



# CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA CITY COUNCIL Staff Report

January 8, 2024  
STUDY SESSION

<b>TO:</b>	Honorable Mayor and City Council Members
<b>SUBMITTED BY:</b>	Dave Potter, Mayor
<b>APPROVED BY:</b>	Chip Rerig, City Administrator
<b>SUBJECT:</b>	Discussion of the Ad Hoc Committee findings and recommendations on the way forward for development of the Police facility

## RECOMMENDATION:

### Summary Recommendations:

1. Receive a presentation from the Ad Hoc Committee regarding their research into the maintenance conditions and operational needs of the Police/Public Works building and their recommendations for moving forward.
2. After analysis of current police department facility requirements and standards, the Ad Hoc Committee recommends that the Police component of the project be scoped to meet today's standards as required by California Peace Officer Standards and Training (POST) and recommended by the International Police Chief's Association.
3. After reviewing potential siting options, the Ad Hoc Committee recommends that the initial siting of the new police department facility be designated as Vista Lobos Park for development of project schematic drawings, concept designs and environmental evaluation.
4. The Committee recommends that this concept design effort be immediately initiated, and staff directed to return with a description of the design effort process and the concept for public participation in the process.
5. The Ad Hoc Committee further recommends that the Staff be instructed to simultaneously initiate programming for PW and other City high priorities to determine the future use/function of the current location and its rehabilitation/concept design.
6. Additionally, the Committee recommends that Council direct staff to develop a financing strategy that could support construction of a Police Facility on a new City-owned site and the refurbishment and reprogramming of the existing PD/PW building complex to support the long-term needs of Public Works and potentially other City functions.
7. Provide any further policy guidance.

## BACKGROUND/SUMMARY:

### FINDINGS and RECOMMENDATIONS

After several months of investigation, consultant work, and Ad Hoc committee meetings, discussions and analysis, the Ad Hoc Committee of Mayor Potter and Councilmember Baron forward the following findings and recommendations for moving the very urgently needed Police Station project forward:

### Summary Findings:

1. The current PD/PW facilities' conditions demand that the building be completely rehabilitated as soon as is possible.
2. The City should build a new Police facility that meets today's standards for programmatic functions and is designed for a 50-year life.
3. The current site is too small to simultaneously accommodate the Police Department programs required under today's standards and the Public Works Department

standards and the Public Works Department.

4. City owned sites that are large enough to meet the PD facility space requirements are the current site, Sunset Center Parking lot and Vista Lobos Park.
5. An initial review of opportunities and constraints of these sites and the cost of constructing “swing space” for PD and PW if the current site were chosen, led to the committee selection of Vista Lobos Park for initial detailed evaluation.
6. The concept designs developed for the Vista Lobos site would include exploration of the mixed-use potential of the site.
7. The urgency of the rehabilitation of the existing PD/PW shared building suggests that a parallel effort of programming the existing site for long term occupancy by PW as well as developing a facility program for the City’s highest priority new facilities. This program could potentially be workforce housing, co-location of Planning with PW to create a permit center or some other priority city facility needs. The existing facility cannot be left “as is” after vacation of the PD.
8. The total budget for the required projects (New police facility and rehabilitation and reuse of current site) would probably exceed \$30+ M.

### **Summary Recommendations:**

1. Receive a presentation from the Ad Hoc Committee regarding their research into the maintenance conditions and operational needs of the Police/Public Works building and their recommendations for moving forward.
2. After analysis of current police department facility requirements and standards, the Ad Hoc Committee recommends that the Police component of the project be scoped to meet today’s standards as required by California Peace Officer Standards and Training (POST) and recommended by the International Police Chief’s Association.
3. After reviewing potential siting options, the Ad Hoc Committee recommends that the initial siting of the new police department facility be designated as Vista Lobos Park for development of project schematic drawings, concept designs and environmental evaluation.
4. The Committee recommends that this concept design effort be immediately initiated, and staff directed to return with a description of the design effort process and the concept for public participation in the process.
5. The Ad Hoc Committee further recommends that the Staff be instructed to simultaneously initiate programming for PW and other City high priorities to determine the future use/function of the current location and its rehabilitation/concept design.
6. Additionally, the Committee recommends that Council direct staff to develop a financing strategy that could support construction of a Police Facility on a new City-owned site and the refurbishment and reprogramming of the existing PD/PW building complex to support the long-term needs of Public Works and potentially other City functions.
7. Provide any further policy guidance.

### **Bottom Lines Up Front:**

1. Due to the building’s age, heavy usage, and deferred maintenance, the building systems, such as the electrical, mechanical, HVAC, and plumbing systems, are worn out and need total replacement.
2. Due to the adoption of current building, fire, seismic codes, and police facility standards, the building and the site will require major improvements to meet current disabled access, fire, seismic, electrical, mechanical, and building codes compliance.
3. The cost of building a brand-new Police building with appropriate programmatic functionality on a City-owned site will be in the \$20+M range depending on the site difficulty and included police program.
4. The estimated cost to bring the existing building into acceptable functionality for a non-police occupancy is approximately \$10.9 M. This number does not include any building expansion to support other high priority City needs. A more precise budget number cannot be developed until there is a better understanding of the programs the City Council would like to see hosted on the site.
5. None of the above options include the cost of providing swing space for the PD and PW functions if the existing building must be vacated during the construction period.

### **Background**

In June 2023, Council awarded a Professional Services Agreement with Indigo/ Hammond+Playle Architects (Indigo) for \$300,000 to provide the following services:

1. Condition assessment report
2. Space programming report
3. Two design schematics
4. Final Report with cost estimates and schedules

To date, Indigo has substantially completed the first two reports which have been checked by staff and discussed with the Ad Hoc Committee. Indigo will complete these two reports and initiate concept design work based on the guidance received from Council. An execution schedule will also be developed after that guidance is received. This report summarizes these two reports and outlines decision points for Council that are necessary to move the project forward.

### **Condition Assessment**

The Indigo Condition Assessment Report addressing the existing Police Building conditions was based on as-built plans provided by the City, on-site visual inspections by Indigo and each of their subconsultants in the key building disciplines, and interviews with City Staff familiar with the building and its problems. The portion of the building occupied by the Public Works Department and the adjoining Garage space had been previously assessed by the Bureau Veritas's Assessment Report, dated March 2023, under a separate Capital Improvement Project. The Condition Assessment Report for the Police Building is still in draft form pending guidance from the City Council.

The Indigo conditions assessment addressed the physical problems and code deficiencies of the existing Police Department building. The building and its major systems are far more deteriorated than was initially anticipated. The building is over 50 years old and is in such poor condition that it is no longer suitable for occupancy by any City department. It suffers from years of heavy use and deferred maintenance. It has never undergone a major remodel to bring it up to current codes or current Police operational requirements. The building requires major repairs, upgrades, and/or replacement of all building systems.

The assessment report findings point to the URGENT need for the City to either move towards a complete and thorough renovation of the existing Police facility at the existing site or the construction of a new facility at a different site. The continued "band aid" approach, or doing nothing, are not viable approaches from an officer safety or public safety perspective.

The existing PD building and the PW Garage have some good, salvageable "structural bones." However, to make the Police Building usable, the building will likely need to be gutted down to its structural frame and rebuilt. Whether it is wiser to rebuild on the existing bones or demolish the existing buildings and start over with a new building on the existing site, will not be quantifiable until all phases of this study are completed.

Based on Indigo's current findings, the high-level, estimated budget-level cost of renovating the existing Police Building for generic City office use would be \$1,175 per sq. ft. or \$10.9 million total cost, assuming no expansion. The estimated budget level cost for renovating the Public Works Garage roof will be \$73 per sq. ft. or \$0.9 million total cost. Currently, the average construction cost for building a new Police Station is on the order of \$1,200 per sq. ft.

Carmel-by-the-Sea requires a new or totally renovated and expanded Police Station as soon as possible due to multiple functional, safety and code deficiencies, as summarized above but will be enumerated in detail in the final Indigo Condition Assessment Report. Additionally, the existing PD/PW building cannot be left in the existing condition after the PD is moved to a new facility. In parallel with the design effort for the new PD facility in a new location, the City must move forward with the design of the rehabilitation of the existing PD/PW building. This design effort should be preceded by a programming effort to determine the most appropriate reuse of the existing PD portion of the building, potential expansion of the existing facility for high priority City uses and updated programming for the current Public Works spaces. There is a wide array of potential City programs that could be accommodated by an upgraded building. Addition of workforce housing and/or co-location of PW and Planning to create a one stop permitting center are but just a few examples of current City needs that could be considered in the programming effort.

A summary of the Condition Assessment is included as **Attachment #1**

### **Space Programming**

The Police Department also needs substantial additional space to meet the programmatic needs of a modern, small community police force that were identified in Indigo's Programmatic analysis. The Police programmatic analysis is also in final draft form, pending guidance from the City Council. The report includes limited programmatic review of the Public Works programs. However, a summary of Police programmatic needs is included as **Attachment #2**.

Indigo's Police Department Draft Program Narrative indicates the need for a significantly larger Police Station with increased parking, citing a minimum need for a 15,900 square foot facility on 2/3 of an acre, with a beneficial need (or "want") for an 18,500 square foot

facility on 1-acre site. The construction cost for either a new or remodeled and expanded facility is likely to cost in the range of \$19.0 to \$22.2 million.

The Program is based on Indigo's experience and familiarity with best practices in Police Department functional requirements and design standards. Indigo also interviewed individuals that currently work in the Department or support the functions of the Department.

### **New Police Facility Options**

There are four potential options for moving forward with development of a new Police Facility but only 3 would yield an adequate facility.

1. **New facility on new site**- Build an entirely new Police Station on a new site. Police and Public Works remain in existing quarters until completion of the new Station. After the Police move, existing buildings are remodeled for use by Public Works and/or other City departments or for mixed use to maintain housing unit goals. This option provides the most expeditious route to a new police facility.

2. **Rehabilitated and expanded building on current site and move PW to a new site** - The existing PD portion of the site is too small to support the required Police program in a new police station that will serve the community for the next 50 years and Public Works. In this option, the existing Police Building would be renovated and expanded with an addition over the Garage. PD and PW would move to temporary housing until construction is complete.

a. Programmatically, the Police would ultimately take possession of the existing Public Works spaces, including the basement level of the Police Building, the parking level of the Garage, and the Corporation Yard.

b. This option would require an addition over the Garage to provide sufficient space for the PD. The detailed programming and design of this space will be explored in Task 3 of this study if this option were to be selected. Indigo assumes a 9,000 square foot, 1-story frame structure with a simple mansard frame roof as the basis for preliminary analysis of this addition. The Structural Condition Assessment has determined that with some modifications, the existing PW Garage can successfully support it. This space would be vital to the success of this option to allow for a design that meets the minimum programmatic needs for a modern Police facility serving Carmel-by-the-Sea's residents, its daytime workforce, and its tourists.

c. Public Works would move their operations to a new site yet to be determined and at a cost to be determined. This option would require swing space for the PD during construction. The delivery of the new PD facility would be delayed until the construction and occupancy of the new PW facility. These delays in providing an adequate PD facility and swing space costs led the committee to dismiss this option.

3. **Rehabilitated and expanded building on site without PW displacement** -Indigo and the Police Chief have evaluated the scope of the required Police functions and programs that would fit on the existing site without displacing Public Works. Critical space short falls would include the size of internal spaces for various functions, requirement to dual-purpose spaces, the lack of onsite secure Police vehicle storage and parking, secure prisoner transfer implications, EV charging, and resilience improvements. This option would envision refurbishing the existing Police Building and building an expansion with the addition located over the Garage. Police and Public Works would move to temporary housing during construction. The cost and exact location of this swing space is yet to be determined.

Programmatically, Police would continue to share the existing Public Works spaces, including the basement level of the Police Building, the parking level of the Garage, and the Corporation Yard.

The construction of an addition over the Garage is feasible but would still provide insufficient space for a modern PD facility for a community the size of Carmel.

### **THE AD HOC COMMITTEE DISMISSED THIS OPTION AS IT WOULD STILL LEAVE THE POLICE IN AN INADEQUATE FACILITY THE DAY IT OPENED.**

4. **Demolish the existing Police Station and Public Works Garage and build new facilities on the existing site** - PD and PW would move to temporary housing until construction is complete.

This option would be developed so that Police take sole possession of the property. This option would have substantial difficulties in siting and substantial costs associated with creating temporary facilities for the 2 departments.

The location and construction costs of the Public Works facility will have to be developed based on site acquisition costs and the required PW program.

The costs of demolishing the existing buildings have not been determined.

## **THE AD HOC COMMITTEE DISMISSED THIS OPTION DUE TO RESULTING DELAY IN PROVIDING ADEQUATE SPACE FOR THE PD, THE SITE ACQUISITION COSTS, COST OF SWING SPACE FOR PD AND PW, AND DEMOLITION COST UNKNOWNNS**

### **Potential Sites**

Within the City limits, there are only three (3) sites that are currently owned by the City and large enough to be considered as potential sites for the Police project. Each of the sites have strengths and weaknesses that should be considered as part of the Council decision making. The sites are the current shared site of the PD/PW complex, the Sunset Center north parking lot, and the Vista Lobos parking lot/park site.

The Sunset Center and Vista Lobos site are currently identified as potential opportunity housing development sites in the draft Housing Element. The concept designs that will be developed during the next phase of the PD building project should consider the potential for mixed use at the two sites selected for development consideration by the Council. The design requirement will be to not negatively impact the overall dwelling unit count addressed in the Housing Element.

A chart highlighting the pros and cons of each of these sites is included in **Attachment #3**.

### **Existing Facility Requirements and Options**

While the primary focus and recommendations from the Committee deal with the creation of an adequate long-term home for the Police Department, we must also make some critical investments in the existing structure now, to rectify critical issues identified during the building assessment process. An example of a project recently completed was the installation of new electrical panels in the PW garage because of the ongoing moisture problem when it rains. The widespread roof leaks over the PW garage are another example of a deficiency that needs to be addressed very soon.

Because of the current building conditions and building, fire, and other safety code requirements, it follows that once Police have vacated the property, the existing Building and Garage must undergo a major renovation for Public Works and other potential occupants. Portions of Public Works may need to move to temporary housing until construction is complete. The cost of this swing space has not been calculated.

There are substantial renovations that will be required in the building to make it acceptable for long term Public Works and/or any other civic use. The cost estimates above do not include any unique programmatic cost that might be required to support a new occupancy. Leaving the building in a vacant as-is condition after the Police move into a new facility is not a viable option.

How these longer-term renovations are defined and scheduled will be impacted by the future city functions that are ultimately planned for the building. A programming effort to define the future functional needs of Public Works must be undertaken very soon to determine the total project costs for the building systems renovation and any new or updated program spaces.

In addition to the PW programming and planning effort described above, the City must undertake a planning process to determine the highest and best use for the renovated and potentially expanded portion of the building that was previously occupied by the Police Department.

Potential uses that might be considered as examples could be workforce housing, colocation of Planning and Public Works, a permit center, etc. The uses selected by the City will drive the ultimate building program which will impact how the current facility is renovated, repaired and potentially expanded. All the above will drive the ultimate costs.

The cost and schedule for this programming effort will be better defined and returned to the City Council soon.

### **RECOMMENDATIONS/REQUESTED GUIDANCE**

1. Receive the project update from the Ad Hoc Committee and staff, and receive public comments.
2. Adopt a policy decision that the priority is to maximize the programmatic capability of the Police Department to meet current and future community needs.
3. Direct staff to initiate the design process for constructing a new Police Station at Vista Lobos as the best-located, City-owned parcel that has sufficient size to accommodate the Police functional program to take the City through the next 50 years.
4. Direct staff to initiate the programing and design process for the total rehabilitation and potential expansion of the current PD/PW building. Develop the planning process that would assist in determining best City uses, programming needs of those uses, design parameters and rehabilitation strateav for the building.

5. Direct staff to initiate development of a financing strategy to fund a potential total project of \$30+ million.

#### **FISCAL IMPACT:**

The City Council appropriated \$3,239,000 in Fiscal Year 2023/24 for this Capital Improvement Project. The current unencumbered balance is approximately \$2,600,000.

The current professional services agreements for project management (4Leaf) and condition assessment/space programming (Indigo) will need to be amended based on the increase of the required project scope to meet operational requirements, address deferred maintenance, and code upgrades required for continued occupancy of the building complex and potential mixed-use occupancy of the selected sites. Other expenses to date included renovation of the Dispatch room, electrical repairs, and interim security upgrades.

The next phase of the project that follows will be based on City Council guidance and will provide a more precise cost for the design effort, environmental review and attendant cost estimating for the construction phases of the project.

#### **PRIOR CITY COUNCIL ACTION:**

The Council has been dealing with this project since 2017. At the December 2022 meeting, the City Council appointed the Ad Hoc Committee of Mayor Potter and Councilmember Baron to develop a set of recommendations on the way forward.

In June 2023, Council approved a Professional Services Agreement with Indigo Architects to assess the current building condition, develop the recommended program for a new Police facility, and develop concept designs for 2 options.

#### **ATTACHMENTS:**

- Attachment #1 - PD Condition Assessment Summary
- Attachment #2 - Police Program Needs
- Attachment #3 - Land Use Considerations