



# CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA FOREST AND BEACH COMMISSION

Chair David Refuerzo, Commissioners Karen Ferlito,  
Mo Massoudi, and Al Saroyan

All meetings are held in the City Council Chambers  
East Side of Monte Verde Street  
Between Ocean and 7<sup>th</sup> Avenues

**REGULAR MEETING**  
**7/13/2017**  
**TOUR OF INSPECTION 3:00 p.m.**  
**MEETING 3:30 p.m.**

## **CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL**

## **TOUR OF INSPECTION**

- 1. Mission Trail Nature Preserve – Flanders House Tree Removal Project**

## **ROLL CALL**

## **PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

## **INTRODUCTION OF PUBLIC WORKS STAFF**

Robert Harary – Director of Public Works

**PUBLIC APPEARANCES** Members of the public are entitled to speak on matters of municipal concern not on the agenda during Public Appearances. Each person's comments shall be limited to 3 minutes, or as otherwise established by the Commission. Matters not appearing on Commission's agenda will not receive action at this meeting but may be referred to staff for a future meeting. Persons are not required to give their names, but it is helpful for speakers to state their names so that they may be identified in the minutes of the meeting.

## **ANNOUNCEMENTS**

- A. Announcements from Chair and Commissioners**

**CONSENT AGENDA** Items on the consent agenda are routine in nature and do not require discussion or independent action. Members of the Commission or the public may ask that any items be considered individually for purposes of Commission discussion and/ or for public comment. Unless that is done, one motion may be used to adopt all recommended actions.

- 1. Approval of the minutes for the 06/8/17 regular meeting.**

**ORDERS OF BUSINESS** Orders of Business are agenda items that require Commission discussion, debate, direction to staff, and/or action.

2. Beach fire pilot program update and recommendations to the City Council.
3. Report from the 2017 Arbor Day event committee.
4. Report on tree inventory software.
5. Receive the City Forester's Report
  - a. June tree data
  - b. Parks activities
  - c. Beach activities
  - d. Other items of interest to the Commission

## **FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

## **ADJOURNMENT**

This agenda was posted at City Hall located on Monte Verde Street between Ocean and 7<sup>th</sup> Avenues, Harrison Memorial Library located on the NE corner of Ocean Avenue and Lincoln Street, and the Carmel-by-the-Sea Post Office located on 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue between Dolores Street and San Carlos Street, and the City's webpage <http://www.ci.carmel.ca.us/carmel/> on 7/7/2017 in accordance with the applicable legal requirements.



Matt Feisthamel, Assistant City Forester

## **SUPPLEMENTAL MATERIAL RECEIVED AFTER THE POSTING OF THE AGENDA**

Any supplemental writings or documents distributed to a majority of the Community Activities and Cultural Commission members regarding any item on this agenda, received after the posting of the agenda will be available for public review in the Public Works Department Office located on the east side of Junipero Avenue between Fourth and Fifth Avenues during normal business hours.

## **SPECIAL NOTICES TO PUBLIC**

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact the City Clerk's Office at 831-620-2007 at least 48 hours prior to the meeting to ensure that reasonable arrangements can be made to provide accessibility to the meeting (28CFR 35.102-35.104 ADA Title II).

**CHALLENGING DECISIONS OF CITY ENTITIES** The time limit within which to commence any lawsuit or legal challenge to any quasi-adjudicative decision made by the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea is governed by Section 1094.6 of the Code of Civil Procedure, unless a shorter limitation period is specified by any other provision, including without limitation Government Code section 65009 applicable to many land use and zoning decisions, Government Code section 66499.37 applicable to the Subdivision Map Act, and Public Resources Code section 21167 applicable to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). Under Section 1094.6, any lawsuit or legal challenge to any quasi-adjudicative decision made by the City must be filed no later than the 90th day following the date on which such decision becomes final. Any lawsuit or legal challenge, which is not filed within that 90-day period, will be barred. Government Code section 65009 and 66499.37, and Public Resources Code section 21167, impose shorter limitations periods and requirements, including timely service in addition to filing. If a person wishes to challenge the above actions in court, they may be limited to raising only those issues they or someone else raised at the meeting described in this notice, or in written correspondence delivered to the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea, at or prior to the meeting. In addition, judicial challenge may be limited or barred where the interested party has not sought and exhausted all available administrative remedies.

The next regular meeting is August 10, 2017

Tour of Inspection – as required

3:30 p.m. – Regular Agenda

**CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA  
FOREST AND BEACH COMMISSION - MINUTES  
REGULAR MEETING  
THURSDAY, JUNE 8, 2017**

**CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL**

Chair Refuerzo called the meeting to order at 3:32 PM.

COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT:     David Refuerzo, Chair  
  Stephanie Locke, Vice-chair  
  Karen Ferlito  
  Mo Massoudi

COMMISSION MEMBERS ABSENT:     Al Saroyan

STAFF PRESENT:                         Matt Feisthamel, Assistant City Forester  
  Leslie Fenton, Executive Assistant

STAFF ABSENT:                         Mike Branson, City Forester

**PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

Members of the audience joined the Commission in the Pledge of Allegiance.

**INTRODUCTION OF PUBLIC WORKS STAFF**

Assistant City Forester Matt Feisthamel introduced Maintenance Worker/Coastal Gardener Mike Tope.

**APPEARANCES**

None

**ANNOUNCEMENTS**

A.       Announcements from Chair and Commissioners

Commissioner Locke announced that this would be her last Forest & Beach Commission meeting as she was appointed to the Planning Commission. She enjoyed her experience on the Commission this past year.

Commissioner Ferlito announced that the Friends of Mission Trail Nature Preserve will hold a weed pull this week from 9:30-noon, please call to find out the meeting place.

Chair Refuerzo announced that the CRA would hold its monthly beach clean-up on Saturday, June 17<sup>th</sup>.

## CONSENT AGENDA

1. Consideration of the Minutes for the May 11, 2017 Regular Meeting.

Commissioner LOCKE moved to approve the minutes for the May 11, 2017 Regular Meeting, seconded by Commissioner FERLITO and carried by the following roll call vote:

AYES: Ferlito, Massoudi, Locke, Refuerzo  
NOES: None  
ABSTAIN: None  
ABSENT: Saroyan

## ORDERS OF BUSINESS

2. Report from the 2017 Arbor Day event committee.

Assistant City Forester Matt Feisthamel announced that he had called local nurseries to find what trees would be available for a 1 gallon tree give away and the committee is still working on ideas.

Commissioner Massoudi announced that a meeting was being scheduled with all those involved to discuss and plan the event and once that is completed they will present to the Commission.

Commissioner Ferlito announced that she would like to see a “visual” spruce up of an area similar to last year’s First Murphy House project. Would also like a tour of the area being considered at Forest Hill Park to be added as a tour on a future agenda.

3. Report on options for tree inventory data collection.

Assistant City Forester Matt Feisthamel announced that a software program has been leased for review. Would like to find a product that integrates with current tree survey; looking into using current IWork software; would like a program that shows trends of tree care, replacement trees, tracking for 5-year requirement and plotting of the downtown area.

4. City Forester’s Report

- a. May Tree Data

- \* stepped up removal and grinding with contract tree service companies
- \* 13 dead trees to be removed starting Monday by WCA
- \* 2 lower/upper planted in May; 2 at E/s San Carlos bt. 10<sup>th</sup> & 11<sup>th</sup>
- \* John Ley tree watering contract to completion
- \* PG&E donating 100 trees
- \* Commission Ferlito remarked that the downtown tree squares are looking uncared for and wondered when the Anderson memorial trees would be planted at Forest Theater.

- b. Parks Activities

- \* The pond at Devendorf Park was leaking, being repaired this month

- \* Mission Trail Nature Preserve – next phase of evasive removal will take place near the Flanders Mansion, removing the Eucalyptus, will add tour of area on a future agenda
- \* Commissioner Ferlito thanked Rob Culver for clearing up the area around a bench and adding trashcans; the Doolittle trail is disappearing due to weeds and poison oak; bicycles still going off trail

c. Beach Activities

- \* 3 fire pits have been installed starting at 8<sup>th</sup> and going south
- \* Forest & Beach Commission will be asked for input on pilot program
- \* Still using checklist and cleaning pits everyday
- \* Still finding fires outside provided devices
- \* Illegal cutting are at 8<sup>th</sup> Avenue cleaned up
- \* 3 new trees planted near 13<sup>th</sup> are now dead

d. Other Items of Interest to the Commission

- \* Carmel Walks hiking trails brochure released
- \* New Public Works Director Bob Harary starts June 19, 2017
- \* Chair Refuerzo and Commissioner Locke met with the Commission’s Council Liaison Carrie Theis prior to the meeting
- \* Public Works has installed the dry-weather diversion pieces to the storm drains
- \* Letter to landscapers will be included in business license renewals
- \* Status of overgrowth and weeds at Carmel Resort Inn and Normandy Inn

**FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

- \* Scenic pathway
- \* Forest Hill Park tour
- \* Mission Trail Nature Preserve tour
- \* Beach Fire pilot update and discussion

**ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further business to come before the Commission, the meeting was adjourned at 4:49 pm.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Leslie Fenton, Executive Assistant

ATTEST:

\_\_\_\_\_  
David Refuerzo, Chair



# CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA

Forest and Beach Commission

Staff Report

July 13, 2017  
Orders

**TO:** Forest and Beach Commissioners  
**FROM:** Mike Branson, City Forester  
**SUBJECT:** Beach fire pilot program update and recommendations to the City Council

## RECOMMENDATION

Discuss the beach fire pilot program and provide recommendations on any changes to the City Council.

## BACKGROUND / SUMMARY

The City of Carmel initiated a pilot program for management of fires on Carmel Beach in the spring of 2016. The three year program is intended to restrict the number of wood fires on the beach and not allow any fires directly on the sand. The following are the core requirements for having beach fires:

- Wood fires only allowed in City provided fire pits seven days a week.
- Wood fires must be 75 feet away from the base of the beach bluffs and a minimum of 200 feet apart.
- A maximum of 12 wood fire pits can be placed between Eighth and the south end of the beach.
- Only burn clean firewood – no charcoal briquettes, other wood debris or trash.
- An unlimited number of propane fires allowed but must be 25 feet away from the base of the beach bluffs.
- All fires must be south of Eighth Avenue.
- Fires only allowed between 4:00 p.m. and 10:00 p.m.
- Fires pits are available on a first come, first serve basis; communal sharing is recommended.
- No reservations except with a special event permit.

### 2016 Season

During the 2016 beach fire pilot program the City first installed two fires pits on July 7th, 2016. Two additional fire pits (total of 4) were installed on July 26th, 2016.

For the 2016 season temporary laminated paper signs were placed at all beach access points to provide visitors the pertinent fire rules in place at any given time.

The City received a letter from the Monterey Bay Air Resources District on July 28, 2016. The letter informed the City the fires constituted a public nuisance because of the poor air quality from the nearby Soberanes Fire. The fire program was suspended at this time.

On September 6, 2016, the Monterey Bay Air Resources District lifted the no-burn order. The City installed 2 more fire devices (total of 6) on September 8, 2016.

On November 2, 2016 the Public Works staff removed all six wood fire devices off the beach for the winter season.

## **2017 Season**

As Carmel Beach recovered from heavy winter scouring of the beach area, one fire pit was placed at Eighth Avenue in Mid-May. As the beach continued to recover and the available sand area grew, two more pits were placed between Tenth and Eleventh Avenues in late May. Six more pits were placed from Tenth to Thirteenth Avenues in early June for a total of nine City provided wood fire pits as of July 1, 2017.

The City installed new, metal beach fire rule signs at all beach access points for the 2017 season. These signs can be modified if there are changes to the fire rules. The City web site is also a resource for the current beach rules.

## **Experiences and Issues**

Fires on Carmel Beach continue to very popular with beach visitors – locals and tourists. Staff receive several phone calls a day asking for fire information. Currently City staff are responsible for the weekday cleaning and monitoring of the City fire pits as well as cleaning up any illegal fires along the entire beach. Some of the issues faced by Public Works staff are:

- Trash discarded into and trash burned in the fire pits.
- Filling the fire pits with sand either to extinguish a fire or creates a flat surface for building a fire.
- Moving the fire pits from their approved location.
- Burying the lids in the sand.
- Excess amounts of water dumped on the fires.
- Illegal fires on the sand in both the allowed fire area and other areas of Carmel Beach.
- Burning driftwood, charcoal briquettes, and commercial fire logs.
- Periodic high tides reaching the fire pits.

Staff will provide a short Powerpoint presentation on some of these issues at the meeting.

## **Discussion Items**

The Forest and Beach Commission has been asked to provide comments and recommendations to the City Council regarding any changes to the pilot program. The Council is scheduled to receive a report on the pilot program in September and may make adjustment to the program for the 2018 season.

The Commission should review and discuss the core requirements of the pilot program and forward any suggested modifications to the City Council for their consideration. Additionally, suggestions and recommendation on other elements of the fire program such as enforcement, signage, public outreach, cleanup, user surveys, fire pit design, etc. should also be forwarded to the City Council.

## **ATTACHMENT**

1. N/A



# CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA

Forest and Beach Commission

Staff Report

July 13, 2017  
Orders

**TO:** Forest and Beach Commissioners  
**FROM:** Mike Branson, City Forester  
**SUBJECT:** Arbor Day program for 2017

## RECOMMENDATION

Discuss options for an Arbor Day event.

## BACKGROUND / SUMMARY

Chair Refuerzo appointed Commissioners Massoudi and Saroyan to an ad hoc committee to work with staff on the 2017 Arbor Day program. Arbor Day updates will be a regular agenda item for the entire Commission to provide input on the recommendations from the ad hoc committee.

An outline of the latest committee discussions are attached for review and comment by the Commission.

The City of Carmel does not have an officially designated "Arbor Day". A day to recognize and promote the value of trees to the community fulfills a duty and responsibility of the Forest and Beach Commission, as well as, meeting one of the requirements for designation as a Tree City USA.

## ATTACHMENT

1. Ad hoc Arbor Day Committee proposed outline for a 2017 event.



## **City of Carmel by-the-Sea Arbor Day Event Ad-Hoc Committee Meeting June 28th, 2017.**

Mo Massoudi, Mike Branson and Matt Feisthamel met at Forest Hill Park at 3:30PM on June 28th to discuss plans for the upcoming Arbor Day event celebration. During the meeting they discussed the following items:

### **Time and Date:**

The proposed event date is planned for September or October of 2017, the exact day of the event is to be discussed and selected by the F&B Commission. The date should not conflict with any other ongoing or pre-scheduled local events. The proposed time is from 10:00AM to 1:00PM.

### **Arbor Day Theme:**

The committee suggested inviting and coordinating with the Friends of Carmel Forest group, the group may become a co-sponsor for the Arbor Day event. We also suggested inviting the Mayor, City Council and business members to the event. The committee suggested contacting the Principals of Carmel River School and Carmel Middle School for the potential participation of the students.

### **Planting Trees:**

Within Forest Hill Park, many trees have been removed throughout the years, it is the plan of the Arbor Day event to replace some of the trees that have been lost. The committee suggested planting native shrubs, oak trees and pine trees. The exact number of trees and shrubs to be planted at the event can be discussed with the commission. It was noted high voltage power lines occur in the park and tall trees should not be planted under the lines.

The City can provide wood chips, amended soil and planting tools for the event. It might be helpful to have some of the planting holes dug by City staff before the event date. The public will be invited to participate in the planting.

### **Music:**

The committee suggested having a live band play during the event. Mike and Mo have some band contacts and they will report back to the F&B Commission. If a band cannot be scheduled, the City has a sound system that can be used.

### **Advertisement:**

The City of Carmel by-the-Sea will post the Arbor Day event on the City website. It was also suggested to place an ad in the Carmel Pine Cone newspaper. Another idea is to create a City Carmel by-the-Sea Arbor Day event poster and distribute it to various merchants in town.

**Food:**

The committee suggested catering food to draw the public to this event. Mo suggested bringing in a food truck to the event to serve people, the food truck option will require some more research to see if it is cost effective or allowed within City regulations.

**Setup:**

The City will provide shovels, rakes, mulch, wood chips and the shrubs/trees. The City can also help with the set up the tables, table cloths, chairs and trash cans. The volunteers at the event can help with the cleanup and the planting of the trees.

City Trees Removed (upper/lower)	JUNE 17(15/2)	YTD 108(99/9)	2016 143	City Trees Planted (upper/lower)	JUNE 0(0/0)	YTD 20(9/11)	2016 46
----------------------------------	------------------	------------------	-------------	----------------------------------	----------------	-----------------	------------

w/ Lincoln bet. 9th & 10th							
s/ Vista bet. Junipero & Mission							
s/ 6th bet. Santa Rita & Santa Fe							
s/ 1st bet. Guadalupe & Santa Rita							
e/ Monterey bet. 1st & 2nd							
n/ 1st bet. Lobos & Carpenter							
e/ Guadalupe bet. 1st & 2nd							
w/ Torres bet. 3rd & 4th							
Vista Lobos							
e/ Junipero bet. 3rd & 4th							
w/ Torres bet. 4th & 5th							
n/ 12th bet. Junipero & Mission							
w/ Camino del Monte bet. Junipero & 2nd							
s/ Ocean bet. Santa Rita & Santa Fe							

Private Removal Permits (upper/lower)	12(5/8)	58(34/36)	117	Private Planting Requirements	5(2/3)	22(7/15)	68
w/ Lincoln bet. 4th & 5th							
ne/ Lincoln & 11th							
ne/ Mission & Vista							
ne/ Monte Verde & 13th							
e/ Santa Rita bet. 5th & 6th							
nw/ Mission & Santa Lucia							
e/ San Carlos bet. 1st & 2nd							
e/ Forest bet. 8th & Mt. View							
s/ Pine Ridge bet. Forest & end							
s/ 12th bet. Casanova and Camino Real							
e/ Lopez bet. 2nd & 4th							
w/ Carpenter bet. City limit & 1st							

Construction Permits (remove/prune)	5(4/1)	24	Construction Planting Requirements	1	3	13
se/ Lincoln & 10th						
9 Carmel Way						

Private Pruning Permits	3	15	24	Trees Under Care	78
w/ Lincoln bet. 4th & 5th					
e/ Santa Rita bet. 5th & 6th					
e/ Scenic bet. Ocean & 8th					

City Pruning by contractors	2	10	22	Construction Final	Planted
level I - total tree	4	34	5		
level II - hazard /emergency	2	14	0		
level III - specific purpose					

Trees planted / removed 2013 to date **299 / 609 (48%)**

City Trees Watered	260	City Trees Irrigated	23
City watered	260	City irrigated	23