



CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA FOREST AND BEACH COMMISSION

Chair David Refuerzo, Vice Chair Stephanie Locke,
Commissioners Karen Ferlito, Mo Massoudi,
and Al Saroyan

All meetings are held in the City Council Chambers
East Side of Monte Verde Street
Between Ocean and 7th Avenues

REGULAR MEETING
2/16/2017
MEETING 3:30 p.m.

CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

INTRODUCTION OF PUBLIC WORKS STAFF

Mike Tope – Coastal Gardener/Maintenance Worker
Kimberly Moscato – Forest Care Worker

PUBLIC APPEARANCES Members of the public are entitled to speak on matters of municipal concern not on the agenda during Public Appearances. Each person's comments shall be limited to three minutes, or as otherwise established by the Commission. Matters not appearing on Commission's agenda will not receive action at this meeting but may be referred to staff for a future meeting. Persons are not required to give their names, but it is helpful for speakers to state their names so that they may be identified in the minutes of the meeting.

ANNOUNCEMENTS

A. Announcements from Chair and Commissioners

CONSENT AGENDA Items on the consent agenda are routine in nature and do not require discussion or independent action. Members of the Commission or the public may ask that any items be considered individually for purposes of Commission discussion and/ or for public comment. Unless that is done, one motion may be used to adopt all recommended actions.

1. Approval of the minutes for the 1/12/17 regular meeting.

ORDERS OF BUSINESS Orders of Business are agenda items that require Commission discussion, debate, direction to staff, and/or action.

2. Recognition of the Friends of Carmel Forest Centennial Tree planting program.
3. Discussion of an Arbor Day event for 2017.

4. Receive the City Forester's Report
 - a. January tree data
 - b. Parks activities
 - c. Beach activities
 - d. Storm report
 - e. Tree tagging report
 - f. Future agenda items

5. Receive the Public Works Director's Report
 - a. Updates on City Council items
 - b. Other items of interest to the Commission

FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

ADJOURNMENT

This agenda was posted at City Hall located on Monte Verde Street between Ocean and 7th Avenues, Harrison Memorial Library located on the NE corner of Ocean Avenue and Lincoln Street, and the Carmel-by-the-Sea Post Office located on 5th Avenue between Dolores Street and San Carlos Street, and the City's webpage <http://www.ci.carmel.ca.us/carmel/> on 2/10/2017 in accordance with the applicable legal requirements.



Michael Branson, City Forester

SUPPLEMENTAL MATERIAL RECEIVED AFTER THE POSTING OF THE AGENDA

Any supplemental writings or documents distributed to a majority of the Community Activities and Cultural Commission members regarding any item on this agenda, received after the posting of the agenda will be available for public review in the Public Works Department Office located on the east side of Junipero Avenue between Fourth and Fifth Avenues during normal business hours.

SPECIAL NOTICES TO PUBLIC

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact the City Clerk's Office at 831-620-2007 at least 48 hours prior to the meeting to ensure that reasonable arrangements can be made to provide accessibility to the meeting (28CFR 35.102-35.104 ADA Title II).

CHALLENGING DECISIONS OF CITY ENTITIES The time limit within which to commence any lawsuit or legal challenge to any quasi-adjudicative decision made by the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea is governed by Section 1094.6 of the Code of Civil Procedure, unless a shorter limitation period is specified by any other provision, including without limitation Government Code section 65009 applicable to many land use and zoning decisions, Government Code section 66499.37 applicable to the Subdivision Map Act, and Public Resources Code section 21167 applicable to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). Under Section 1094.6, any lawsuit or legal challenge to any quasi-adjudicative decision made by the City must be filed no later than the 90th day following the date on which such decision becomes final. Any lawsuit or legal challenge, which is not filed within that 90-day period, will be barred. Government Code section 65009 and 66499.37, and Public Resources Code section 21167, impose shorter limitations periods and requirements, including timely service in addition to filing. If a person wishes to challenge the above actions in court, they may be limited to raising only those issues they or someone else raised at the meeting described in this notice, or in written correspondence delivered to the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea, at or prior to the meeting. In addition, judicial challenge may be limited or barred where the interested party has not sought and exhausted all available administrative remedies.

The next regular meeting is March 9, 2017
Tour of Inspection – as required
3:30 p.m. – Regular Agenda

**CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA
FOREST AND BEACH COMMISSION - MINUTES
REGULAR MEETING
THURSDAY, JANUARY 12, 2017**

CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT: Karen Ferlito – Chair
David Refuerzo – Vice Chair
Mo Massoudi
Stephanie Locke
Al Saroyan

STAFF PRESENT: Rob Mullane, AICP, Public Works Director
Mike Branson, City Forester
Matt Feisthamel, Assistant City Forester
Yvette Oblander, Commission Secretary/Admin Coordinator
Kelly Green – Tree Care Specialist
Michael Feher – Maintenance Worker

TOUR OF INSPECTION

1. Tour of Mt. View entrance to Mission Trail Nature Preserve – Mt. View & Crespi Avenues.

ROLL CALL

Chair Ferlito called the meeting to order at 3:30 PM

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Members of the audience participated in the Pledge of Allegiance

EXTRAORDINARY BUSINESS

A. Election of Chair and Vice Chair

Chair Ferlito called for the nominations of Chair. Commissioner Locke moved to **nominate Commissioner Refuerzo for Chair of the Commission**, seconded by Commissioner Saroyan. No other nominations were received. The motion was carried by the following vote:

AYES: Locke, Massoudi, Saroyan, Ferlito, Refuerzo
NOES: None
ABSTAIN: None
ABSENT: None

Chair Ferlito called for the nominations of Vice Chair. Commissioner Refuerzo moved to **nominate Commissioner Locke for Vice Chair of the Commission**, seconded by Commissioner Massoudi. No other nominations were received. The motion was **carried** by the following vote:

AYES: Refuerzo, Massoudi, Saroyan, Ferlito, Locke
NOES: None
ABSTAIN: None
Absent: None

B. The introduction of City Council Liaison to the Forest and Beach Commission Carrie This. Mr. Mullane explained how the City Council is interested in enhancing the communication between the Council and the Commissions and Boards. Council has appointed Mayor Pro tem Carrie Thies as the Forest and Beach Commission liaison. This will give her the ability to sit down with the Chair and Vice Chair to enhance the communication between the Council and the Commission.

PUBLIC APPEARANCES

1. Raymie Allard updated the Commission on the Friends of Carmel Forest, Centennial tree planting. They planted 78 trees and will continue the campaign. There are still trees available to be sponsored.
2. Jeff Baron spoke regarding the stormwater quality testing. He suggested that a presentation be put together so that the citizens of Carmel can have a better understanding of how we are doing with our water quality.

ANNOUNCEMENTS

Commissioner Locke thanked the staff for cleaning up all of the low hanging branches on San Carlos.

CONSENT AGENDA

1. Consideration of the minutes from November 10, 2016, regular meeting. Vice Chair Locke moved to approve, seconded by Commissioner Saroyan.

AYES: Ferlito, Locke, Saroyan, Refuerzo
NOES: None
ABSTAIN: Massoudi
ABSENT: None

2. Approval of the 2017 regular meeting calendar
Chair Refuerzo asked that the February 9, 2017 meeting be moved to February 16, 2017. Commissioner Ferlito motioned to approve 2017 Regular Meeting Calendar, with the exception of moving the February Regular Meeting from the 9th to the 16th. Seconded by Commissioner Saroyan. The calendar was approved by consensus.

INTRODUCTION OF PUBLIC WORKS STAFF

Mr. Mullane introduced the following Public Works and Forestry staff to the Commissioners:
Kelley Green – Tree Care Specialist

ORDERS OF BUSINESS

3. Receive and review the new tree protection sheet that is provided to anyone getting a building permit.

The Forest and Beach Commission had a joint meeting with the Planning Commission to go over the protection requirements and responsibilities. Staff developed a new tree protection notice that is provided to anyone receiving a building permit.

Speaker 1: Raymie Allard, expressed concern, if the protection would also protect the roots of the tree.

The Commission is supportive of the new tree protection notification process.

4. Receive the City Foresters Report

a. **November and December tree data**

City trees removed – 10/November -10/December

Private removal Permits– 4/November – 10 December

Construction Permits – 1/November – 1/December

Private Pruning Permits – 2/November – 1/December

City Pruning by contractor – 3/November – 0/December

b. **Parks Activities**

Planted the Holiday Tree in Devendorf Park in November.

Improvements to Forest Hill Park playground, the new wood border was put in, and wood chips are blown in on the playground.

c. **Beach activities**

Getting ready to start the dead tree removal in the North Dunes. Fencing/cabling was installed to protect the habitat. Some of the stairways were closed because of high tide and surf.

d. **Future agenda items**

- Commissioner Ferlito asked about getting an update the first flush, and when to expect it. The new Environmental Compliance Manager will take the lead in that role, and hopes to have that person starting in March.
- Commissioner Ferlito asked when to expect the Brown Act Training with City Attorney.

5. Receive the Public Directors Report

a. **Updates from the City Council Meeting**

- Planning Commission Meeting was yesterday, the two Coastal Development Projects were approved, The Scenic Landscape Pathway Improvements and San Antonio to 4th Street project.
- At the next City Council Meeting on February 7, 2017, the Mountain View Entrance Project video will be presented and a ribbon cutting date should be determined.
- The Environmental Compliance Manager recruitment is going well, with a second round of interviews a couple of weeks ago.
- The Human Resources Manager, Maxine Gullo will be getting some additional assistance, to help with recruiting for various vacant positions within the City.

- For the storm response over the weekend and after hours, first responders are doing a great job handling things. Public Works did have some staff come in over the weekend to deal with some storm issues.

ADJOURNMENT

Chair Refuerzo adjourned the meeting at 5:23 p.m.



CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA

Forest and Beach Commission Staff Report

January 12, 2017
Orders

TO: Forest and Beach Commissioners

FROM: Mike Branson, City Forester

SUBJECT: Recognition and appreciation to the Friends of Carmel Forest for their Centennial Tree planting program.

RECOMMENDATION

The Forest and Beach Commission wishes to thank the Friends of Carmel Forest (FOCF) for their centennial tree planting program and their continuing efforts to enhance Carmel's urban forest, provide education opportunities to the public, and support of the City's forestry programs.

BACKGROUND / SUMMARY

In celebration of Carmel-by-the-Sea's 2016 centennial year, the FOCF, a City of Carmel support group, initiated a commemorative tree planting program. Through this program the FOCF have planted 77 new trees to help sustain the urban forest of Carmel into the future. Persons wishing to honor a loved one or commemorate a special event provided donations at various levels for the FOCF to plant a tree in a selected location. Although the centennial year is behind us the FOCF is continuing to plant trees in the city. The FOCF also held two tree walks in 2016 to educate the public on the various tree species in Carmel and their importance to the culture and environment of the community.

ATTACHMENT

1. Click here to enter text.



CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA

Forest and Beach Commission Staff Report

January 12, 2017
Orders

TO: Forest and Beach Commissioners
FROM: Mike Branson, City Forester
SUBJECT: Arbor Day program for 2017

RECOMMENDATION

Discuss options for an Arbor Day event and have the Chair appoint an ad hoc committee.

BACKGROUND / SUMMARY

The City of Carmel does not have an officially designated "Arbor Day". A day to recognize and promote the value of trees to the community fulfills a duty and responsibility of the Forest and Beach Commission, as well as, meeting one of the requirements for designation as a Tree City USA.

Please bring any ideas for discussion and consideration for an Arbor Day event in 2017. For the past few years the Commission Chair has appointed an ad hoc committee to work with staff to plan the event. This has been a successful method of developing and implementing the Arbor Day event. Volunteers for the ad hoc committee are appreciated.

Comments and suggestions from Commissioners and attendees regarding prior events include:

- Attract a diverse audience
- Consider a Saturday program
- Possible children's program
- Interactive or hands-on program
- Tree care program with an environmental component
- Have water and refreshments

Previous "Arbor Day" events:

2005 - Tree seedling giveaway in December at Devendorf Park.

2006, 2007, and 2008 - Guest speaker presentations on tree care, pruning, and landscaping were co-sponsored with the Friends of Carmel Forest at Sunset Center.

2009 - Tree care workshop in February at Vista Lobos. Presentations were made by the City Forester and arborist Peter Quintanilla from the Friends of Carmel Forest.

2010 – Trees and Art event at the Sunset Center, Carpenter Hall. Guest speakers on the Carmel forest management plan and the use of local trees in the art history of Carmel and the Monterey Peninsula. The event also featured a juried art and photo competition. This event was co-sponsored with the Friends of Carmel Forest.

2011 – Tree forum featuring local architect Paul Byrne speaking on sustainable building, Monterey Pine Watch presented an overview of their new book on the Monterey pine forest. Sustainable Carmel introduced their organization and their plans for the future, and the city forester spoke about Carmel's tree rules.

2012 – Japanese cherry tree planting ceremony in Devendorf Park. This was attended by the Mayor, City Council members, Forest and Beach Commissioners and representatives of the Japanese embassy in San Francisco.

2013 – Tree care workshop was presented by the City Forester at the Vista Lobos community room.

2014 - The Carmel Forest and Beach Commission presented an educational program, "Trees at Risk – Managing Your Trees in Times of Drought," to provide guidance to homeowners on tree and landscape care under drought conditions. Carmel City Forester Mike Branson spoke on the condition of Carmel's urban forest and on management practices to help trees through drought conditions. Independent scientist and environmental consultant Lee Klinger spoke on soil health and on ways to nurture the soil to benefit trees and plants. Landscape architect Paul Deering discussed plant selection and landscape watering strategies and priorities. He also led a walking tour at the end of the program to show examples of landscape practices and choices in nearby homes.

2015 & 2016 – The Forest and Beach Commission organized Arbor Day events to renovate the grounds of First Murphy Park. Work entailed planting new trees and shrubs, installing new drip irrigation and spreading mulch over the planter beds.

The Four Standards for Tree City USA Recognition

To qualify as a Tree City USA community, a town or city must meet four standards established by The Arbor Day Foundation and the National Association of State Foresters.

These standards were established to ensure that every qualifying community would have a viable tree management plan and program.

It is important to note that they were also designed so that no community would be excluded because of size.

1) A Tree Board or Department

Someone must be legally responsible for the care and management of the community's trees. This may be a professional forester or arborist, an entire forestry department, or a volunteer tree board. Often, both a professional staff and advisory tree board are present, which is a good goal for most communities.

A tree board, or commission, is a group of concerned volunteer citizens charged by ordinance with developing and administering a comprehensive tree management program. Balanced, broad-based community involvement is encouraged. Boards function best if not composed entirely of tree-related professionals such as forestry professors, nursery operators, arborists, etc. Fresh ideas and different perspectives are added by citizens with an interest in trees that is entirely avocational. Limited, staggered terms of service will prevent stagnation or burnout, while at the same time assuring continuity.

2) A Tree Care Ordinance

The tree ordinance must designate the establishment of a tree board or forestry department and give this body the responsibility for writing and implementing an annual community forestry work plan. Beyond that, the ordinance should be flexible enough to fit the needs and circumstances of the particular community.

A tree ordinance provides an opportunity to set good policy and back it with the force of law when necessary. Ideally, it will provide clear guidance for planting, maintaining and removing trees from streets, parks and other public places. For tips and a checklist of important items to consider in writing or improving a tree ordinance, see Bulletin No. 9.

3) A Community Forestry Program with an Annual Budget of at Least \$2 Per Capita

Evidence is required that the community has established a community forestry program that is supported by an annual budget of at least \$2 per capita. At first, this may seem like an impossible barrier to some communities. However, a little investigation usually reveals that more than this amount is already being spent by the municipality on its trees. If not, this may signal serious neglect that will cost far more in the long run. In such a case, working toward Tree City USA recognition can be used to re-examine the community's budget priorities and re-direct funds to properly care for its tree resource before it is too late.

Ideally, this standard will be met by focusing funding on an annual work plan developed after an inventory is completed and a report is approved by the city council. Such a plan will address species diversity, planting needs, hazardous trees, insect and disease problems and a pattern of regular care such as pruning and watering.

4) An Arbor Day Observance and Proclamation

This is the least challenging and probably the most enjoyable standard to accomplish. An Arbor Day celebration can be simple and brief or an all-day or all-week observation. It can be a simple tree planting event or an award ceremony that honors leading tree planters. For children, Arbor Day may be their only exposure to the green world or a springboard to discussions about the complex issue of environmental quality.

The benefits of Arbor Day go far beyond the shade and beauty of new trees for the next generation. Arbor Day is a golden opportunity for publicity and to educate homeowners about proper tree care. Utility companies can join in to promote planting small trees beneath power lines or being careful when digging. Smokey Bear's fire prevention messages can be worked into the event, as can conservation education about soil erosion or the need to protect wildlife habitat.

Still another way to develop Arbor Day is to link it with a tree-related festival. Some that are currently celebrated include dogwood festivals, locust blossom festivals and Macon, Georgia's Cherry Blossom Festival that annually brings more than \$4.25 million into the local economy. In meeting the four standards, help is available! The [urban and community forestry coordinator](#) in your state forester's office will be happy to work with communities in taking these first steps toward better community forestry.

ATTACHMENT

1. N/A

JANUARY 2017

City Trees Removed (upper/lower)			City Trees Planted (upper/lower)			JAN.	YTD	2016	2016
						7(6/1)	7	143	46

w/ Monterey bet. 1st & 2nd	17" oak								
v/ Santa Fe bet. 1st & 2nd	33" Monterey pine								
/ 1st bet Dolores & Lincoln	15" Monterey pine								
/ Mission bet. Vista & 1st	10" Monterey pine								
/ 3rd bet. Dolores & Lincoln	12" Italian stone pine								
/ 6th bet. Carpenter & Guadalupe	33" Monterey pine								
v/ Carpenter bet. 4th & 5th	12" Monterey pine								

w/ San Carlos bet 3rd & 4th										5 gal. Monterey pine - r	
Private Removal Permits (upper/lower)										Private Planting Requirements	
/ Dolores bet. 11th & 12th	14", 20" black acacias		9(7/3)	9(7/3)	117	4(1/3)	4(1/3)		68		
/ Lincoln bet. 3rd & 4th	48" Monterey pine										
/ Lincoln bet. 3rd & 4th	30" Monterey pine										
/ Dolores bet Vista & 1st	34" Monterey pine										
e Camino Real & 9th	35" Monterey pine										
/ 11th bet. Torres and MTNP	20" oak										
/ Guadalupe bet. 5th & 6th	18" Monterey pine										
/ Junipero bet. Alta & Vista	20" Monterey cypress										
/ San Antonio bet 12th & 13th	36" Monterey pine										

Construction Permits (remove/prune)		Construction Planting Requirements			
		0	0	24	13

Private Pruning Permits		Trees Under Care			
/ Lincoln bet. 3rd & 4th	4> 4" oak limbs	1	1	24	

by Pruning by contractors	Planted				
vel I - total tree	0	0	22		
vel II - hazard / emergency	18	18	5		
vel III - specific purpose	0	0	0		

Trees planted / removed 2013 to date		278 / 525 (53%)			
--------------------------------------	--	-----------------	--	--	--

FOCF trees planted	77			
City watered	244			
City irrigated	22			