

CITY OF CARMEL  
FOREST AND BEACH COMMISSION-MINUTES  
REGULAR MEETING  
THURSDAY JULY 14, 2016

**CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL**

**COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT:** Karen Ferlito-Chair  
Jeff Baron  
Maggie Eaton

**COMMISSION MEMBERS ABSENT:** David Refuerzo

**STAFF PRESENT:** Rob Mullane, AICP, Public Works Director  
Mike Branson, City Forester  
Matt Feisthamel, Assistant City Forester  
Yvette Oblander, Admin. Coordinator/Commission Secretary  
Marc Wiener, Senior Planner

**TOUR OF INSPECTION**

The Commission visited the following sites:

1. East side of Torres St., 5 north of 4<sup>th</sup> Ave. - Application to remove seven oak trees on a vacant lot for construction of a new home.
2. Camino Real between 10<sup>th</sup> and 12<sup>th</sup>, San Antonio between 11<sup>th</sup> and 12<sup>th</sup> – to observe water conserving landscapes from the street.

**ROLL CALL**

Chair Ferlito called the meeting to order at 3:30 pm.

**PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

Members of the audience joined the Commission in the Pledge of Allegiance

**EXTRODINARY BUSINESS** Election of Vice Chair

Chair Ferlito moved to continue the election when Commissioner Refuerzo returns to next month's Forest and Beach Commission Meeting. Seconded by Commissioner Eaton and carried by the following roll call vote:

AYES: Baron, Eaton, Ferlito  
NOES: None  
ABSTAIN: None  
ABSENT: Refuerzo

**APPEARANCES**

1. Raymie Allard, Boardmember of Friends of Carmel Forest. Ms. Allard submitted a handout to the Commission, and noted that the Friends of Carmel Forest have planted 7 trees this month, 32 trees cumulatively, and 2 replacement trees this month. She also gave a recap of the July 9<sup>th</sup> tree tour with Dr. Matt Ritter.
2. Jennifer Atkinson, asked about the Dunes at Del Mar and the restrooms if they are serviced by the sewer system. Ms. Atkinson would like to maintain the health of the dunes ecosystem in the area.

**CONSENT AGENDA**

1. Consideration of the Minutes for the June 9, 2016, Regular Meeting  
 Commissioner Eaton noted that she would like to add an amendment to Item 6A and add, the amount of hardscape with respect to the trees and run-off. Chair Ferlito that it is so noted for the joint Planning Meeting.  
 Chair Ferlito added as a reminder that they would like to have information on the tree tagging and follow up.

Chair Ferlito moved to approve the minutes with the corrections as noted. Seconded by Commissioner Eaton, and carried by the following roll call vote:

AYES:           Eaton, Ferlito  
 NOES:           None  
 ABSTAIN:       Baron  
 ABSENT:        Refuerzo

**PUBLIC HEARING**

2. Consideration of an application to remove seven coast live oak trees (14", 6", 5", 5", 10", 2"), two of which are significant trees, on a vacant lot for construction of a new single-family home. This site is located on the east side of Torres Street, 5 parcels north of 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue. The applicant is the Bolton Design Group for the owner, Ms. Andrea Carr.

The staff recommends that the application be approved with the findings that are attached, and with the following 2 additional conditions:

1. That the Planning Commission allow the variances to the placement of the garage.
2. If the Planning Commission decides any significant changes that would require the removal of more significant trees, that the decision would come back to the Forest and Beach Commission. The Commission has the prerogative to go with that or to amend as they see fit.

Marc Weiner stated that this will certainly go to the Planning Commission and is not 100% sure that they would approve the garage.

Chair Ferlito opened the hearing to the public for comments:

1. Andrea Carr spoke of her requests to have the plans approved by the Forest and Beach Commission and the Planning Commission.
2. Michael Bolton, Designer of the property, spoke on behalf of his client and urged the Forest and Beach Commission to move forward with the approval of the application.
3. Erik Dyar, Architect representing Judy Thodos. Noted Ms. Thodos' concerns regarding placing the garage in the setbacks. She would like the Commission to consider her request to put the garage elsewhere.

Commissioner Eaton moved that the Commission approve the removal request that has been submitted by the applicant with the proviso that none of the remaining trees are encroached upon within the 6-foot root protection zone, and the rear oak tree #14 is to be substantially untouched (unpruned). Seconded by Commissioner Baron, and carried by the following roll call vote:

AYES: Eaton, Ferlito, Baron  
NOES: None  
ABSTAIN: None  
ABSENT: Refuerzo

### **ORDERS OF BUSINESS**

3. Receive a report on Beach Fire and Beach Commission's Enforcement from the Carmel Police Department.
  - Commander Tomasi was unavailable. No report was given
4. Receive an update on the Forest and Beach Commission's involvement in the Carmel Centennial parade and celebration activities.
  - Tom Brocado provided an overview and update on the Centennial Parade related activities .
5. Receive a presentation on the Surfrider Foundation's Ocean-Friendly Garden Program.
  - Remi Allard, Chair of Ocean Friendly Gardens Program. This is a non-profit grassroots organization dedicated to the protection of our oceans , waves, and beaches. The mission is to transform hardscapes and landscapes to prevent water pollution.
6. Verbal reports from the Centennial ad hoc committees
  - Commissioner Eaton reported that at this time there is nothing new to report on the City Holiday Tree.

### **REPORTS FROM STAFF AND COMMISSIONERS**

7. City Forester's Report

A. June-tree data

- 12 City Trees removed
- 5 Private removal permits
- 2 Construction Permits

Chair Ferlito asked that they get more information on how many replacement trees have been tagged . Mr. Branson noted that the information is under Private Planting Requirements.

B. Parks activities

Clean up of Forest Hill Park, has happened to give it a little sprucing up. A grant was given that they will work on this fall, to renovate the border around the playground with wood chips, and depending on financing maybe some repair on the DG around the perimeter. Kelley Green and Micahel Feher have been doing a lot of trail widening at Mission Trail in May and June. Cahir Ferlito stated the Animal Control Officer has been spending more time at Mission Trail and the beach.

C. Beach activities

Michael Tope , has been woking on the pathway improvements and cleaning up the dead plants, as well as cleaning up the beach.

D. Tree tagging report

Mr. Branson stated that the tree tagging report is almost ready, trying to get the wording right, and hope to have that ready for next month for the Commissioners to review.

E. Future agenda Items

Commissioner Eaton would like to propose that they form a 2 person ad hoc committee for when they meet with the Planning Commission. Cahir Ferlito stated that Mr. Mullane, Mr. Weiner, and Mr. Branson had gone over and set the Agenda, the information is in the Minutes of the July 2016 Meeting.

8. Public works Director's Report

A. Updates on City Council Items

Mr. Mullane provided a brief recap of 4 City Council items.

B. Other items of interest to the Commission

An advertisement is out to fill the vacant seat of Commissioner, that will close on July 20 , 2016, with the intent to have that to the City Council on August 2, 2016.

The Budget was finalized, the budget booklet should be realized in the next couple of weeks. If you would like a hard copy please see Leslie or Ashley and they will be able to provide you with the booklet.

The City is still in the appeal period for the Beach Fires Pilot Program Coastal Development Permit. To date, no appeals have been received, and the appeal period ends next Wednesday at 5:00 pm. The moratorium is in place until August 6 , 2016. As soon as Mr. Mullane has any additional information he will pass that along to the Commission.

Marc Weiner has been officially appointed the interim Director of Community Planning and Building.

iWorQ is up and running, and staff is getting acquainted with the new tracking system of it. The Environmental Compliance Manager recruitment will commence in the next few weeks. Human Resources Manager Maxine Gallo should have a plan of action by the end of the month on when other positions will be filled throughout the City.

9. Commissioner Announcements

No announcements at this time

**ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further business to come before the Commission, the meeting was adjourned at 6:21 p.m.

---

Yvette Oblander, Commissioner Secretary

ATTEST:

---

Karen Ferlito, Chair