

**CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA
FOREST AND BEACH COMMISSION
MEETING AGENDA
Thursday, October 8, 2015
Tour of Inspection – 2:30 p.m.
Regular Meeting – 3:30 p.m.**

City Hall, Council Chambers
East side of Monte Verde St. between Ocean & 7th Avenues
Carmel, California

CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

COMMISSION MEMBERS: DAVID REFUERZO – CHAIR
 KAREN FERLITO – VICE CHAIR
 KATHY BANG
 JEFF BARON
 MAGGIE EATON

TOUR OF INSPECTION

Shortly after 2:30 p.m., the Commission will leave the Council Chambers for an on-site Tour of Inspection of all properties listed on this agenda. The Tour may also include projects previously approved by the City and not on this agenda. Prior to the beginning of the Tour of Inspection, the Commission may eliminate one or more on-site visits. The public is welcome to follow the Commission on its tour of the determined sites. The Commission will return to the Council Chambers at **3:30 p.m.** or as soon thereafter as possible.

1. Scenic Rd. and 10th Ave. – review of shoreline repair plan
2. Devendorf Park – holiday tree replacement

ROLL CALL

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

INTRODUCTION OF NEW COMMISSIONER MAGGIE EATON AND PUBLIC WORKS STAFF

APPEARANCES

Thank you for attending the meeting. Anyone wishing to address the Commission on matters not on the agenda, but within the jurisdiction of the Commission, may do so now. Please state the matter on which you wish to speak. Matters not appearing on the Commission's agenda will not receive action at this meeting but may be referred to staff for a future meeting. Presentations will be limited to three minutes, or as established by the Commission. Persons are not required to give their name or address, but it is helpful for speakers to state their name in order that the Secretary may identify them.

CONSENT AGENDA

1. Consideration of the Minutes for the September 10, 2015 Regular Meeting

ORDERS OF BUSINESS

2. Report on the Status of Implementation of the Shoreline Assessment Report
3. Commission Recommendations on Projects to Celebrate Carmel's Centennial
4. Verbal Update from the 2015 Arbor Day ad hoc Committee
5. Verbal Update on the Status of the Beach Fire Management

REPORTS FROM STAFF AND COMMISSIONERS

6. City Forester's Report
 - A. September tree data
 - B. Parks activities
 - C. Beach activities
 - D. FOCF tree survey
 - E. Future agenda items
7. Public Works Director's Report
 - A. Updates on City Council and Planning Commission Items
 - B. Other Items of Interest to the Commission

ADJOURNMENT

Any writings or documents provided to a majority of the Forest and Beach Commission regarding any item on this agenda will be made available for public inspection in the Planning and Building Department located at City Hall, on Monte Verde between Ocean and 7th Avenues during normal business hours.

The next regular meeting of the Forest and Beach Commission will be:

November 12, 2015
Tour of Inspection – as required
3:30 p.m. - Regular Agenda

The City of Carmel-by-the-Sea does not discriminate against persons with disabilities. The City of Carmel-by-the-Sea Telecommunication's Device for the Deaf /Speech Impaired (TDD) number is 1-800-735-2929.

AFFIDAVIT OF POSTING

I, Mike Branson, City Forester, for the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea, DO HEREBY CERTIFY, under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California, that the foregoing notice was posted at the Carmel-by-the-Sea City Hall bulletin board, at the Harrison Memorial Library on Ocean and Lincoln Avenues, the Carmel Post Office, and distributed to members of the media on October 2, 2015.

Dated this 2nd day of October 2015, at the hour of 4:00 p.m.



Mike Branson
City Forester

**CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA
FOREST AND BEACH COMMISSION MINUTES
Thursday, September 10, 2015**

CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL: 3:00 p.m.

COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT: Kathy Bang
Jeff Baron
Michael Carter
Karen Ferlito, Vice Chair
David Refuerzo, Chair

STAFF PRESENT: Rob Mullane, AICP, Public Works Director
Mike Branson, City Forester
Yvette Oblander, Commission Secretary
Rob Culver, Active Public Works Superintendent
Cleve Waters, Building Maintenance Specialist
Paul Tomasi, Police Commander

TOUR OF INSPECTION

The Forest and Beach Commission toured the following site: NW corner of San Antonio Avenue and Ocean Avenue – review of fourth coming eucalyptus tree trimming work.

ROLL CALL

All present

PLEDGE OF ALLIGIANCE

Chair Refuerzo led the Commission in the Pledge of Allegiance

APPERANCES

Rob Mullane, Public Works Director, introduced two city staff members to the Commission:
Rob Culver, Acting Public Works Superintendent
Cleve Waters, Building Maintenance Specialist

CONSENT AGENDA

1. Consideration of the Minutes for the July 9, 2015 Regular Meeting and the July 21, 2015 and August 5, 2015 Special Meetings

Commissioner Bang moved **to approve the minutes for these meetings**, second by Chair Refuerzo, and **carried** by the following vote:

AYES: Bang, Baron, Carter, Ferlito, Refuerzo
NOES: None
ABSTAIN: None

ABSENT: None

Staff notes that for the approval of the minutes for the July 21, 2015 special meeting, Commissioner Baron noted he should abstain and therefore the vote for that component of the minutes approval is as follows

AYES: Bang, Carter, Ferlito, Refuerzo
NOES: None
ABSTAIN: Baron
ABSENT: None

ORDERS OF BUSINESS

The Commission agreed to review Item #4, first followed by Items #3 and #2, to accommodate police Department Staff.

4. Review an Update on the Status of the Beach Fire Project and Review of the Beach Fire Activity Data.

Mr. Mullane noted that the City Council on September 1, 2015, extended the moratorium to ten months and fifteen days, for a total moratorium duration of 12 months. This is an interim moratorium, and at the September 1, 2015 City Council meeting, the Council also clarified which special events would be excluded for the moratorium.

Mr. Mullane went over a summary of the air quality data, collected by Air Pollution Control District staff. He noted that additional information on air quality and the effect of recent wildfires in Northern California was provided by APCD staff; this additional information was distributed as a supplemental transmittal.

Mr. Mullane noted that this is not a decision item; it is just an update.

Paul Tomasi, Police Commander went over the number of fires and violations during Car Week.

He noted that patrolling on the beach with a private security company continues with extra security on weekends and a security officer who patrols overnight. He further noted that comments from the public and community have been positive.

He further noted that Police staff and security officers are making it clear that there are no fires on the beach during the weekend and clarifying that a few events have permits that has been approved.

3. Review of the Carmel Emergency Operations Plan Annex P – Carmel (City) Beach, Closure, Evacuation, and Tsunami Plan.

Commander Tomasi noted that playbooks are available for different Emergency Operations within the Police Department, in the event of an emergency.

An updated version of Annex P was distributed to the Commission as a supplemental transmittal.

Chair Refuerzo opened the item to public comment at 4:02 p.m. There were no speakers, and public comment was closed at 4:02 p.m.

2. Report from the 2015 Arbor Day ad hoc Committee

Mike Branson, City Forester, noted that this is not an action item, just an informational item.

Regarding the Arbor Day Event, Mr. Branson drew up a rendition of the plan to simplify what they will do in the park, with drought tolerant plans, and planting of new trees, including trees honoring Steve and Barbara Brooks.

Council has approved up to \$6000.00 in funds for Murphy Park improvements, which will include actions planned for the Arbor Day Event, and other infrastructure improvements that the City is looking to complete.

The Commission selected October 24, 2015 for the Arbor Day event, from 9:00 a.m. to 1:00 p.m.

Chair Refuerzo opened the item to public comment at 4:18 p.m.

Speaker 1: Stephanie Locke from the Monterey Peninsula Water Management District noted that the District has money for the community to go towards water efficient fixtures and a demonstration garden. The District also supports the Arbor Day Project.

REPORTS FROM STAFF AND COMMISSIONERS

5. City Forester's Report

A. July and August Tree Data

Mr. Branson noted that:

- 110 trees removed for August.
- No trees were planted in the month of July
- There will be a more detailed report of the follow up on the permits for people who have applied for planting trees
- The community should see much better compliance once more staffing is in place.

B. Parks Activities

Mr. Branson reported on the removal of some of the big leaf maples and some stumps

C. Beach Activities

Mr. Branson noted that beach charcoal cleanup will go to every other week, as that activity typically starts to wind down this time of year.

D. Ocean Ave. Eucalyptus Work

Mr. Branson discussed the large Heritage eucalyptus at the corner of Ocean and San Antonio Ave. A consulting arborist evaluated the tree. The recommendation is to trim the tree to reduce the risk of losing the tree. The intent is to keep the tree and prevent a tree failure.

E. Future Agenda items

Mr. Branson noted the future agenda items will include:

The Centennial and what the Commission would like to do
Prioritization of shoreline assessment following activities

6. Public Works Director's Report

A. Updates on City Council and Planning Commission Items

Mr. Mullane thanked the Commissioner Carter for his service. The Commission echoed this thanks.

- The extension on the beach fire moratorium
- He also noted the Council had an update to the Cities housing element
- The Council authorization of a grant submittal for the Monterey Regional Parks District for improvements to the playground area of Forest Hill's Park.
- The Council's authorization of funds for the first Murphy House Arbor Day endeavor
- That Chair Refuerzo reapplied and was reappointed to the Commission that Maggie Eaton was appointed to the Commission and will replace Commissioner Carter
- Two contracts were approved: Sunset Center retaining wall repairs and the Carpenter Street drainage project

B. Other Items of Interest to the Commission

Mr. Mullane recognized Yvette Oblander, Commission Secretary, who is a new full time Administrative Coordinator in the Public Works Department. He also noted that:

- The Public Works Office is now open to the public.
- Tree permits will eventually be moved over to this office
- The Public Works Office is undergoing improvements to modernize the office
- Staff will be working with City Clerk Ashlee Wright to organize the Department's files and to purge some old files.
- There are ongoing recruitments for the Public Works Department
- There is a new packet format for the Commission
- New software is being brought on board for the Department, to help with tracking customer service requests.
- Public Works staff will be getting iPhones. This will assist to ensure that the staff is better prepared for the El Nino rain season

Mr. Mullane also noted that he is looking forward to working with this Commission

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business to come before the Commission, the meeting was adjourned at 5:34 p.m.

SIGNED:

David Refuerzo, Chair

ATTEST:

Yvette Oblander, Commission Secretary



CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA
Forest and Beach Commission Report

October 2, 2015

To: Chair Refuerzo and Forest & Beach Commissioners
From: Mike Branson, City Forester
Subject: Status Report on the Shoreline Assessment Follow-up Items

SUMMARY:

As a follow up to David Shonman's shoreline assessment of Carmel Beach and the Scenic Rd. Pathway, a team of City staff have been assigned to facilitate implementation of some of the short term public safety repairs along the waterfront. In conjunction with the staff efforts, several consultants and experts are being retained to evaluate and provide recommendations for items such as revetments, seawalls, and landscaping.

Mr. Shonman has prepared a status report on the team efforts to date which follows as Attachment 1.

ATTACHMENT:

1. Status Report Memo from David Shonman

DATE: **October 2, 2015**

TO: **Rob Mullane**, Director Public Works

FROM: **David Shonman**

SUBJECT: **Status Report - Shoreline Assessment Follow-up Items**

The City's Shoreline Assessment Follow-Up Team ("Team") has reviewed and refined the actions recommended in the Fall 2014 Carmel Shoreline Assessment.

Recommendations were prioritized, based on such factors as

- Current maintenance or public safety issues along the shoreline area
- El Niño conditions predicted to occur during late 2015/early 2016;
- Issues in need of more detailed study, planning and/or permitting.

Below is an update of the status of these issues:

1. Shoreline Landscape Barriers (SLBs)

The Fall 2014 Shoreline Assessment and subsequent communications recommended the replacement of several sections of damaged and unstable wooden shoreline barrier rails and posts, as well as the installation of additional barriers. In response to a number of factors, including:

- the possibility that El Niño-related erosion might affect some sites slated for new SLBs;
- questions about the optimal material, design and location of new SLBs;
- the possibility that additional or re-located SLBs might necessitate local or state permits.

The Team has recommended a series of interim measures:

- repair damaged posts and rails, where possible;
- remove SLB sections that are irreparable and replace with rod & cable barriers;
- install limited segments of new rod & cable barriers where necessary to provide interim bluff protection.



Staff has already assessed and marked SLB sections in need of these interim measures. Rods and cable have been ordered. City staff estimates that these measures will be completed by mid-November.

2. Storm Water Outfalls: 4th Ave. & 12th Ave. Cove

Questions about the condition of these two outfalls were raised in the Fall 2014 Shoreline Assessment. These structures have been inspected by City Engineer Sherman Low, structural engineer Frank Lee, and very recently by engineering geologist Greg Easton (whose report will be forthcoming). All three agree that portions of the 4th Ave. outfall show numerous signs of cracking. In addition, the south-side wing wall and the deflection slab at the base of the outfall's discharge end have been undercut by erosion. Based on the reports of Low and Lee, as well as preliminary discussions with Easton, the outfall does not yet appear to be in danger of failure, but the City should consider replacement of this structure as a future capital improvement project.

The 12th Ave. cove outfall has also been inspected by engineers Low, Lee and Easton. The outfall itself is in good condition, but storm water discharges during early-season rains (when the beach sand level is still high) create a scour pit that can pose a hazard to people walking on the beach. Several long-term options have been discussed, but each will require more detailed study (including observations during upcoming storms). The Team is recommending that conditions at the base of the outfall be monitored during the storm season, and when the scour pit appears at the outfall base, it be cordoned-off to protect beach users. The City will work with engineering geologist Easton to develop a long-term recommendation.

3. Retaining Wall: 12th Ave. (south side)

The Fall 2014 Shoreline Assessment noted that the retaining wall perched atop a long sandstone outcrop along the south side of the 12th Ave. point was being undercut by erosion. This wall has been inspected by engineers Low, Lee and Easton. More detailed study – including an analysis of the rate of sandstone erosion – is needed before a long-term solution can be developed. But during the month of October, Public Works plans to patch the eroded spaces between the wall's footing and the underlying sandstone (as has been done in the past). The City will work with engineering geologist Easton to develop a long-term recommendation.

**4. Scenic Pathway Landscape
and
5. Bluff-Cuts**

Landscape Architect Scott Hall is being retained by the City to help re-vitalize the landscape along Carmel's shoreline bluffs and the Scenic Pathway. As with other shoreline-related issues, the landscape tasks will be prioritized, based primarily on the predicted El Niño conditions. Some elements of the landscape plans will also be affected by any relocation of Shoreline Landscape Barriers. Hall will be also be contributing to the Team's multi-faceted initiatives to address the numerous shoreline bluff-cuts. This approach will involve elements such as re-vegetation, barriers, signage, enforcement, etc.

6. Pathway Resurfacing

The Team is recommending that immediate steps be taken to address low spots and other drainage issues along the decomposed granite (DG) Scenic Road Pathway. The areas of repair and re-grading to be addressed this fall would be limited to sites with especially poor drainage, and where low-spots contribute to drainage-induced erosion of the coastal bluff. Public Works staff will spot-patch several poorly drained Pathway sites between 8th and 12th Ave.s during October. The City has received cost estimates from outside contractors to fill and resurface a site between 10th & 11th Avenues where a dip in the Pathway grade causes rainwater to drain over the slope edge, resulting in bluff erosion. The timing of this repair will depend on contractor availability. The City will consider re-surfacing the entire Pathway after the winter storm season in concert with the longer-term landscape initiatives discussed above.

7. Sand Redistribution

In late May, Public Works carried out limited redistribution of sand to cover exposed revetment rocks at several sites along Carmel Beach. To help prepare for the predicted El Niño conditions, the Team is in the process of retaining a contractor to conduct additional sand redistribution to shore up sites that are most vulnerable to erosion; these include:

- Del Mar slopes
- Base of the 8th Ave. stairway
- Equipment/Emergency sand ramp (between 8th & 9th Ave.s)
- Base of the 9th Ave. stairway

City staff estimates that these measures will be completed by the end of October.

8. Overgrown Vegetation

All vegetation encroaching on benches, information signs, and the discharge ends of storm water outfalls has been cleared or trimmed.

9. Shoreline Trees

In preparation for the upcoming storm season, the City Forester has determined which trees will need to be pruned; this work will be completed by mid-November.

10. Storm-Season Protocols

The Carmel Police Dept. is updating its emergency operations protocols. Members of the Follow-Up Team will be working with CPD staff to ensure that responses to storm/tide-related public safety issues are coordinated between CPD and Public Works. Special attention is being paid to ensuring that there is a clear delineation of who has responsibility for monitoring, repairs, closures, etc.,

11. Signage (Interim)

The City currently has temporary signs regarding the interim regulations for beach fires. These signs consist of laminated paper; higher-quality temporary signs are recommended as the rainy season approaches. There is also a need to install additional signage to discourage bluff cuts. Such additional signage may also be needed for the rod and cable segments, including in areas where erosion results in public safety issues. Public Works staff will work with Planning staff to develop the specifics of the proposed signage.



CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA
Forest and Beach Commission Report
October 2, 2015

To: Chair Refuerzo and Forest & Beach Commissioners
From: Mike Branson, City Forester
Subject: Commission Recommendations on Projects to Celebrate Carmel's Centennial

SUMMARY:

During the June 2015 regular meeting of the Commission, several possibilities for projects for the City's 2016 Centennial were proposed. These included:

- 1) Plant 100 trees in 100 days culminating with a significant tree planting on the day of the centennial celebration
 - a. Significant tree could be a replanting of Carmel's Christmas Tree
- 2) Select four areas along the Scenic Beach Pathway for re-landscaping
 - a. Some monies could come from the City and the rest through fundraising or sponsoring like that seen on freeways and highways.
- 3) Re-landscape Upper Ocean right of way on both north and south especially in the area near Santa Fe/Santa Rita where the eucalyptus trees were removed 3 years ago
- 4) City-sponsored beach cleanup in July 2016 which would take the place of the CRA beach cleanup that month
 - a. Larger than normal CRA cleanup with BBQ, etc
 - b. Enlist Save our Shores and Sustainable Carmel as partners

This list was presented at a July 2015 workshop held by the 2016 Centennial Committee.

As 2016 draws closer, the Carmel-by-the-Sea Centennial Committee is requesting an update on any confirmed events and events still in the discussion stage so they can be included in their event calendar (refer to Attachment 1).

The Commission should determine their finalist(s) from the list above, or another valid proposal, for a centennial project. Once a project or projects are chosen, staff recommends appointing an ad hoc committee to develop the details of implementing the project(s).

ATTACHMENT:

1. Correspondence from City's Centennial Committee



Carmel-by-the-Sea Centennial Committee

September 23, 2015

Chair David Refuerzo
Forest & Beach Commission
PO Box 5041
Carmel, CA 93921

Dear Chair Refuerzo,

In July the City Council and the Centennial Committee heard many exiting ideas from local community groups, Boards and Commissions on how they would like to participate in the City's Centennial Celebration in 2016. The January opening ceremonies are fast approaching and we are hopeful that you still have the same enthusiasm to participate.

If your group has finalized details of your event, project, display or idea we would appreciate you completing the enclosed information form, if you have more than one event please fill out a form for each event. Once we receive your form the information will be added to the Centennial Celebration Calendar available on the Carmel Centennial website, www.carmelcentennial.com.

If your ideas are still in the discussion stage or being finalized we would appreciate you completing the information sheet when you know the details so they can be added to the calendar.

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me at 831-620-2007 or lsfenton@ci.carmel.ca.us.

Once again, the City Council and the Centennial Committee appreciate your eagerness to be part of the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea's 100th birthday celebration.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads 'Leslie Fenton'.

Leslie Fenton
Executive Assistant

Carmel-by-the-Sea Centennial - 1916-2016
Event Information

Organization: _____

Event Title: _____

Event Description: _____

Event Date: _____

Event Location: _____

Contact Name: _____

Contact E-mail: _____

Contact Phone: _____

Contact Address: _____

Please return this completed form to:

City of Carmel-by-the-Sea
Att: Leslie Fenton
PO Box CC
Carmel, CA 93921

or

lsfenton@ci.carmel.ca.us

Plant a tree for Arbor Day!

Join the Carmel-by-the-Sea Forest and Beach Commission in commemorating Arbor Day 2015

Help us revitalize First Murphy Park. We'll be planting four new trees (including two to commemorate Steve and Barbara Brooks) as well as improving the park by installing new drip irrigation, planting drought tolerant shrubs and spreading new bark chips.

The morning will also feature presentations on composting and sustainable landscape products (courtesy of the Monterey Regional Waste Management District) and drought tolerant landscaping and irrigation solutions (courtesy of the Monterey Peninsula Water Management District)

Where: First Murphy Park, at the corner of Lincoln and 6th (roughly behind the Harrison Memorial Library)

When: Saturday, October 24th, 9am to Noon

Coffee, pastries, water, tools, and good cheer provided! Volunteers should bring work gloves and sturdy shoes.



Please contact us to let us know that you're coming! You can contact Assistant City Forester Matt Feisthamel at mfeisthamel@ci.carmel.ca.us, or call (831) 620-2070. We'll be sure to have enough tools and coffee for everyone.

SEPTEMBER 2015

		SEPT.	YTD	2014			SEPT.	YTD	2014
City Trees Removed (upper/lower)		6(4/2)	116(88/28)	142	City Trees Planted (upper/lower)		7(7/0)	86(43/43)	39
e/ Santa Fe bet. 2nd & 3rd	24" Monterey pine				w/ San Carlos bet 7th & 8th	15 gal. Canary Island pine			
nw Lincoln & 6th	20" Ital. Stone Pine , 18" cypress, 2-6" maple				w/ Mission bet. 5th & 6th	15 gal. Canary Island pine			
e/ Carpenter bet 1st & 2nd	38" Monterey pine				w/ Junipero bet. 5th & 6th	1 gal. Monterey pine			
					e/ Junipero bet. 4th & 5th	1 gal. Monterey pine			
					ne Mission & 1st	1 gal. Monterey pine			
					e/ San Carlos bet. Alta & Vista	1 gal. Monterey pine			
					e/ Santa Rita bet. 4th & 5th	1 gal. Monterey pine			
					e/ San Carlos bet. 12th & 13th	5 gal. Monterey pine - r			
					w/Junipero bet. 5th & 6th	5 gal. Monterey pine - r			
					nw Dolores & 8th	15 gal. Ironwood - r			
					w/ Dolores bet. 10th & 11th	5 gal. Monterey pine - r			
r' denotes replacement of a tree that was recently planted and watered - not in monthly total									
Private Removal Permits (upper/lower)		5(3/4)	76(51/52)	114	Private Planting Requirements		3(1/2)	22(17/7)	49
e/ Dolores bet. 13th & Santa Lucia	16" oak				15 gal. lower canopy				
e/ Carpenter bet. 1st & 2nd	18", 12", 10" Monterey pines				5 gal. upper canopy				
se 6th & Santa Rita	8" oak								
e/ Lincoln bet. 4th & 5th	9" oak				15 gal. lower canopy				
e/ Casanova bet. 13th & Santa Lucia	18" oak								
Construction Permits (remove/prune)		1	8(4/12)	15	Construction Planting Requirements		1(2/0)	7(6/10)	9
se Dolores & 11th	8", 3 - 6" oak limbs								
w/ Monte Verde bet 3rd & 4th	22" oak								
sw Lincoln & 3rd	15", 16" Monterey pines				2- 15 gal. upper canopy				
Private Pruning Permits		2	17	20	Trees Under Care				
e/ Monterey bet. 1st & C.L.	5", 6" Monterey pine limbs				City watered	159			
se 12th & San Antonio	12', 8", 6" cypress limbs				City irrigated	12			
w/ San Carlos bet. 11th & 12th	8" pine limb, 4 - 6" cypress limbs				Private watered	4			
City Pruning by contractors					Construction Finals		Planted		
level I - total tree		1	34	227					
level II - hazard /emergency		1	9	24					
level III - specific purpose		0	9	17					
Contracts									