



CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA CLIMATE COMMITTEE

Contact: 831.620.2000 www.ci.carmel.ca.us/carmel

All meetings are held in the City Council Chambers
East Side of Monte Verde Street
Between Ocean and 7th Avenues

REGULAR MEETING Thursday, October 15, 2020

4:00 PM

Governor Newsom's Executive Order N-29-20 has allowed local legislative bodies to hold public meetings via teleconference and to make public meetings accessible telephonically or otherwise electronically to all members of the public seeking to observe and to address the local legislative body. Also, see the Order by the Monterey County Public Health Officer issued March 17, 2020. The health and well-being of our residents is the top priority for the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea. To that end, this meeting will be held via teleconference and web-streamed on the City's website ONLY.

To attend via Teleconference; Dial in number 1 617-675-4444, PIN: 504 937 887 8240#. The public can also email comments to amartelet@ci.carmel.ca.us. Comments must be received 2 hours before the meeting in order to be provided to the committee. Comments received after that time and up to the beginning of the meeting will be added to the agenda and made part of the record.

CALL TO ORDER

PUBLIC APPEARANCES

Members of the public are entitled to speak on matters of municipal concern not on the agenda during Public Appearances. Each person's comments shall be limited to 3 minutes, or as otherwise established by the Committee. Matters not appearing on Committee's agenda will not receive action at this meeting but may be referred to staff for a future meeting. Persons are not required to give their names, but it is helpful for speakers to state their names so that they may be identified in the minutes of the meeting.

COMMITTEE MEMBER ANNOUNCEMENTS

ORDERS OF BUSINESS

Orders of Business are agenda items that require Committee discussion, debate, direction to staff, and/or action.

1. Receive a Presentation from the City of Monterey Fire Department on the Defensible Space Inspection Program and Community Wildfire Resilience
2. Receive a Presentation from the City Forester on Forestry Science and Adapting

Carmel-by-the-Sea's Urban Forest to Climate Change

3. Provide Updates on the Outreach to Community Organizations and Regional Partners Conducted to Date
4. Discuss the Outreach to Schools
5. Review the Format and Content of the Carmel Area Wastewater District's Hazard and Asset Summary Sheet

FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

ADJOURNMENT

This agenda was posted at City Hall located on Monte Verde Street between Ocean and 7th Avenues, Harrison Memorial Library located on the NE corner of Ocean Avenue and Lincoln Street, and the Carmel-by-the-Sea Post Office located on 5th Avenue between Dolores Street and San Carlos Street, and the City's webpage <http://www.ci.carmel.ca.us/carmel/> on in accordance with the applicable legal requirements.

SUPPLEMENTAL MATERIAL RECEIVED AFTER THE POSTING OF THE AGENDA

Any supplemental writings or documents distributed to a majority of the Climate Committee regarding any item on this agenda, received after the posting of the agenda will be available at the Public Works Department located on the east side of Junipero Street between Fourth and Fifth Avenues during normal business hours.

SPECIAL NOTICES TO PUBLIC

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact the City Clerk's Office at 831-620-2000 at least 48 hours prior to the meeting to ensure that reasonable arrangements can be made to provide accessibility to the meeting (28CFR 35.102-35.104 ADA Title II).



CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA

Climate Committee

Staff Report

October 15, 2020
ORDERS OF BUSINESS

TO: Climate Committee Members

SUBMITTED BY: Agnes Martelet, Environmental Compliance Manager

SUBJECT: Provide Updates on the Outreach to Community Organizations and Regional Partners Conducted to Date

RECOMMENDATION:

Each Committee member will provide an update on the outreach to community organizations and regional partners they have conducted over the past month, and any notable feedback they have received.

BACKGROUND/SUMMARY:

On February 20, 2020, the Climate Committee started assembling the list of community organizations and regional partners to engage. Included in this process, the Committee assigned outreach leads for each organization.

At the July 16, 2020 Climate Committee meeting, members agreed to start conducting outreach to community organizations and regional groups about the City's project. The updated outreach list is included in Attachment 1. The tentative Climate Committee presentation schedule is included in Attachment 2.

FISCAL IMPACT:

N/A

ATTACHMENTS:

Attachment 1: Community Organizations and Regional Partners
Attachment 2: Tentative Climate Committee Presentation Schedule

Community Organizations and Regional Partners to Engage
City of Carmel-by-the-Sea Climate Project

October 2020

	ORGANIZATION	Topic (s)	Contact Persons	Committee Lead	Present to	Hear from	Contacted?
Utilities							
1*	<i>Carmel Area Wastewater District</i>	<i>Sewer system Wastewater Treatment Facility</i>	<i>Barbara Buikema, Daryl Lauer</i>	<i>Jeff Baron, Agnes Martelet</i>		X	Y
2	Central Coast Community Energy (was Monterey Bay Community Power)	Energy supply	Dan Bertoldi (dbertoldi@mbcommunitypower.org) J.R. Killigrew (jkilligrew@mbcommunitypower.org)	Evan Kort, Agnes Martelet		X	Y
3	Cal Am	Water supply		Michael LePage		X	
4	Monterey Peninsula Water Management District	Water supply	Stephanie Locke	Michael LePage		X	Y
5	GreenWaste Recovery	Waste management and recycling	Jim Moresco	Carrie Theis, Agnes Martelet			
6	Monterey Regional Waste Management District	Waste management and recycling	Tim Flanagan	Carrie Theis		X	Y
7	PG&E	Energy supply	Gina Arnold Teri Vetere	Carrie Theis, Jeff Baron		X	Y
Professional Organizations							
1	<i>California AIA</i>	<i>Built environment resilience</i>	<i>Libby Barnes</i>	<i>John Hill</i>		X	Y
2	Chamber of Commerce	Local business, tourism	Jenny McMurdo	Carrie Theis	X		Y
3	Monterey County Association of Realtors	Sea Level Rise Wildfire risk	Ben Beasley	Scott Lonergan, LaNette Zimmerman	X		
4	MCCVB	Visitors		Carrie Theis			
5	Visit Carmel	Visitors / local business	Amy Herzog	Carrie Theis			
6	Sunset Center	Resilience	Christine Sandin	LaNette Zimmerman			
Local Community Groups							
1	Carmel Residents Association	Community resilience Climate action	Fred Bologna Nancy Twomey	Jeff Baron	X		

2	Carmel Rotary Club	Community resilience Climate action	Susan Prest	Carrie Theis, Jeff Baron	X		Y
3	Carmel Lions Club	Community resilience Climate action	Heidy Mozingo	Carrie Theis	X		
4	Friends of Carmel Forest	Urban forest	Ramie Allard	Scott Lonergan	X		
5	Friends of MTNP	Wildfire risk Sensitive habitats	Skip Lloyd	Scott Lonergan	X		Y
6	Del Monte Forest Conservancy	Wildfire risk		Scott Lonergan			Y
7	Landwatch	Transportation, housing	Mike DeLapa	Jeff Baron		X	Y
8	Sustainable Carmel	Climate action	Ellen Gannon	Agnes Martelet	X		
9	Church auxiliaries	Community resilience		LaNette Zimmerman			Y
10	Heritage Society	Community resilience	Karl Iverson	Michael LePage			
11	Forest Theater Guild	Community resilience	Steven Moore	LaNette Zimmerman, Carrie Theis			
12	PacRep	Community resilience	Steven Moore	LaNette Zimmerman, Carrie Theis			
13	Carmel Women's Club	Community resilience Climate action	Nancy Twomey	Jeff Baron			
City Departments							
1	Police	Emergency preparedness Transportation	Paul Tomasi	Agnes Martelet			Y
2	Fire	Emergency preparedness	Carmyn Prieu, Sichel Young	John Hill		X	Y
3	Forestry Division (PW)	Urban forest Sensitive habitats	Sara Davis	Agnes Martelet		X	Y
4	Library	Historic events	Katie O'Connell	Evan Kort			Y
City Commissions							
1	Forest & Beach Commission	Sea Level Rise Urban forest Sensitive habitats Climate action		Scott Lonergan	X		
2	Planning Commission	Built environment resilience Climate action		Michael LePage	X		
3	City Traffic Safety Committee	Transportation		Agnes Martelet			Y

Federal / State / Regional Agencies							
1	AMBAG	Climate Action Transportation	Elisabeth Bertrand	Agnes Martelet	X	X	Y
2	USGS	Sea Level Rise	Patrick Barnard	Agnes Martelet	X	X	Y
3	CalFire	Wildfire risk and resilience Urban forest management	John Reynolds	John Hill	X		Y
4	CA Department of Insurance	Wildfire risk / home insurability	Ricardo Laura	John Hill			Y
5	Fire Safe Council for Monterey County	Michael Emmett		John Hill			Y
6	California Coastal Commission	Sea Level Rise		Jeff Baron / Agnes Martelet		X	
7	IRWMP Group	Water supply Watershed / storm water projects		Michael LePage			
8	Monterey County (OES)	Resilience planning	Kelsey Scanlon	Agnes Martelet			Y
9	<i>Monterey County</i>	<i>Sustainability Climate Action</i>	<i>Ashley Paulsworth</i>	<i>Agnes Martelet</i>		X	Y
10	Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary (NOAA)	Marine Sanctuary impacts Carmel Beach	Karen Grimmer	Agnes Martelet			Y
11	Transportation Agency of Monterey County	Transportation		Jeff Baron			
12	MST	Transportation		Jeff Baron		X	
13	US Navy / Coast Guard	Coastal impacts		Carrie Theis			
Educational Groups							
1	Carmel High School Environmental Club	Internships Climate Action partnership / Green Schools	Ellen Gannon	LaNette Zimmerman, Scott Lonergan			
2	Stevenson, York, Santa Catalina	Climate Action partnership / Green Schools		LaNette Zimmerman, Scott Lonergan			
3	Youth Center	Climate Action partnership / Green Schools		LaNette Zimmerman, Scott Lonergan			

4	CSUMB	Internships Climate Action partnership / Green Schools		LaNette Zimmerman, Scott Loneragan			Y
5	MPCC	Internships Climate Action partnership / Green Schools		LaNette Zimmerman, Scott Loneragan			
6	MIISS	Climate Action partnership / Green Schools		LaNette Zimmerman, Scott Loneragan			Y
7	NPS	Climate Action partnership / Green Schools	Ann E. Rondeau (ret.) (pao@nps.edu)	LaNette Zimmerman, Scott Loneragan			
Regional Non-Profit Organizations							
1	Monterey Bay Aquarium	Marine Sanctuary impacts Climate Action Support		Carrie Theis			
2	Ecology Action	Climate Action Support	Kirsten Liske	Agnes Martelet			
Other Stakeholders							
1	Pebble Beach Company	Bluffs / Seawalls / Beach Regional transportation Emergency response		Jeff Baron / Carrie Theis	X		
2	Principals Involved in 1983 response; authors of the CBTS Shoreline Management Plan	Bluffs / Seawalls / Beach	Greg D'Ambrosio (past Assistant City Administrator); David Shonman (Coastal Biologist)	Evan Kort, Scott Loneragan		X	Y
3	Cities with similar challenges (e.g. PG, Monterey, Seaside, Pacifica, Del Mar, Malibu, Dana Point, Imperial Beach)			Jeff Baron / Carrie Theis			

**Grey italics denote presentations that have already occurred*

Climate Committee
Presentation Schedule
10/15/2020

Climate Committee Meeting Date	Presenters
10/15/2020	Sara Davis – Forestry Science and Adapting Carmel’s Urban Forest to Climate Change Monterey Fire – Defensible Space Inspection Program, community resilience to wildfires
11/19/2020	Monterey County Office of Emergency Services (pending confirmation) – Multi-jurisdictional Hazard Mitigation Plan Greg D’Ambrosio, David Shonman – Carmel coastal processes and damage caused by previous storms United States Geological Survey (pending confirmation) – CosMos Modeling of Sea Level Rise and storm impacts on Carmel coast
12/17/2020	Association of Monterey Bay Area Governments (pending confirmation) – results of 2018 greenhouse gas inventory Central Coast Community Energy (was Monterey Bay Community Power, pending confirmation) – Central Coast Community Energy’s climate action efforts and new procurement policy, and how that will affect our Climate Action Plan
1/21/2021	Monterey Regional Waste Management District?
2/18/2021	Monterey Bay Sanctuary?

Not yet on the schedule

- Cal Am / Monterey Peninsula Water Management District
- Monterey Regional Waste Management District
- PG&E
- Landwatch
- California Coastal Commission
- Monterey-Salinas Transit
- Storm Drainage



CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA

Climate Committee

Staff Report

October 15, 2020
ORDERS OF BUSINESS

TO:	Climate Committee Members
SUBMITTED BY:	Agnes Martelet, Environmental Compliance Manager
SUBJECT:	Review the Format and Content of the Carmel Area Wastewater District's Hazard and Asset Summary Sheet

RECOMMENDATION:

Review and Provide Comments on the format and content of the Carmel Area Wastewater District's Hazard and Asset Summary Sheet

BACKGROUND/SUMMARY:

Barbara Buikema, General Manager of the Carmel Area Wastewater District, presented to the Climate Committee on September 17, 2020. A Hazard and Asset Summary Sheet addressing the key points of her presentation is included in Attachment 1 for review and discussion by the Committee.

Questions for the Committee to consider include:

- Does this summary sheet have the correct and complete content?
- Is it in the correct format?
- Who will write summary sheets for each presentation?
- What will the approval process be?

FISCAL IMPACT:

None

ATTACHMENTS:

Attachment 1: Hazard and Asset Summary Sheet for Wastewater Treatment Facility and Associated Underground Infrastructure



CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA

Hazard and Asset Summary Sheet for Wastewater Treatment Facility and Associated Underground Infrastructure

October 15, 2020

TO:	Climate Committee Members
SUBMITTED BY:	Jeff Baron, Councilmember

SUMMARY

Asset: Wastewater treatment facility and associated underground infrastructure (CAWD)

Hazards: Sea level rise, Stronger Storms, More variable rainfall

General Outlook: The Carmel Area Wastewater District treatment facility (and underground infrastructure) will be under increasing environmental pressure as sea level rises and storms (and hence rainfall drainage down the Carmel River watershed) increase in intensity. CAWD's prediction is that the facility will need to be relocated by 2062, which is approximately 40 years in the future.

Long term options for the facility:

1. Retreat up the valley
2. Pump to Monterey One Water

Issues:

- Both projects are expensive, in the neighborhood of \$100,000,000.
- It will take a significant amount of time to make the decision as to which path to take.
- The value (cost) of the current facility (which may have to be abandoned) is approximately \$200,000,000
- The lagoon situation will become increasingly precarious as time passes.
- Do not understand (yet) an overrun scenario if the move is not completed in time

Possible Actions for Final Report

- The committee should recommend that the Carmel City Council pass a resolution on this topic, ensuring that the city monitors the transition towards a relocated plant, and perhaps has formal, written input into this process. The resolution might:
 - Document the asset and the various hazards
 - Assigning staff/council personnel as liaisons to CAWD, with an eye towards resolution of this asset's vulnerability
 - Urging CAWD to take specific actions

ATTACHMENTS

[Click here to enter text.](#)