

**CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA
PLANNING COMMISSION – MINUTES
FEBRUARY 13, 2013**

I. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Commission Members: LePage, Reimers, Goodhue, Paterson

ABSENT: Commission Members: Dallas (via phone for one item)

STAFF PRESENT: Marc Wiener, Associate Planner
Leslie Fenton, Administrative Coordinator

II. TOUR OF INSPCETION

The Commission toured the following sites: Hayward, Ghazal, Casey (2), Graham, Barhnurst/Cushman, Pepe, Wagner.

III. ROLL CALL

IV. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Members of the audience joined Commission members in the pledge of allegiance.

V. ANNOUNCEMENTS/EXTRAORDINARY BUSINESS

Marc Wiener, Associate Planner, announced the following:

1. Special Meeting scheduled for March 6, 2013, at 4:00 p.m.
2. City Council denied the appeal of DS 12-122.
3. City Council approved the funding for the beach restroom project.

VI. APPEARANCES

Barbara Livingston appeared before the Commission.

VII. CONSENT AGENDA

1. Consideration of minutes from January 3, 2013, Special Meeting.
2. Consideration of minutes from January 9, 2013, Regular Meeting.

- | | |
|--|--|
| <p>4. DS 12-112
Terril & Kathryn Efir
W/s Vizcaino 9 S Mt. View
Block 102, Lot(s) 9</p> | <p>Consideration of Design Study (Final) and Coastal Development Permit applications for the addition of a second story to an existing residence located in the Single Family Residential (R-1) District.</p> |
| <p>5. DS 12-77
David & Jan Graham
SE Carmelo & 4th
Block GG, Lot(s) 26 & 28</p> | <p>Consideration of a Plan Revision to an approved Design Study for the alteration of an existing residence located in the Single Family Residential (R-1) and Archaeological Significance Overlay (AS) Districts.</p> |

Commissioner LEPAGE moved **to approve Consent Agenda items #1, #4 and #5**, seconded by GOODHUE and **carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: LePage, Reimers, Goodhue, Paterson
 NOES: None
 ABSENT: Dallas
 ABSTAIN: None

Commissioner LEPAGE moved **to approve Consent Agenda item #2**, seconded by GOODHUE and **carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: LePage, Goodhue, Paterson
 NOES: None
 ABSENT: Dallas, Reimers
 ABSTAIN: None

VIII. CONSENT AGENDA (PULLED ITEMS)

- | | |
|--|---|
| <p>3. DS 12-133
Plum Holdings
E/s Monte Verde 2 N 1st
Block 31, Lot(s) 14</p> | <p>Consideration of a request for a Time Extension for Design Study and Coastal Development Permit approvals for the construction of a new residence located in the Single Family Residential (R-1) District.</p> |
|--|---|

Marc Wiener, Associate Planner, presented the staff report. Barbara Livingston and Fred Kern appeared before the Commission.

Commissioner LEPAGE moved **to approve Consent Agenda item #3**, seconded by REIMERS and **carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: LePage, Reimers, Goodhue, Paterson
 NOES: None
 ABSENT: Dallas
 ABSTAIN: None

IX. PUBLIC HEARINGS

- | | |
|--|--|
| 1. SI 13-2
John Wagner
W/s Lincoln 2 N 7 th
Block 74, Lot(s) 11 & 13 | Consideration of an application for a brushed metal business sign at a site located in the Central Commercial (CC) District.
(Kevin Milligan Gallery) |
|--|--|

Margi Perotti, Code Enforcement, presented the staff report. Chair Paterson opened the public hearing at 4:22 p.m. Kevin Milligan and Roberta Miller appeared before the Commission. There being no other appearances, the public hearing was closed at 4:26 p.m.

Commissioner LEPAGE moved **to approve the sign as proposed**, seconded by GOODHUE and **carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: LePage, Goodhue, Paterson
NOES: Reimers
ABSENT: Dallas
ABSTAIN: None

- | | |
|---|--|
| 2. DS 12-68
Malcolm Ghazal
NW San Antonio & 10 th
Block V, Lot(s) 18 & 20 | Consideration of Design Study (Concept) and Coastal Development Permit applications for the substantial alteration of an existing residence located in the Single Family Residential (R-1) District. |
|---|--|

Commissioner Reimers re-cused herself from the discussion.

Marc Wiener, Associate Planner, presented the staff report. Chair Paterson opened the public hearing at 4:40 p.m. Anthony Lombardo, Steve Boutin, Jeff Malik and Barbara Livingston appeared before the Commission. There being no other appearances, the public hearing was closed at 4:59 p.m.

Commissioner GOODHUE moved **to continue the project**, seconded by LEPAGE and **carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: LePage, Goodhue, Paterson
NOES: None
ABSENT: Dallas, Reimers
ABSTAIN: None

- | | |
|--|--|
| <p>3. DS 12-111
 Bill & Adriana Hayward
 SE Ocean & Carmelo
 Block M, Lot(s) 2 & 4</p> | <p>Consideration of Design Study (Concept & Final), Demolition Permit and Coastal Development Permit applications for the demolition of an existing residence and the construction of a new residence located in the Single Family Residential (R-1) District.</p> |
|--|--|

Marc Wiener, Associate Planner, presented the staff report. Chair Paterson opened the public hearing at 5:19 p.m. David Stocker appeared before the Commission. There being no other appearances, the public hearing was closed at 5:25 p.m.

Commissioner REIMERS moved **to approve the application with staff’s Special Condition #1 – The applicant shall provide an additional two lower canopy trees and work with staff on view considerations and two additional upper canopy trees as recommended by the City Forester; change #2 – The applicant shall reduce the width of the driveway to 12 feet and replace the eliminated portion of the driveway with landscaping. The applicant shall terrace the retaining wall on the south side of the garage to reduce its height work with staff on width of driveway to accommodate 2 parked vehicles; #3 and addition of #4 – work with staff on the primary west large window shall be brought closer into compliance with guidelines,** seconded by GOODHUE and **carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: LePage, Reimers, Goodhue, Paterson
 NOES: None
 ABSENT: Dallas
 ABSTAIN: None

- | | |
|--|---|
| <p>4. DS 13-8
 Carol Casey
 SE Carmelo & 9th
 Block P, Lot(s) 4</p> | <p>Consideration of Design Study and Coastal Development Permit applications for the alteration of an existing residence located in the Single Family Residential (R-1) District.</p> |
|--|---|

Commissioner Reimers re-cused herself from the discussion.

Marc Wiener, Associate Planner, presented the staff report. Chair Paterson opened the public hearing at 5:50 p.m. Brian Congleton, James Emery and Barbara Livingston appeared before the Commission. There being no other appearances, the public hearing was closed at 6:01 p.m.

Commissioner LEPAGE moved **to approve the design concept with staff’s Special Conditions #1 and #2 and #3- The proposed alteration of the sunroom is subject to the decision of the Planning Commission sunroom as submitted,** seconded by GOODHUE and **carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: LePage, Goodhue, Paterson
NOES: None
ABSENT: Dallas, Reimers
ABSTAIN: None

5. DS 13-7 Consideration of Design Study and Coastal
Carol Casey Development Permit applications for the
E/s Carmelo 2 S 9th alteration of an existing residence located in
Block P, Lot(s) 2 the Single Family Residential (R-1) District.

Commissioner Reimers re-cused herself from the discussion.

Marc Wiener, Associate Planner, presented the staff report. Chair Paterson opened the public hearing at 6:06 p.m. Brian Congleton appeared before the Commission. There being no other appearances, the public hearing was closed at 6:08 p.m.

Commissioner GOODHUE moved **to approve design concept as submitted**, seconded by LEPAGE and **carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: LePage, Goodhue, Paterson
NOES: None
ABSENT: Dallas, Reimers
ABSTAIN: None

6. DS 13-6 Consideration of Design Study (Concept) for
Noel Barnhurst/Suzanne Cushman the substantial alteration of an existing
W/s Lobos 2 S Valley Way residence located in the Single Family
Block 2, Lot(s) 1 Residential (R-1) District.

Marc Wiener, Associate Planner, presented the staff report. Chair Paterson opened the public hearing at 6:15 p.m. Eric Zavas and Barbara Livingston appeared before the Commission. There being no other appearances, the public hearing was closed at 6:20 p.m.

Commissioner LEPAGE **moved to continue the project with the following direction:**

- 1. reduce skylight size and specify glazing**
- 2. re-design entry**
- 3. screening on south-side deck for privacy issues**
- 4. work with staff on distance of deck from tree**
- 5. reduce height of ceiling in mechanical room.**

Seconded by GOODHUE and **carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: LePage, Reimers, Goodhue, Paterson
NOES: None
ABSENT: Dallas
ABSTAIN: None

7. UP 11-13
Richard Pepe
NE Dolores & 7th
Block 76, Lot(s) 22
- Review of a previously approved Use Permit allowing exterior seating at a restaurant located in the Central Commercial (CC) District.
(Little Napoli)

Commissioner Reimers re-cused herself from the discussion.
Commissioner Dallas joined the discussion via telephone.

Marc Wiener, Associate Planner, presented the staff report. Chair Paterson opened the public hearing at 6:36 p.m. Rich Pepe appeared before the Commission. After further discussion the public hearing was re-opened at 6:51 p.m. Barbara Livingston and Rich Pepe appeared before the Commission. There being no other appearances, the public hearing was closed at 7:00 p.m.

Commissioner LEPAGE moved **to approve the Use Permit for three tables with four seats per table for a maximum of 12 seats**, seconded by DALLAS and **carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: LePage, Dallas, Goodhue, Paterson
NOES: None
ABSENT: Reimers
ABSTAIN: None

9. MP 13-1
CMC 9.16
City-Wide
- Consideration of recommendations to the City Council regarding an ordinance reauthorizing Carmel Municipal Code Section 9.16 allowing live music where alcoholic beverages are sold and/or served.

Marc Wiener, Associate Planner, presented the staff report. Chair Paterson opened the public hearing at 7:02 p.m. There being no appearances, the public hearing was closed at 7:02 p.m.

Commissioner LEPAGE moved **to support staff's recommendation to remove 3-year renewal requirement for the ordinance and remove 3-year renewal requirement for individual Use Permits**, seconded by GOODHUE and **carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: LePage, Reimers, Goodhue, Paterson
NOES: None
ABSENT: Dallas
ABSTAIN: None

X. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business to come before the Commission, the meeting was adjourned at 7:15 p.m.

Leslie Fenton, Administrative Coordinator

ATTEST:

Keith Paterson