda Anderson, Barbara Livingston and Mrs. Ruble appeared before the Commission. The public hearing was closed at 2:34 p.m.

It was **moved** by FORD and **seconded** by HORNIK to **approve a portion** of the application. **Approved** for removal is the redwood tree closest to the retaining wall, the other two trees are **denied for removal**. The Commission recommends the trees be pruned to the trees to clear the walls and the signs. The motion **carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: HORNIK, LEVERONE, LYNCH, FORD
NOES: NONE
ABSTAINED: NONE
ABSENT: KADIS

VII. ORDERS OF BUSINESS

1. Discussion of the 2010 tree survey and coordination of data collection with the Friends of Carmel Forest.

Mike Branson, City Forester presented his report.

Chairperson FORD opened the public hearing at 2: 43 p.m. Steve Brooks appeared before the Commission. The public hearing was closed at 2:53 p.m.

No further action taken.

VIII. REPORTS FROM STAFF AND COMMISSION

1. Receive verbal report from the Ad Hoc Beach Committee.

Commissioner LYNCH presented her report. Chairperson FORD opened and closed the public hearing at 2:55 p.m. No other action taken.

2. Receive verbal report on the City Council decision on modifications to Devendorf Park.

Mike Branson presented his report. Chairperson FORD opened the public hearing at 3:00 p.m. Barbara Livingston appeared before the Commission. No other action taken.

3. Receive verbal report on the Scenic Road tree planting.

Mike Branson presented his report and addressed questions of the Commission. Chairperson FORD opened and closed the public hearing at 3:01 p.m. No other action taken.

IX. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, Chairperson FORD adjourned the meeting at 3:05 p.m.

Approved,

Respectfully submitted,

Joe Ford
Chairperson

Margi Perotti
Administrative Coordinator

**CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA
FOREST AND BEACH COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING MINUTES**

2 December 2010

Thursday

1:30 p.m.

I. CALL TO ORDER

The regular meeting of the Forest and Beach Commission of the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea, California was held on the above date at the hour of 1:30 p.m.

II. ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Leslie Kadis
Tom Leverone
Joe Ford (Chairperson)

ABSENT: Todd Hornik
Victoria Lynch

STAFF PRESENT: Mike Branson, City Forester
Margi Perotti, Administrative Coordinator

III. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Members of the audience joined the Commission in the Pledge of Allegiance.

IV. APPEARANCES

Chairperson FORD opened the public hearing at 1:32 p.m. Clayton Anderson appeared before the Commission. There being no further appearances the public hearing was closed at 1:33 p.m.

Chairman FORD opened the public hearing again at 2:12 p.m. Greg D'Ambrosio appeared before the Commission. There being no further appearances the public hearing was closed at 2:16 p.m.

V. CONSENT AGENDA

1. Consideration of the minutes of the November 4, 2010 meeting.

This item was continued to the next regular meeting for a full quorum.

VI. ORDERS OF BUSINESS

1. Discussion of the 2010 Arbor Day event with the Friends of Carmel Forest.

Chairperson FORD opened the public hearing at 1:34 p.m. Barbara Livingston and Linda Anderson appeared before the Commission. The public hearing was closed at 1:43 p.m.

General discussion regarding the event and possible a tree walk event for 2011. No further action taken.

2. Recommendation to the City Council on the use of a beach rake on Carmel Beach.

Mike Branson, City Forester gave his presentation.

Chairperson FORD opened the public hearing at 2:02 p.m. Barbara Livingston, Greg D'Ambrosio, Christie Downing, Linda Anderson and Clayton Anderson appeared before the Commission. There being no further discussion the public hearing was closed.

Following discussion, it was moved by Commissioner KADIS and seconded by Commissioner LEVERONE to forward a recommendation to the City Council not use the beach rake and tractor on Carmel Beach and the additional money should be spent for manual labor. The motion carried by the following roll call vote:

AYES: KADIS, FORD, LEVERONE
NOES: NONE
ABSTAINED: NONE
ABSENT: HORNIK, LYNCH

3. Review of the period selected for completion of the annual tree survey.

Mike Branson, City Forester gave his presentation.

Chairperson FORD opened the public hearing at 2:16 p.m. Steve Brooks appeared before the Commission. The public hearing was closed at 2:18 p.m.

There was a general concurrence with City Forester's recommendation for October – November survey. No action required.

VII. REPORTS FROM STAFF AND COMMISSION

1. Receive verbal report from the Ad Hoc Beach Committee.

No report.

VIII. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, Chairperson FORD adjourned the meeting at 2:25 p.m.

Forest and Beach Commission
Regular Meeting
December 2, 2010
Page 3

Approved,

Joe Ford
Chairperson

Respectfully submitted,

Margi Perotti
Administrative Coordinator