

**CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA
FOREST AND BEACH COMMISSION
MEETING AGENDA
Thursday, June 9, 2016
Regular Meeting – 3:30 p.m.**

City Hall, Council Chambers
East side of Monte Verde St. between Ocean & 7th Avenues
Carmel, California

CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

COMMISSION MEMBERS: KAREN FERLITO – CHAIR
 KATHY BANG – VICE CHAIR
 DAVID REFUERZO
 JEFF BARON
 MAGGIE EATON

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

APPEARANCES

Thank you for attending the meeting. Anyone wishing to address the Commission on matters not on the agenda, but within the jurisdiction of the Commission, may do so now. Please state the matter on which you wish to speak. Matters not appearing on the Commission’s agenda will not receive action at this meeting but may be referred to staff for a future meeting. Presentations will be limited to three minutes, or as established by the Commission. Persons are not required to give their name or address, but it is helpful for speakers to state their name in order that the Secretary may identify them.

CONSENT AGENDA

1. Consideration of the Minutes for the May 12, 2016 Meeting

ORDERS OF BUSINESS

2. Friends of Carmel Forest report on the Centennial Tree Planting Program
3. Update on finalization of 2014 Shoreline Assessment by Coastal Biologist David Shonman
4. Presentation on the status of the shoreline structures on Carmel Beach by Engineering Geologist Greg Easton
5. Update on Landscape Renovation Plan for Scenic Road by Landscape Architect Scott Hall
6. Discussion of issues to address at a joint meeting with the Planning Commission

REPORTS FROM STAFF AND COMMISSIONERS

7. City Forester's Report
 - A. May tree data
 - B. Parks activities
 - C. Beach activities
 - D. Future agenda items

8. Public Works Director's Report
 - A. Updates on City Council Items
 - B. Other Items of Interest to the Commission

9. Commissioner Announcements

ADJOURNMENT

Any writings or documents provided to a majority of the Forest and Beach Commission regarding any item on this agenda will be made available for public inspection in the Planning and Building Department located at City Hall, on Monte Verde between Ocean and 7th Avenues during normal business hours.

The next meeting of the Forest and Beach Commission will be:

Regular Meeting – July 14, 2016
Tour of Inspection – as required
3:30 p.m. – Regular Agenda

The City of Carmel-by-the-Sea does not discriminate against persons with disabilities. The City of Carmel-by-the-Sea Telecommunication's Device for the Deaf /Speech Impaired (TDD) number is 1-800-735-2929.

AFFIDAVIT OF POSTING

I, Mike Branson, City Forester, for the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea, DO HEREBY CERTIFY, under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California, that the foregoing notice was posted at the Carmel-by-the-Sea City Hall bulletin board, at the Harrison Memorial Library on Ocean and Lincoln Avenues, the Carmel Post Office, and distributed to members of the media on June 3, 2016.

Dated this 3rd day of June 2016 at the hour of 4:00 p.m.



Mike Branson
City Forester

**CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA
FOREST AND BEACH COMMISSION – MINUTES
REGULAR MEETING
THURSDAY, MAY 12, 2016**

CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT: Karen Ferlito – Chair
Kathy Bang –Vice Chair
David Refuerzo
Jeff Baron

Commission Members Absent: Maggie Eaton

STAFF PRESENT: Rob Mullane, AICP, Public Works Director
Mike Branson, City Forester
Matt Feisthamel, Assistant City Forester

TOUR OF INSPECTION

The Forest and Beach Commission visited the following sites:

1. E/Carmelo St., 2 south of 12th Ave. – Application to remove a public Monterey pine tree.
2. Forest Theater – review work and look at new tree plantings

ROLL CALL

Chair Ferlito called the meeting to order at 3:30 pm.

PLEDGE OF ALLIGIANCE

Members of the audience joined the Commission in the Pledge of Allegiance.

APPEARANCES

No appearances

CONSENT AGENDA

1. Consideration of the Minutes for the March 17, 2016 Regular Meeting.
2. Consideration of the minutes for the April 14, 2016 Regular Meeting.

Chair Ferlito noted a spelling error on page 4 of the April 14th minutes. Staff noted the spelling would be corrected. Another minor addition was noted for page 2 of the March 17th minutes. For Item #2, condition #1, the responsible party is the applicant. Staff will make that revision as well.

The minutes for both meetings were adopted by consensus of the Commission via voice vote.

PUBLIC HEARING

3. Consideration of an application to remove a 35" diameter Monterey pine on public property due to safety concerns. The site is located on the east side of Carmelo Street, 2 south of 12th Avenue. Fe St. The applicant is Mr. Eugene Hughes. The tree in on the City right-of-way.

Assistant City Forester Matt Feisthamel presented the staff report. Chair Ferlito opened the public hearing at 3:43 p.m. A comment via email from Susanne Pereira in support of the removal request was distributed to the Commission.

Speaker #1: Mr. Eugene Hughes, applicant, appeared before the Commission and presented his concerns and why he is requesting removal of the tree. His primary reasons are damage to the driveway, proximity to the power lines, and consequences if the tree falls. There being no other appearances, the public hearing was closed at 3:47 p.m.

Commissioner Refuerzo commented that the tree looks healthy and appears not to be an immediate danger. He concurred with the staff recommendation to retain the tree. Commissioner Baron noted that the tree appeared healthy and that the driveway issues may be easily resolved by lifting the pavers and removing some sand. Vice Chair Bang agreed with the previous comments and noted that the City policy is to keep healthy trees but some pruning may be in order. Chair Ferlito also addressed the repair to the paver driveway.

Mr. Branson concurred that some additional pruning could be done.

Vice Chair Bang moved to preserve the tree (deny the application) and ask PG&E to do additional pruning, seconded by Commissioner Refuerzo and carried by the following roll call vote:

AYES:	Bang, Refuerzo, Baron, Ferlito
NOES:	None
ABSTAIN:	None
Absent	Eaton

ORDERS OF BUSINESS

4. Verbal report from the Centennial ad hoc committees.

Scenic Road Pathway Landscaping Project Subcommittee:

Commissioner Baron noted that a meeting is planned for early June with the ad hoc committee, staff and landscape architect Scott Hall.

Holiday Tree Project Subcommittee:

Commissioner Refuerzo reported the holiday tree PowerPoint is posted on the City web site and that the item should go to the City Council in June or July.

5. Verbal follow up report on Arbor Day 2016 from the Arbor Day ad hoc committee.

Commissioner Baron was pleased overall with the attendance and having representatives from the Friends of Carmel Forest, The Friends of Mission Trail Nature Preserve, and the Girl Scouts helping out. He would like to see more attendance from the residents of Carmel at the event. Commissioner Bang commented that it was very nice to see the positive results of the 2015 Arbor Day event in the park. Chair Ferlito was also pleased with the attendance and the preparation by staff. She was also very appreciative of the collaboration with Carmel Heritage to have the First Murphy House open during the event and to have Rob Mullane and Chip Rerig, and family, participate.

REPORTS FOR STAFF AND COMMISSIONERS

6. City Forester's Report

A. April tree data

- 9 City trees removed
- 19 Private removal permits
- 2 Private pruning permits
- 3 Construction permits

Staff will include standard conditions of approval in written and oral agenda staff reports, begin to incorporate permit management into iWorQ, and do timely inspections for tree replacement compliance.

B. Parks activities

- a. City Council authorized contract for Mission Trail Nature preserve entrance project.
- b. Planning Commission approved a Coastal Development Permit for maintenance work in the Preserve. Now in appeal period until the end of the month.

C. Beach Activities

- a. Several areas pruned and weeded by staff along the pathway.
- b. Fire limit delineators will be placed soon.
- c. Remove orange bollards and safety tape at pathway repair site near 10th Ave.
- d. Surfabout is this coming weekend.

D. Storm Update – None.

E. Tree Tagging Update

- a. Revising permit to have replanting information more prominent on the form.

F. Future Agenda Items

- a. Waterwise gardening presentation.
- b. Replacement tree process improvements.
- c. Water quality report on storm water going to Carmel Bay.

7. Public Works Director's Report

A. Updates on City Council items

- a. Carrie Theis was appointed as Mayor Pro Tem.
- b. City Council read a proclamation in support of Public Works Week in May. There will be a BBQ for staff also in May.

- c. City Council is accepting applicants for the Council vacancy with an appointment set for June 1st.
- d. City Council authorized \$48,000 for centennial parade floats.
- e. City council voted in support of the proposed TAMC sales tax increase for transportation improvements. This will be on the November ballot.
- f. Two Forest Theater use agreements were discussed.
- g. Two fee waivers were approved for the Concours on the Avenue and the Concours D' Elegance.

B. Other Items of Interest to the Commission

- a. Carmel Beach fires will be on the June 6th City Council meeting. A letter from the California Coastal Commission has been received and will be distributed to the Forest and Beach Commissioners
- b. The Holiday tree item is going to be on the June 7th City Council meeting. (Follow-up note on 6/2/16: It is actually on the June 6th agenda.)
- c. Staff, volunteers, and contractors are working on cleanup of road medians and mini parks around the city.
- d. A sidewalk and road repair project on Ocean Ave. and Monte Verde St. has begun.
- e. 1.2 million dollar road resurfacing project will begin towards the end of May.
- f. Staff with Maria Sutherland from the Friends of Carmel Forest to discuss their tree planting program.
- g. iWorQ should be on-line for the Public Works Department very soon to help with the management of tree permits and service requests.

8. Commissioner Announcements

Commissioner Refuerzo announced that he will be absent from the July meeting. Commissioner Ferlito announced there is a weed pull in Mission trail Nature Preserve on Saturday which will also include lunch and there is a CRA beach cleanup on Saturday, May 21st.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business to come before the Commission, the meeting was adjourned at 5:03 p.m.

Yvette Oblander, Commission Secretary

ATTEST:

Karen Ferlito, Chair



CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA
Forest and Beach Commission Report

June 9, 2016

To: Chair Ferlito and Forest & Beach Commissioners
From: Matt Feisthamel, Assistant City Forester
Subject: Friends of Carmel Forest report on their Centennial Tree Planting Program

The Friends of Carmel Forest decided to celebrate the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea 100 year anniversary and plant 100 trees in 2016. A representative of the group will present an update on the planting data, which will include the number of trees planted and pending tree plantings.

Attachment 1 – FOCF centennial tree planting spreadsheet.

#	side	street	cross street	species	star value	planted	size (gall)	picture	water list	sponsor	note
18	Med	Junipero	10' S of 11th	P	3	2/1	1	5/2	1/1	Willey	City planted & waters
1	W	Dolores	2S of 5th	C		2/9	5	4/17	3/21	Quintanilla	
2	W	Junipero	SW cor of 8th	P	3	2/9	5	4/17	3/21	Allard	
4	W	San Carlos	1S of 8th	P	3	3/20	5	4/17	3/21	Burnett	
5	S	7th	SW cor Junipero	O	2	3/20	15	4/17	3/21	Beach	
8	W	Junipero	NW cor at 3rd	O	3	3/20	5	4/11	3/21		
9	W	Mission	NW cor at 3rd	O	2	3/20	15	4/11	3/21	West	
10	S	5th	SE cor Monte Verde	P		3/20	5	4/11	3/21		
11	W	Dolores	NW cor at 5th	O	3	3/20	5	5/2	3/21	Buckminster	
12	S	5th	SW cor Dolores	C	2	3/20	5	4/17	3/21	Diamond	
6	E	Torres	NE cor 4th	O	2	4/17	5	4/17	4/22		
13	W	Sante Fe	50 " N Mt View	P	3	4/17	5	4/17	4/22		
14	N	1st	NW cor at Guadalupe	P	3	4/17	5	5/2	4/22		
15	S	1st	SE cor at Guadalupe	P	2	4/17	5	4/17	4/22	Smith	
16	S	1st	40' E of Lobos	P	2	4/17	5	4/17	4/22		
35	E	Monterey	NE cor 3rd	C	NA	4/17	5	4/17	4/22		street in City limits
36	S	1st	50' W of Lobos	C	NA	4/17	5	4/17	4/22		
17	W	San Carlos	SW cor 10th	C	3	5/15	5	5/15	5/19	Hess	never submitted to Mike
20	E	Monte Verde	20' S of Ocean	C	3	5/15	5	5/15	5/19	Beach 2	
24	W	San Carlos	NW cor at 11th	P		5/15	5	5/15	5/19		
25	S	11th	1 W of Mission	P	4	5/15	5	5/15	5/19		

#	side	street	cross street	species	star value	planted	size (gal)	picture	water list	sponsor	note
28	W	Carmelo	2N of 7th	P		5/15	5	5/15	5/19		
32	W	San Carlos	50' North of 10th	P	NA	5/15	5	5/15	5/19		
40	W	scenic	1 S of 8th	C	3	5/15	5	5/15	5/19		
41	W	scenic	3 S 8th	C	3	5/15	5	5/15	5/19	Eaton	
23	S	10th	1 W of Mission	P		pc	15	pc		Scott	
26	N	Ocean	100E of Cassanova	C		pc	5	pc		Dunaway	Is pine OK Peter?
30	E	Mission	between 7th & 8th	P ?		pc	15	pc			Carriage House
7	W	Guadalupe	NW cor at 1st	P	2	pc	15	pc		Armstrong	
3			Forest Park	O		pc	15	pc		Burnett 2	
19	N	Ocean Ave	NW cor Lincoln	P	5						library (stump removal)
21	W	Lincoln	6S 9th	P	2						
22	W	Lincoln	80' NW of 7th	mb	4					Sanders	Wayfarer church (stump)
27	med	Ocean	100' E of Mission	P	4					Livingston	stump
29	W	Lincoln	4S 9th	P	3						
31	E	Lincoln	3N 10th	O	2						
33	W	Dolores	90' S of 10th	?	NA	site te rejected	5/15				underground stump roots
34	mb									Brodslley	location needed
37	mb									Brodslley	location needed
38	mb									Talmadge	location needed
39	S	8th	SE cor scenic	C	5						prop line
40	mb									Sutherland	location needed



CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA
Forest and Beach Commission Report

June 9, 2016

To: Chair Ferlito and Forest & Beach Commissioners

From: Matt Feisthamel, Assistant City Forester

Subject: Report on the 2015-2016 Shoreline Assessment

Coastal Biologist David Shonman was retained by the City of Carmel-by-the Sea to evaluate, assess, and make recommendations on the various components that comprise the Carmel shoreline. Mr. Shonman's observations and recommendations were compiled in the fall of 2014 in the 2014 Shoreline Assessment report. The 2014 Shoreline Assessment, which was previously (in 2015) distributed to and discussed by the Commission, addresses the slopes, bluffs, storm water outfalls, shoreline walls, stairs, ramps, and pathway.

Mr. Shonman is in the process of finalizing the report to include recent progress by the City on addressing areas and issues needing attention. The final report will also include recommendations for additional or ongoing maintenance and repair needs as well as ongoing or future management actions. Mr. Shonman will present this update to allow for comments and input by the Commission prior to finalizing the report.



CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA
Forest and Beach Commission Report

June 9, 2016

To: Chair Ferlito and Forest & Beach Commissioners
From: Matt Feisthamel, Assistant City Forester
Subject: Presentation on the status of shoreline structures on Carmel Beach

The City retained Coastal geologist Greg Easton of Easton Geology to conduct an assessment of the structural integrity of Carmel's shoreline structures, stairways, storm-water outfalls, retaining walls, and revetments. Mr. Easton's assessment was completed over multiple site visits this past fall and winter. In general, the assessment notes that the City's shoreline structures are in relatively good shape. A few areas for minor shoring up were noted, and some of these areas were addressed by City Public Works staff this winter.

Mr. Easton will present a summary of his findings regarding the analysis of Carmel's shoreline structures.



CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA
Forest and Beach Commission Report

June 9, 2016

To: Chair Ferlito and Forest & Beach Commissioners
From: Matt Feisthamel, Assistant City Forester
Subject: Update on the Landscape renovation Plan for the Scenic Road Pathway.

The City of Carmel-by-the-Sea retained Scott Hall of Hall Landscape Design to provide a plan to renovate five identified areas along the Scenic pathway.

The landscape design will include irrigation, plant material, pathway renovation and updated digitized map files. This plan will be used as a model for future landscape renovations along the Scenic walkway, and funding for this work is included as a Capital Improvement Program project for Fiscal Year 2016-17. Mr. Hall will present an update of his work to date.



CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA
Forest and Beach Commission Report

June 9, 2016

To: Chair Ferlito and Forest & Beach Commissioners

From: Matt Feisthamel, Assistant City Forester

Subject: Discussion of issues to be addressed at joint meeting with the Planning Commission.

Chair Ferlito has requested a joint meeting between the Forest and Beach Commission and the Planning Commission in order to collaborate on ways trees can be protected during the construction and remodeling of homes. Conflicts with trees can occur during the planning and building of homes in Carmel-by-the-Sea. Policies and practices to protect trees will be discussed between the two commissions.

Commissioners should discuss and refine the issues that they would like included on the agenda for the joint meeting. The joint meeting is tentatively planned for mid- to late-July, and the Commission should also discuss potential dates and times that work for this meeting.

City Trees Removed (upper/lower)		MAY	YTD	2015	City Trees Planted (upper/lower)			MAY	YTD	2015
		18(15/3)	97(85/12)	162				0(0/0)	27(13/14)	123
Vista Lobos	7(16", 12", 9", 8", 6", 15", 10")									
e/ Junipero bet 8 & 9	10" oak									
ne Corner of Ocena Ave. and Lincoln St.	33" Monterey pine									
Forest Theater	30", 17" Monterey pines									
se corner Monte Verde & 4th	9" Monterey cypress									
s/ 10th bet. Lincoln & Monte Verde	10" Monterey cypress									
w/ Lincoln bet. Ocean & 7th	38" Monterey pine									
w/ Monterey bet. 1st & 2nd	19" oak									
e/ Camino Real bet 7th & 8th	4" Monterey pine									
w/ Junipero bet. 7th & 8th	3" Monterey pine									
w/ Monte Verde bet. 4th & 5th	18" oak									

r = replace of recently planted tree

Private Removal Permits (upper/lower)		7(4/4)	52(42/21)	119	Private Planting Requirements	
nw corner of 12th & Dolores	24" coast redwood				5 gal. upper canopy	
w/ Carmelo bet. 11th & 12th	20" Monterey pine				5 gal. upper canopy	
ne corner of Dolores & Ocean	7" Liquidambar					
e/ Camino Real bet 4th & Jane Powers	18" Monterey pine					
e/ Casanova bet. 4th & Ocean	45" Monterey pine				existing pine seedling nearby	
n/ 6th Bet Santa Rita and Santa Fe	10" oak				15 gal. lower canopy	
e/ Monte Verde bet. 12th & 13th	16", 17" oaks				15 gal. lower canopy	

5(3/2)	32(16/11)	42
--------	-----------	----

Construction Permits (remove/prune)		5(5/3)	12(11/5)	15
sw corner of Linciln & 11th	20" black acacia			
ne corner of Forest & 7th	4" AZ cypress, 9", 10", 12" acacias; pruning			
w/ Camino Real bet. 8th & 9th	6" holly; pruning			
w/ Mission bet Alta & Vista	10" oak; pruning			
ne corner of San Antonio & 10th	20" Atlas cedar			

Construction Planting Requirements	
24" box coast live oak	

1(0/1)	5(2/3)	8
--------	--------	---

Private Pruning Permits			2	24
-------------------------	--	--	---	----

Trees Under Care	
City watered	213
City irrigated	22

City Pruning by contractors				
level I - total tree		1	5	36
level II - hazard /emergency		1	1	9
level III - specific purpose		0	0	9

Construction Finals		Planted
---------------------	--	---------

Contracts
Stump grinding contract with John Ley's Tree Service for 96 stumps