

**CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA
PLANNING COMMISSION – MINUTES
APRIL 11, 2012**

I. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

Commissioner Beach announced her resignation from the Planning Commission due to being elected to the City Council.

PRESENT: Commission Members: Dallas, Paterson, Hillyard,
Reimers

STAFF PRESENT: Sean Conroy, Planning & Building Services Manager
Marc Wiener, Associate Planner
Leslie Fenton, Administrative Coordinator

II. TOUR OF INSPECTION

The Planning Commission toured the following sites: Beach boardwalk area, Boyse, Pot D’Or, Bell, Biesbroeck, Singleton, Scenic & Santa Lucia, City Hall.

III. ROLL CALL

IV. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Members of the audience joined Commission members in the pledge of allegiance.

V. ANNOUNCEMENTS/EXTRAORDINARY BUSINESS

Sean Conroy, Planning & Building Services Manager, announced the following:

1. Commissioner Beach resigned her position at the beginning of the meeting.
2. Commissioner Paterson will be the Vice-chair for the next three months.
3. Single-use carry-out bag ordinance and IS has been distributed for public comment period, which begins April 17, 2012. Will be on the May 9, 2012 agenda.

VI. APPEARANCES

Barbara Livingston appeared before the Commission.

VII. CONSENT AGENDA

1. Consideration of minutes from March 14, 2012, Regular Meeting.

- | | |
|---|---|
| <p>2. MP 12-5*
City of Carmel
Scenic Rd. bt. Santa Lucia &
Martin Way</p> | <p>Consideration of Design Study and Coastal
Development Permit applications for the
conversion of Scenic Road to a one-way
street from Santa Lucia Avenue to just past
Martin Way.</p> |
|---|---|

Commissioner REIMERS moved **to accept Consent Agenda item #1 as amended and item #2,** seconded by DALLAS and **carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: Dallas, Reimers, Paterson, Hillyard
 NOES: None
 ABSENT: None
 ABSTAIN: None

VIII. CONSENT AGENDA (PULLED ITEMS)

None

IX. PUBLIC HEARINGS

- | | |
|---|---|
| <p>1. MP 12-6
City of Carmel
E/s Monte Verde bt. Ocean &
7th
Block 76, Lot(s) 12,14,16</p> | <p>Consideration of a Design Study
application for renovations to the City Hall
garden located in the Residential and
Limited Commercial (RC) District.</p> |
|---|---|

Sean Conroy, Planning & Building Services Manger, presented the staff report. Chair Hillyard opened the public hearing at 4:08 p.m. Sarah Brown, Michelle Comeau and Barbara Livingston appeared before the Commission. There being no other appearances, the public hearing was closed at 4:22 p.m.

Commissioner DALLAS moved **to approve the application with staff's Special Conditions and to forward to the City Council comments regarding the scale and material of the railings,** seconded by PATERSON and **carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: Dallas, Reimers, Paterson, Hillyard
 NOES: None
 ABSENT: None
 ABSTAIN: None

The public hearing was re-opened at 4:25. Sarah Brown and Roberta Miller appeared before the Commission. There being no other appearances, the public hearing was closed at 4:26 p.m.

- | | |
|--|--|
| 2. DS 12-15
Singleton TR
San Antonio 4 SE 11 th
Block X, Lot(s) 12 | Consideration of Design Study (Final), Use Permit, Demolition Permit and Coastal Development Permit applications for the construction of a new residence located in the Single Family Residential (R-1) and Beach and Riparian Overlay (BR) Districts. |
|--|--|

Marc Wiener, Associate Planner, presented the staff report. Chair Hillyard opened the public hearing at 4:34 p.m. Craig Holdren, Jim Finnegan, Michelle Comeau, Roberta Miller and Barbara Livingston appeared before the Commission. There being no other appearances, the public hearing was closed at 4:59 p.m.

Commissioner REIMERS moved to **approve the application with staff's Special Condition #1; change to #2 – the applicant shall either withdraw the proposed encroachment or apply for an encroachment permit for the proposed walkway on City property; change to #3 – the applicant and neighbors shall work with staff and the City Forester on reviewing options for planting additional trees on the property, while being considerate of the neighboring views; #4; #5; addition of #6 – lower south chimney 2' or more if possible; and addition of #7 – work with City Forester to protect Cypress trees during construction**, seconded by PATERSON and **carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: Dallas, Reimers, Paterson, Hillyard
NOES: None
ABSENT: None
ABSTAIN: None

- | | |
|--|---|
| 3. DS 12-23
Pot D'Or, LLC
NW Lincoln & 5 th
Block 53, Lot(s) 17 & 19 | Consideration of Design Study (Concept), Demolition Permit, Use Permit and Coastal Development Permit applications for the construction of a new residence located in the Single Family Residential (R-1) District and a lot line adjustment. |
|--|---|

Marc Wiener, Associate Planner, presented the staff report. Chair Hillyard opened the public hearing at 5:16 p.m. Chris Tescher and Jacqueline Simonelli appeared before the Commission. There being no other appearances, the public hearing was closed at 5:21 p.m.

Commissioner DALLAS moved **to approve the lot line adjustment from east – west to north-south with staff’s Special Conditions**, seconded by PATERSON and **carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: Dallas, Reimers, Paterson, Hillyard
NOES: None
ABSENT: None
ABSTAIN: None

The public hearing was re-opened at 5:22 p.m. Chris Tescher appeared before the Commission. There being no other appearances, the public hearing was closed at 5:32 p.m.

Commissioner PATERSON moved **to accept the design concept application and have applicant work with staff on reducing the height of the building**, seconded by DALLAS and **carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: Dallas, Reimers, Paterson, Hillyard
NOES: None
ABSENT: None
ABSTAIN: None

- | | |
|--|--|
| 4. DS 12-24
Pot D’Or, LLC
5 th Ave. 2 NW of Lincoln
Block 53, Lot(s) 17 & 19 | Consideration of Design Study (Concept),
Demolition Permit and Coastal
Development Permit applications for the
construction of a new residence located in
the Single Family Residential (R-1)
District. |
|--|--|

Marc Wiener, Associate Planner, presented the staff report. Chair Hillyard opened the public hearing at 4:46 p.m. Chris Tescher, Jacqueline Simonelli, Tim Comstock, Steve Brooks and Mr. O’Connell appeared before the Commission. There being no other appearances, the public hearing was closed at 6:12 p.m.

Commissioner PATERSON moved **to continue the application and have applicant work with staff and neighbor to address 2nd story privacy issues**, seconded by REIMERS and **carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: Dallas, Reimers, Paterson, Hillyard
NOES: None
ABSENT: None
ABSTAIN: None

- | | |
|---|--|
| <p>5. DS 12-22
 Brian & Stephanie Boyse
 E/s San Antonio 6 N Ocean
 Block HH, Lot(s) 18</p> | <p>Consideration of Design Study (Concept) and Coastal Development Permit applications for the substantial alteration of an existing residence located in the Single Family Residential (R-1), Beach and Riparian Overlay (BR), Park Overlay (P) and Archaeological Significance Overlay (AS) Districts.</p> |
|---|--|

Marc Wiener, Associate Planner, presented the staff report. Chair Hillyard opened the public hearing at 6:24 p.m. Tom Meaney, Barbara Livingston, Steve Brooks and Angus Jeffers appeared before the Commission. There being no other appearances, the public hearing was closed at 6:41 p.m.

Commissioner REIMERS moved **to continue the application with staff's Special Condition #1; change to #2 – the applicant shall include a note on the plans that exploratory hand digging around the pine tree is required prior to excavating the driveway before returning to the next meeting applicant shall dig around the tree and review findings with City Forester; addition of #3 – submit a street view drawing of the fence; addition of #4 – applicant shall work with neighbor on privacy issue; and addition of #5 – applicant shall comply with site coverage allowance**, seconded by PATERSON and **carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: Dallas, Reimers, Paterson, Hillyard
 NOES: None
 ABSENT: None
 ABSTAIN: None

- | | |
|--|---|
| <p>6. DR 12-7
 James & Catherine Bell
 Mission 3 NE 8th
 Block 89, Lot(s) 14 & 16</p> | <p>Consideration of a Preliminary Design Concept for the construction of a new residence located in the Residential and Limited Commercial (RC) District.</p> |
|--|---|

Commissioner Reimers re-cused herself from the discussion.

Marc Wiener, Associate Planner, presented the staff report. Chair Hillyard opened the public hearing at 6:54 p.m. Richard Barrett and James Bell appeared before the Commission. There being no other appearances, the public hearing was closed at 7:03 p.m.

There was no motion needed for this item.

- | | |
|---|---|
| 7. DS 12-21
Robert & Lucille Biesbroeck
W/s Crespi 3 N Flanders
Block 103, Lot(s) 27 | Consideration of a Design Study application for a new fence, arbor and driveway chain for a property located in the Single Family Residential (R-1) District. |
|---|---|

Chair Hillyard re-cused himself from the discussion.

Sean Conroy, Planning & Building Services Manager, presented the staff report. Vice-chair Paterson opened the public hearing at 7:14 p.m. Lucille Biesbroeck appeared before the Commission. There being no other appearances, the public hearing was closed at 7:16 p.m.

Commissioner REIMERS moved **to authorize the arbor and fence across the entire property with a gate for the driveway entrance, no chain shall be used.** seconded by DALLAS and **carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: Dallas, Reimers, Paterson
 NOES: None
 ABSENT: Hillyard
 ABSTAIN: None

- | | |
|---|--|
| 8. MP 12-4*
City of Carmel
W/s San Antonio bt. Ocean &
4 th | Consideration of Design Study and Coastal Development Permit applications for the construction of a pedestrian pathway on the west side of San Antonio Avenue between Ocean and Fourth Avenues and conceptual review of a board walk and viewing platform located just west of the Del Mar Parking area. |
|---|--|

Sean Conroy, Planning & Building Services Manager, presented the staff report. Chair Hillyard opened the public hearing at 7:27 p.m. There being no appearances, the public hearing was closed at 7:27 p.m.

Commissioner REIMERS moved **to accept plan as designed with staff's Special Conditions and Findings and if possible to move retaining wall at San Antonio & 4th further west.** seconded by DALLAS and **carried** by the following roll call vote:

AYES: Dallas, Reimers, Paterson, Hillyard
 NOES: None
 ABSENT: None
 ABSTAIN: None

